Report of the Ministerial Committee on Rural Education

A NEW VISION FOR RURAL SCHOOLING

MAY 2005
A new vision for rural schooling

Report of the Ministerial Committee on Rural Education

May 2005

Aloe Ferox

- Aloes grow widely distributed along the eastern parts of South Africa.
- The cut leaf exudes copious thick yellow juice.
- Leaves and roots are used for medicinal purposes.
- Drought resistant.
- Flowers appear from May to August.
- Orange-red flowers.
- Leaves (bitter in taste) and tall stunning spikes of tubular orange-red flowers.
- Single-stemmed aloes with thick rosettes of honey succulent leaves (Isizulu: Mkhohlo; Setswana: Umhlabo).

* Aloe Ferox (single-stemmed aloe with thick rosettes of thorny succulent leaves (bitter in taste) and tall stunning spikes of tubular orange-red flowers.)

Sources: Creative Gardening with Indigenous Plants
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS 1
ACRONYMS 1
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY 2

PART ONE 7
PROCESSES AND PRINCIPLES INFORMING RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE MINISTERIAL COMMITTEE ON RURAL EDUCATION

BACKGROUND AND OVERVIEW 7
PROCESS 8
WHAT IS 'RURAL'? 8
WHAT IS "QUALITY EDUCATION"? 10
A NEW VISION FOR RURAL SCHOOLING 11
Rural Schooling: A special case 12
Principles, values and operational strategies
Current status and challenges

A WAY FORWARD 14

PART TWO
RECOMMENDATIONS

THEME 1 : ERADICATING POVERTY 17
Current status and challenges
Sub theme: Community mobilisation 18
Sub theme: Intersectoral programmes 19
Sub theme: Tackling risks 20

THEME 2 : FUNDING RURAL SCHOOLING 22
Current status and challenges
Sub theme: A development fund for schools in rural areas 23
Sub theme: Different models of schooling 24
Sub theme: Access to school 25
Sub theme: Introducing a more progressive funding approach 25
Sub theme: Ring-fenced funding for creating a rural development task team 26
Sub theme: Costs of transport 26

THEME 3 : THE SIZE AND SHAPE OF EDUCATION IN RURAL AREAS 28
Current status and challenges
Sub theme: Schools in dense settlements: A two-tier system 29
Sub theme: Small schools in dispersed settlements: A three-tier system 29
Sub theme: Can ICT enrich learning? 30
Sub theme: Community learning centres 30

THEME 4 : GOVERNANCE AND MANAGEMENT 32
Current status and challenges
Sub theme: Community learning centres 33
Sub theme: Clarifying roles and responsibilities in districts and schools 34
Sub theme: Strengthening delivery 35
Sub theme: Current status and challenges 36

RECOMMENDATIONS

A NEW VISION FOR RURAL SCHOOLING

WHAT IS "QUALITY EDUCATION"?

RURAL SCHOOLING: A SPECIAL CASE

A WAY FORWARD

OF THE MINISTERIAL COMMITTEE ON RURAL EDUCATION

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

ACRONYMS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Table of Contents
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

1. Departmental support for school managers and teachers
2. Lack of resources and lack of utilization of available resources
3. Conditions of service for teachers

OMISSIONS / AREAS ACCORDED SECONDARY STATUS

SECTION B: ANALYSIS OF SUBMISSIONS

1. Experience and knowledge base from submissions
2. Tensions in the views of respondents

POSSIBILITIES FOR TAKING FORWARD THE WORK OF MCRE

1. Establishing principles
2. Towards strategies
3. Implementing the work of MCRE

EXPERIENCE AND KNOWLEDGE BASE FROM SUBMISSIONS

1. Experience and knowledge base from submissions
2. Tensions in the views of respondents

SECTION B: ANALYSIS OF SUBMISSIONS

1. Omissions / Areas accorded secondary status
2. Conditions of service for teachers
3. Rural and farm schooling at a systemic level

A PERSONAL POSTSCRIPT ARISING FROM THE REVIEW OF SUBMISSIONS

CONCLUSION

REFERENCES
The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

Acronyms

Acronyms will serve as an explanation and apology.

Acknowledgements

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.

The MCRE is grateful to all those who provided the information and insights on which this report has been built. In acknowledging such sources, the committee faced a tension between, on the one hand, the normal requirement that sources are formally acknowledged; on the other hand, there is the possibility that individuals and organisations ‘within’ the formal education system could feel compromised at having particular views attributed to them. The committee’s decision was to cite only submissions that were in the form of academic papers intended for (or already in) the public domain. If we have caused offence by not citing individuals who submitted comments, and who did wish to be named, we hope that our rationale will serve as an explanation and apology.
The intent to form a Ministerial Committee on Rural Education (MCRE) was announced by then Minister of Education, Professor Kader Asmal MP, at the meeting of the Council of Education Ministers on 22 September 2003. The committee was formally established by government gazette on 11 March 2004. From March 2004 to July 2004, the committee met with the Minister, the Council of Education Ministers and the Department of Education (DoE) to continue the process of briefing and discussion designed to sharpen and refine its focus and mode of operation. This process continued after the appointment of Mrs Naledi Grace Pandor MP as Minister of Education in May 2004. By the end of July 2004, a brief for the committee had been determined: to produce a report containing practical recommendations to help the Department of Education (DoE) and the Provincial Education Departments (PEDs) develop an integrated multi-faceted plan of action for improving the quality of schooling in rural areas. The committee met for a total of fourteen days. It made two calls for submissions: a general call to the public, and invitations for comment to 200 organisations and institutions. Many of the submissions and interviews made the point that post-1994 schooling policies are driven by the demographic profile, settlement patterns and the resource base of urban areas. This has exacerbated the difficulties inherited in 1994, resulting in a situation where the provision of schooling in rural areas remains in crisis. The state’s commitment to social justice in all matters and especially to universal access to education, written into the Constitution, remains unfulfilled for large numbers of children, youths and adults living in rural areas. Qualitative and quantitative information consistently reveals the daily risks faced by these communities and shows that education is not fulfilling its mandate of promoting well-being.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

...How does education serve rural development when much of its attention is that it provides the

...In order to achieve this, the committee approached rurality in a way that balances quantitative and qualitative features. The need for a focused definition useful for the kind of information gathering, monitoring and evaluation necessary for a state driven intervention programme for rural schooling led the committee to adopt the quantitative definition of 'rural' used by Statistics South Africa (SSA) in the 2001 Census. This is a spatial definition identifying Traditional Authority (TA) areas (primarily 'community owned' land in the erstwhile 'homelands') and formal rural areas (primarily commercial farms in erstwhile 'white' areas of South Africa). It provides a useful working definition for education planning as the availability of resources in these areas, both in terms of human and infrastructure, varies markedly from those available in urban areas.

In view of these complexities, the committee approached the problems of quality improvement as follows:

- Investing in human rights and social justice as preconditions for improving living conditions;
- Making sure that critical infrastructures, such as schools, hospitals and clinics, are well-maintained and that people have access to them;
- Promoting well-being, health and safety;
- Addressing gender inequalities;
- Developing partnerships with civil society organizations;
- Investing in human rights and social justice as prerequisites for improving learning conditions;
- Ensuring that rural schools provide safe and healthy environments for students;
- Promoting rural development and schooling in a way that is sensitive to the needs of rural communities.

Although a number of tensions between different approaches to improving quality are apparent in the submissions, a number of tensions between different approaches to improving quality are apparent in the submissions. Effective interventions to improve the quality of rural schooling must aim at:

- Investing in human rights and social justice as prerequisites for improving living conditions;
- Making sure that critical infrastructures, such as schools, hospitals and clinics, are well-maintained and that people have access to them;
- Promoting well-being, health and safety;
- Addressing gender inequalities;
- Developing partnerships with civil society organizations;
- Investing in human rights and social justice as prerequisites for improving learning conditions;
- Ensuring that rural schools provide safe and healthy environments for students;
- Promoting rural development and schooling in a way that is sensitive to the needs of rural communities.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

1. Primary responsibility for education provision obviously rests with the state and the Department of Education in South Africa, according to the 2005 (COSS) report for every day knowledge. This is also important in the light of Curriculum 2005 (C2005) respect for everyday knowledge. These principles are supplemented by the following principles and development can be built.

2. Interrelated, community-based education provision is the goal. Schools should be focused in the social fabric of the communities in which they are situated.

3. Equality of inputs in the form of material provision does not in itself mean the needs for redress.

4. Equality of inputs in the form of material provision does not allow for equal treatment in learning outcomes.

5. Integrated, community-based education provision is the goal. Schools should be focused in the social fabric of the communities in which they are situated.

6. Even though rural schooling is severely under-resourced, strategies should avoid deprioritizing rural education in terms of quantity and quality

7. A coalition of respect for the inherent worth, capabilities and assets of rural people is a respect schooling and development can be built.

Improving the quality of rural schooling is a complex project, and the primary responsibility for this project rests with government. To maximize the value of this report for ‘delivery’ or ‘implementation’ purposes, the committee has focused on practical recommendations designed specifically for consideration by the DoE and the PEDS. The values and concepts informing the committee’s orientation draw, broadly, on South Africa’s democracy and human rights tradition together with a pragmatic recognition of the importance of understanding how power operates in rural communities. The importance of giving substance to South Africa’s constitutional commitment to the right to education is balanced by a recognition of the importance of evaluating needs of particular people in specific contexts with their reservoirs of indigenous knowledge, capabilities and character. This is expressed in the following principles:

1. Section 29 of the Constitution declares: “Everyone has a right to basic education”, and the preamble to the SA Schools Act states: “This country requires a national system for schools which will redress past injustices in education provision”. Constitutional entitlements therefore have to be met by provision of quality basic education for all sectors of society.

2. Primary responsibility for education provision obviously rests with the state and the Department of Education in particular. However, strategies and initiatives are meaningless if education is public; however, they exist in terms of models may be in tension with building systems that could coalesce with local contexts, experiences and resources.

3. Democratic principles of education provision are central to the development of education in South Africa. The role of government is to provide the forum for debate of educational policies, priorities and programmes. The expected outcomes in terms of models may be in tension with building systems that could coalesce with local contexts, experiences and resources.

4. Democratic principles of education provision are central to the development of education in South Africa. The role of government is to provide the forum for debate of educational policies, priorities and programmes. The expected outcomes in terms of models may be in tension with building systems that could coalesce with local contexts, experiences and resources.

5. Integrated, community-based education provision is the goal. Schools should be focused in the social fabric of the communities in which they are situated.

6. Even though rural schooling is severely under-resourced, strategies should avoid deprioritizing rural education in terms of quantity and quality

7. A coalition of respect for the inherent worth, capabilities and assets of rural people is a respect schooling and development can be built.

Improving the quality of rural schooling is a complex project, and the primary responsibility for this project rests with government. To maximize the value of this report for ‘delivery’ or ‘implementation’ purposes, the committee has focused on practical recommendations designed specifically for consideration by the DoE and the PEDS. The values and concepts informing the committee’s orientation draw, broadly, on South Africa’s democracy and human rights tradition together with a pragmatic recognition of the importance of understanding how power operates in rural communities. The importance of giving substance to South Africa’s constitutional commitment to the right to education is balanced by a recognition of the importance of evaluating needs of particular people in specific contexts with their reservoirs of indigenous knowledge, capabilities and character. This is expressed in the following principles:

1. Section 29 of the Constitution declares: “Everyone has a right to basic education”, and the preamble to the SA Schools Act states: “This country requires a national system for schools which will redress past injustices in education provision”. Constitutional entitlements therefore have to be met by provision of quality basic education for all sectors of society.

2. Primary responsibility for education provision obviously rests with the state and the Department of Education in particular. However, strategies and initiatives are meaningless if education is public; however, they exist in terms of models may be in tension with building systems that could coalesce with local contexts, experiences and resources.

3. Democratic principles of education provision are central to the development of education in South Africa. The role of government is to provide the forum for debate of educational policies, priorities and programmes. The expected outcomes in terms of models may be in tension with building systems that could coalesce with local contexts, experiences and resources.

4. Democratic principles of education provision are central to the development of education in South Africa. The role of government is to provide the forum for debate of educational policies, priorities and programmes. The expected outcomes in terms of models may be in tension with building systems that could coalesce with local contexts, experiences and resources.

5. Integrated, community-based education provision is the goal. Schools should be focused in the social fabric of the communities in which they are situated.

6. Even though rural schooling is severely under-resourced, strategies should avoid deprioritizing rural education in terms of quantity and quality

7. A coalition of respect for the inherent worth, capabilities and assets of rural people is a respect schooling and development can be built.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

example in the form of models of 'whole school' development and 'effective schools'. However, in a developing context such as ours, the overriding principle should be strategic awareness of context. Contexts are not simply the scene of action: through their unique distinctive enabling and disabling features, contexts influence the nature of social action taking place within them. The African experience (particularly donor-funded project experience) has much to offer.

3. Following point 2 above, it stands to reason that educational strategies will not - and cannot be - uniform across all sites. Unity of purpose, not of strategic detail, should be an operational principle.

4. Following principle 6 and 7, together with the experience of rural school development in a developing context (see point 2 above), the learning model should be strategic awareness of and engagement in the form of models of whole school development and effective schools. However, to avoid this report becoming too fragmented or piecemeal, the committee constructed a 'narrative framework' to contextualize and explain the recommendations. We begin in Theme 1 by describing the single most dominant characteristic of rural schooling: Poverty. Poverty strongly influences the learning environment by constraining and framing the recommendations. The committee recommends that the themes, the committee recommendations, are framed, contextualized and substantiated within a sequence of themes and sub-themes.

In order to avoid this report becoming too fragmented or piecemeal, the committee constructed a "narrative framework" to contextualize and explain the recommendations. We begin in Theme 1 by describing the single most dominant characteristic of rural schooling: Poverty. Poverty strongly influences the learning environment by constraining and framing the recommendations. The committee recommends that the themes, the committee recommendations, are framed, contextualized and substantiated within a sequence of themes and sub-themes.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

sanitation and lights, and these are precisely what rural schools in the main do not have. Many rural schools are small schools, and for many learners progression is prevented by the absence of higher levels of schooling. Rural schooling requires an integrated and holistic approach to provide essential services and ensure a comprehensive environment for lifelong learning.

Theme 3 covers the 'size and shape' of education in rural areas. The demographic patterns of rural areas have begun to change rapidly in the last ten years (the number of learners in farm schools decreased by 60 per cent between 1996 and 2000) thus posing problems of location, transport and accommodation. Resolution of such difficulties, however, is dependent on decisions regarding the nature and size of schools. Following an overview of the merits and demerits of small and large schools, a model of two- and three-tier schools is proposed. It is also noted that school design should also take into account the learning needs of the broader community.

Making rural schools effective will require high quality management and governance at district and local levels. In Theme 4 we address the role of district offices and School Governing Bodies as the frontline delivery agents. For reasons including logistics and geography, as well lack of capacity, it appears as if District Offices have been unable to provide rural schools with adequate support. Provinces also have different structures resulting in patterns of support varying markedly. Policy design and procedures nest more easily in urban than in rural settings, yet community involvement in management and governance is vital. No less necessary is the involvement of other provincial departments such as health and social development, agriculture and public works. We argue the need to clarify the roles of stakeholders as the first necessary step in developing adequately supported communal systems of governance.

The curriculum (Theme 5) is at the heart of the schooling enterprise, yet tends to be overshadowed by issues around the more visible and immediate lack of essential facilities and material provision. Ultimately, however, quality and equity are realized in the domain of curriculum. The issues that count are the ability of educators to stimulate learning, and what learners achieve in cognitive and developmental terms. Relevant issues here include effective support for C2005, the role and contribution of indigenous knowledges, and questions of language and medium of instruction. Some may question the idea that rural schools should have a curriculum that differs, even in small ways, from urban schools. There are, however, strong grounds for elaborating on a common, core curriculum in ways that speak directly to different rural milieux.

Our fifth theme is strongly linked to the sixth because the curriculum is enacted and mediated by educators. In a very real sense, educators are the curriculum, and every issue concerning the curriculum impacts on their work. The curriculum is at the heart of the schooling enterprise, yet tends to be overemphasized by

The first necessary step in developing adequately supported communal systems of governance.

Learning needs of the broader community will require high quality management and governance at district and local levels. In Theme 6 we address the role of district offices and School Governing Bodies as the frontline delivery agents, including the need to clarify the roles of stakeholders as the first necessary step in developing adequately supported communal systems of governance.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Part One

Processes and principles informing recommendations of the Ministerial Committee on Rural Education

Background and overview

The intent to form a Ministerial Committee on Rural Education (MCRE) was announced by then Minister of Education, Professor Kader Asmal MP, at the meeting of the Council of Education Ministers on 22 September 2003. The committee was formally established by government gazette on 11 March 2004 (see Appendix A for composition of committee). From March 2004 to July 2004, the committee met with the Minister, the Council of Education Ministers and the Department of Education in a process of briefing and discussion designed to sharpen and refine its focus and mode of operation. This process continued after the appointment of Mrs Naledi Grace Pandor MP as Minister of Education in May 2004. By the end of July 2004, a brief for the committee had been determined: to produce a report containing practical recommendations to help the Department of Education (DoE) and the Provincial Education Departments (PEDs) develop an integrated and multi-faceted plan of action for improving the quality of schooling in rural areas. The report would be based on an analysis of the DoE’s and the PEDs’ involvement in rural education, a review of literature and previous reports, and interviews with a range of stakeholders. The committee would also consult with relevant government departments, business, civil society, and communities. The report was to be submitted to the Minister by the end of December 2004.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

that emerged strongly during the committee's consultation process was the diversity of rural areas. The rural areas of each province have different demographies, geographies, economies and cultures that shape the lives of rural people in fundamentally different ways. This report offers no 'one-size-fits-all' solutions and concentrates rather on approaches that will adapt to diverse rural milieus. Hence, the recommendations of this report are based on the assumption that quality of rural schooling can be improved by recognizing and accommodating the local social and economic conditions, and by building on existing strengths and opportunities.

Process

The committee met for a total of fourteen days. It made two calls for submissions: a general call to the public, and invitations for comment to 200 organisations and institutions. Over 70 submissions were received and members of the committee held more than 30 interviews with DoE officials and representatives of various organizations. A survey questionnaire was sent to each provincial department of education. Using the information gathered through these processes, the committee produced an initial set of recommendations that were discussed with senior officials from provinces at a workshop held on 26 November 2004.

What is 'rural'?

Although the term 'rural' is ambiguous, and distinctions between rural and urban tend to be arbitrary and varied, the committee noted in the public submissions and interviews a surprisingly strong common recognition of what constitutes a rural area. In general, international literature defines 'rural' as a space where human settlement and infrastructure occupy only small patches of the landscape, and economic activity is dominated by primary production. In South Africa, however, this definition of rural has to be expanded to include areas of dense settlement created by apartheid driven land resettlement policies.

Definitions of 'rural' tend to emphasise a particular feature of rurality: settlement or demographic patterns; spatial or environmental characteristics; political or economic factors; and, socio-cultural or historical factors. In South Africa, colonialism and apartheid left an indelible print on all aspects of rural life through land dispossessions, resettlement policies, and systematic exclusion from opportunities to improve personal and social well-being, which made poverty the most endemic characteristic of rural areas.

Statistical definitions, the usual preserve of statisticians, often ignore differences embedded in specific conditions and contexts. They are based on the assumption that quality rural schooling can only be improved by recognizing and accommodating the local social and economic conditions, and by building on existing strengths and opportunities.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

… Finally, it is also clear that everyone, from politicians and government officials, to business to urban residents, to rural dwellers need to be re-educated to understand the diversity of rural ecosystems and the related employment and economic benefits of ecologically sustainable development. 3

In view of these complexities, the committee approached rurality in a way that balances quantitative and qualitative features. The need for a focused definition useful for the kind of information gathering, monitoring and evaluation necessary for a state driven intervention programme for rural schooling led the committee to adopt the quantitative definition of 'rural' used by Statistics South Africa (SSA) in the 2001 Census. This is a spatial definition identifying Traditional Authority (TA) areas (primarily 'community owned' land in the erstwhile 'homelands') and formal rural areas (primarily commercial farms in erstwhile 'white' areas of South Africa). It provides a useful working definition of rural areas, many rural households have changed in size, and capabilities of rural populations are changing.

In order to capture the diversity of rural locations the committee suggests further refinements can be made to the SSA definition based on the following relevant features of the environment:

- distance to towns;
- topography (the condition of roads, bridges to schools, etc.);
- settlement patterns (dense/isolated homesteads/villages);
- access to communications and information technologies (telephones, radio, television, computers);
- transport infrastructure (roads, buses, taxis);
- access to services and facilities (electricity, water, sanitation);
- health, educational and economic status of the community;
- activities of political, cultural and civil society organisations;
- local government involvement through the use of participatory methodologies.

Each of these features represents a severe challenge to the delivery of schooling in rural areas and plays a role in determining the quality of provision. Although a necessary means towards improving the quality of rural schooling, these 'quantitative' factors are insufficient for our purposes. A balance is needed with 'qualitative' elaborations that place people at the centre of analysis and of any programme of action.

In order to capture the diversity of rural locations, the committee suggests that further refinements can be made by considering the following factors:

- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural development and an emphasis on local policies;
- the need for a holistic approach to rural education and an emphasis on local policies;
What is "quality education"?

The committee sees quality as multi-faceted. In some aspects, particularly with respect to education provision and resources, the focus is on quantifiable indicators. In other aspects, notably with regard to the quality and relevance of the learner's educational experience, qualitative dimensions are harder to measure, but no less, and arguably more, important. Some of the key factors influencing the quality of rural schooling include:

- local economy;
- relations between schools and SGBs and/or Traditional Authorities and/or Farmer;
- cultural and social capacity (understood as recognizing and responding to equity issues of race, gender and learners with special educational needs and to citizenship issues of democracy, religion, language, tradition and indigenous knowledge);
- management and governance (local /district /region/province);
- legislation and policy;
- funding;
- infrastructure/learning environment;
- educators (pre-service training and professional development, conditions of service and living conditions);
- learners (access, retention, progression, achievements);
- sporting, cultural and recreation facilities and opportunities.

Other elements necessary for a good schooling system are more intimately associated with curriculum and pedagogy, the needs and capacities of learners, the training, commitment and competence of educators, access to learning resources, and school-community relations (including parents, traditional authorities and farmers).

Addressing the quality of rural schooling raises many questions: How can schooling contribute to:

- promoting and realization of key indicators of activity;
- moving the institutional responses to poor people;
- the right of primary agricultural production by building knowledge and skills capacity;
- ensuring in infrastructure and human capital and providing real people for employment outside economic spheres is expanded in order to reduce poverty;
- environmental sustainability with governments and development strategies whereby access to economic wellbeing, health and safe living is expanded;
- addressing gender inequities;
- developing partnerships with civil society organisations;
- immunization in human rights and social justice as a prerequisite to improving living conditions;
- effective interventions to improve the quality of rural schooling must aim at:

How does one overcome distances from schools? Should the provinces assist with transport to school?
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Should we be looking at the building of hostel schools especially at the FET level where size is linked to curriculum specialization and access to laboratories, workshops, sport and recreation facilities? Should the curriculum of rural schools allow for differences from the curriculum of urban schools? What can be done to attract competent educators to rural areas?

In attempting to answer such questions, the committee believes there are no simple, universally agreed upon solutions. Although the term ‘rural’ is a common understanding of many, different interpretations remain in the submissions to the committee:

- How does education serve rural development when much of its attraction is that it provides the avenue for some successful individuals to escape to modernity?
- A strong stress on building education in partnership with communities and respecting indigenous knowledges and cultures may be in tension with curriculum policy (learner centredness; creative, critical thinking, etc);
- Faith in integrated, multi-sectoral partnership approaches is strong, but it assumes a convergence of interests and a social consensus that does not always exist;
- The use of imported orthodoxies in terms of models may be in tension with building systems that reflect in integrated, multi-sectoral partnerships approaches is strong, but it assumes a coherent, crucial thinking (etc);
- How does building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
- How do building schools that address the needs of different forms of government. Many departments asset of potential?
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

and communities not only have farther to climb to achieve quality, they have fewer resources with which to make the climb. Homogenous administrative, management, and governance regulations fail to recognize the specific demands of rural contexts leading to a variety of ‘failures’. It does not make sense to have learners under trees in one locale and empty classrooms in another; or, educators teaching a few small classes a week in one locale and myriad classrooms in another. ‘Success’ in rural areas is largely based on the number of learners in classes and not on the number, quality, and development of the curriculum. The rural context is characterized by poverty, inequalities in access to resources, and a lack of political and financial support. The rural context is also unique in its social and cultural diversity. Schools in rural areas are the most common manifestation of the ‘presence of the state’—however weak that presence may be—and could become a focal point for rural development and poverty alleviation. However, rural education and rural schooling have struggled to make significant progress in the past decade. The School Feeding Programme, which began in 2004, has been one of the few initiatives that have made a significant impact. However, the Programme has faced significant challenges, including limited human and financial resources.

Rural Schooling: A special case

Unsurprisingly, South Africa’s first ten years of democracy are marked by an overemphasizing commitment to achieving equality. However, the reality is that the rural domain is simply a particular site of mainstream education. A teacher union resolution that reads: ‘Rural education and farm schools in particular are special cases warranting special policy attention.’

From the submissions, the most significant issue is one fundamental to rural education and farm schools, and one that emerges clearly from rural schools and communities: the need to meet the needs of rural learners. The need for educational equity from urban schools and a necessity to meet the needs of rural learners. Homogenous administrative, management, and governance regulations fail to recognize the specific demands of rural contexts leading to a variety of ‘failures’. It does not make sense to have learners under trees in one locale and empty classrooms in another; or, educators teaching a few small classes a week in one locale and myriad classrooms in another. ‘Success’ in rural areas is largely based on the number of learners in classes and not on the number, quality, and development of the curriculum. The rural context is characterized by poverty, inequalities in access to resources, and a lack of political and financial support. The rural context is also unique in its social and cultural diversity. Schools in rural areas are the most common manifestation of the ‘presence of the state’—however weak that presence may be—and could become a focal point for rural development and poverty alleviation. However, rural education and rural schooling have struggled to make significant progress in the past decade. The School Feeding Programme, which began in 2004, has been one of the few initiatives that have made a significant impact. However, the Programme has faced significant challenges, including limited human and financial resources.

Rural Schooling: A special case

Unsurprisingly, South Africa’s first ten years of democracy are marked by an overemphasizing commitment to achieving equality. However, the reality is that the rural domain is simply a particular site of mainstream education. A teacher union resolution that reads: ‘Rural education and farm schools in particular are special cases warranting special policy attention.’

From the submissions, the most significant issue is one fundamental to rural education and farm schools, and one that emerges clearly from rural schools and communities: the need to meet the needs of rural learners. The need for educational equity from urban schools and a necessity to meet the needs of rural learners. Homogenous administrative, management, and governance regulations fail to recognize the specific demands of rural contexts leading to a variety of ‘failures’. It does not make sense to have learners under trees in one locale and empty classrooms in another; or, educators teaching a few small classes a week in one locale and myriad classrooms in another. ‘Success’ in rural areas is largely based on the number of learners in classes and not on the number, quality, and development of the curriculum. The rural context is characterized by poverty, inequalities in access to resources, and a lack of political and financial support. The rural context is also unique in its social and cultural diversity. Schools in rural areas are the most common manifestation of the ‘presence of the state’—however weak that presence may be—and could become a focal point for rural development and poverty alleviation. However, rural education and rural schooling have struggled to make significant progress in the past decade. The School Feeding Programme, which began in 2004, has been one of the few initiatives that have made a significant impact. However, the Programme has faced significant challenges, including limited human and financial resources.

Rural Schooling: A special case

Unsurprisingly, South Africa’s first ten years of democracy are marked by an overemphasizing commitment to achieving equality. However, the reality is that the rural domain is simply a particular site of mainstream education. A teacher union resolution that reads: ‘Rural education and farm schools in particular are special cases warranting special policy attention.’

From the submissions, the most significant issue is one fundamental to rural education and farm schools, and one that emerges clearly from rural schools and communities: the need to meet the needs of rural learners. The need for educational equity from urban schools and a necessity to meet the needs of rural learners. Homogenous administrative, management, and governance regulations fail to recognize the specific demands of rural contexts leading to a variety of ‘failures’. It does not make sense to have learners under trees in one locale and empty classrooms in another; or, educators teaching a few small classes a week in one locale and myriad classrooms in another. ‘Success’ in rural areas is largely based on the number of learners in classes and not on the number, quality, and development of the curriculum. The rural context is characterized by poverty, inequalities in access to resources, and a lack of political and financial support. The rural context is also unique in its social and cultural diversity. Schools in rural areas are the most common manifestation of the ‘presence of the state’—however weak that presence may be—and could become a focal point for rural development and poverty alleviation. However, rural education and rural schooling have struggled to make significant progress in the past decade. The School Feeding Programme, which began in 2004, has been one of the few initiatives that have made a significant impact. However, the Programme has faced significant challenges, including limited human and financial resources.

Rural Schooling: A special case

Unsurprisingly, South Africa’s first ten years of democracy are marked by an overemphasizing commitment to achieving equality. However, the reality is that the rural domain is simply a particular site of mainstream education. A teacher union resolution that reads: ‘Rural education and farm schools in particular are special cases warranting special policy attention.’

From the submissions, the most significant issue is one fundamental to rural education and farm schools, and one that emerges clearly from rural schools and communities: the need to meet the needs of rural learners. The need for educational equity from urban schools and a necessity to meet the needs of rural learners. Homogenous administrative, management, and governance regulations fail to recognize the specific demands of rural contexts leading to a variety of ‘failures’. It does not make sense to have learners under trees in one locale and empty classrooms in another; or, educators teaching a few small classes a week in one locale and myriad classrooms in another. ‘Success’ in rural areas is largely based on the number of learners in classes and not on the number, quality, and development of the curriculum. The rural context is characterized by poverty, inequalities in access to resources, and a lack of political and financial support. The rural context is also unique in its social and cultural diversity. Schools in rural areas are the most common manifestation of the ‘presence of the state’—however weak that presence may be—and could become a focal point for rural development and poverty alleviation. However, rural education and rural schooling have struggled to make significant progress in the past decade. The School Feeding Programme, which began in 2004, has been one of the few initiatives that have made a significant impact. However, the Programme has faced significant challenges, including limited human and financial resources.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

"It is therefore recommended that rural schools be treated as a separate category of 'special' schools and that they (and other schools in poor areas) receive more funding (over and above their 'quintile' based allocation)."

The purpose of 'special treatment' is clear: to improve the quality of education for all children in rural areas. One key indicator of the 'rightness' of rural schooling is gender parity. Despite growing gender parity in universal access to basic education, social, economic and cultural factors continue to impact on gender inequities, particularly in rural areas: African girl learners achieve lower results than African boy learners in key learning areas and in the grade 12 examinations. Furthermore, girls and boys in rural schools face different challenges when attempting to access and stay in school, particularly when they come from impoverished households.

Principles, values and operational strategies

Improving the quality of rural schooling is a complex project and the primary responsibility for this project rests with government. To maximize the value of this report for 'delivery' or 'implementation' purposes, the committee has focused on practical recommendations designed specifically for consideration by the DoE and the PEDS. In order to keep the report succinct and practical, there is no detailed explanation of the theoretical framework informing this report, although the theory is implicit in the analytic perspectives, choice of themes and recommendations. The values and concepts informing the committee's orientation draw, broadly, on South Africa's democracy and human rights tradition together with a pragmatic recognition of the importance of understanding how power operates in rural communities. The importance of giving substance to South Africa's constitutional commitment to the right to education is balanced by a recognition of the importance of evaluating the needs of particular people in specific contexts with their reservoirs of indigenous knowledge, capabilities and character. This orientation, and its underlying theoretical framework, is expressed in the following principles:

1. Section 29 of the Constitution declares: "Everyone has a right to basic education", and the preamble to the SA Schools Act states: "This country requires a new national system for schools which will redress past injustices in education provision". Constitutional entitlements therefore have to be met by provision of quality basic education for all sectors of society.

2. Treating unequals as equals can perpetuate inequality. This applies as well to systemic issues as to individuals.

3. Equality of inputs in the form of material provision does not on its own meet the needs for redress.

4. Outcomes of inputs are the real test of quality.

5. Integrated, community-based education provision is key to success. Schools should be located in the social fabric of the communities in which they are situated.

6. Every thought must be a guiding principle, and guiding principles must be clearly stated at the beginning of the report. The principle that rural education — and farm schools in particular — merit differentiation of treatment as well as investment is a critical one.

7. Treating unequal sections as equal can perpetuate inequality. This applies as well to systemic issues.

8. There is no logical connection between the idea of education for all and a common curriculum, nor do demands for educational equality imply that all must have the same educational diet...

9. Even thought rural schooling is seriously under-resourced, strategies should avoid depicting schooling and development as 'quick wins'.

10. The social fabric of the communities in which they are situated.

11. Girl and boy learners face different challenges when attempting to access and stay in school, particularly when they come from impoverished households.

12. Equality of inputs in the form of material provision does not on its own meet the needs for redress.

13. Outputs and learning outcomes are essential elements of quality assurance.

14. Although education serves individual aspirations such as for social mobility, state education necessarily privileges social benefits. Current conditions imply that the most important aims for rural education are rural development and poverty alleviation.

15. Integrated, community-based education provision is sine qua non. Schools should be rooted in the social fabric of the communities in which they are situated.

16. Even though rural schooling is seriously under-resourced, strategies should avoid depicting schooling and development as 'quick wins'.

17. The social fabric of the communities in which they are situated.

18. Girl and boy learners face different challenges when attempting to access and stay in school, particularly when they come from impoverished households.

19. Equality of inputs in the form of material provision does not on its own meet the needs for redress.

20. Outputs and learning outcomes are essential elements of quality assurance.

21. Although education serves individual aspirations such as for social mobility, state education necessarily privileges social benefits. Current conditions imply that the most important aims for rural education are rural development and poverty alleviation.

22. Integrated, community-based education provision is sine qua non. Schools should be rooted in the social fabric of the communities in which they are situated.

23. Even though rural schooling is seriously under-resourced, strategies should avoid depicting schooling and development as 'quick wins'.

24. The social fabric of the communities in which they are situated.

25. Girl and boy learners face different challenges when attempting to access and stay in school, particularly when they come from impoverished households.

26. Equality of inputs in the form of material provision does not on its own meet the needs for redress.

27. Outputs and learning outcomes are essential elements of quality assurance.

28. Although education serves individual aspirations such as for social mobility, state education necessarily privileges social benefits. Current conditions imply that the most important aims for rural education are rural development and poverty alleviation.

29. Integrated, community-based education provision is sine qua non. Schools should be rooted in the social fabric of the communities in which they are situated.

30. Even though rural schooling is seriously under-resourced, strategies should avoid depicting schooling and development as 'quick wins'.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

7. A corollary of respect for the inherent worth, capabilities and assets of rural people is a respect for diverse forms of (indigenous) knowledge. This is also important in the light of Curriculum 2005 (C2005) respect for everyday knowledge.

These principles are supplemented by the following five operational strategies:

1. Primary responsibility for education provision obviously rests with the state and the DoE and PEDs in particular. However, strategies and initiatives are immeasurably strengthened if they are multi-sectoral, involving, for example, other state departments, business, unions, and civil society.

2. The international, and particularly African, literature may inform strategic approaches to developing quality education, for example in the form of models of 'whole school' development and 'effective schools'. However, in a developing context such as ours, the overriding principle should be strategic awareness of context. Contexts are not simply the scene of action: through their unique distinctive enabling and disabling features, contexts influence the nature of social action taking place within them.

3. Following point 2 above, it stands to reason that educational strategies will not — and cannot be — uniform across all sites. Unity of purpose, not of strategic detail, should be an operational principle.

4. Following principles 6 and 7, together with the oft-reported fact that rural communities are characterised by a feeling of powerlessness, it is important that strategic initiatives are aimed at developing community sense of agency. Responsibility and resources, supported by suitable forms of training, should be entrusted to rural communities.

5. Strategies need to be mindful of tensions. For example, while local, context-specific indigenous knowledges may be appropriate in particular situations, rural schools are also part of global systems in which universal benchmarking measures are powerful.

A way forward

The majority of submissions focused on issues of rights and equity rather than on curriculum and quality of teaching and learning. Obviously without access and adequate resources one cannot begin to address quality of learning. However, the dominance of these enabling arguments goes together with seeing rural communities in deficit terms, and leads readily to approaches which start by focusing on the needs, deficiencies and problems of people and their communities. An alternative approach is to focus on the capacities, skills and social resources of people and encouraging them to think about potential and about the ways the existing potential can be directed towards availabe opportunities.

The recommendations are framed, contextualized and given substance within a sequence of themes and sub-themes. The committee recommends appropriate actions to improve rural schooling.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

In order to avoid this report becoming too fragmented or piecemeal, the committee constructed a 'narrative framework' to contextualize and explain the recommendations. We begin in Theme 1 by surveying the single most dominant characteristic of rural schooling: Poverty. Poverty strongly influences the provision and quality of schooling, its 'take-up' by learners and the roles played by educators, parents and other community stakeholders. The most obvious strategy to address the crisis in rural schools is to increase funding. However, in a climate of fiscal austerity any increase in public expenditure must have a strong justification, come with guarantees that it will be spent in ways that are not only cost efficient and effective, and a worthwhile investment, but above all promote personal and social well-being.

Theme 2 deals with the funding of rural schooling. Present expenditure patterns are strongly affected by the size and location of rural schools that are the product of a history of colonialism and apartheid overlaid by ad-hoc decisions by farmers and 'homeland' and Traditional Authorities. Notwithstanding measures to promote equity, inequities between the historically advantaged and disadvantaged schools, and above all between schools in rural and urban areas, have been reduced but not eliminated. Equity may indeed be unattainable within current modes of determining provincial and intra-provincial allocations to schools. Budgets tend to cater for costs of operating — not establishing — essential facilities such as water, sanitation and lights, and these are precisely what rural schools in the main do not have. Many rural schools are small schools, and for many learners progression is prevented by the absence of higher levels of schooling. The demographic patterns of rural areas have begun to change rapidly in the last ten years (the number of learners in farm schools decreased by 60 per cent between 1996 and 2000) thus posing problems of location, transport and accommodation. Resolution of such difficulties, however, is dependent on decisions regarding the nature and size of schools. Following an overview of the merits and demerits of small and large schools, a model of two- and three-tier schools is proposed.

Making rural schools effective will require high quality management and governance at district and local levels. Theme 4 addresses the role of district offices and School Governing Bodies as the frontline delivery agents. For reasons including logistics and geography, as well as lack of capacity, it appears as if District Offices have been unable to provide rural schools with adequate support. Provinces also have disparate structures resulting in patterns of support varying markedly. Policy design and procedures nest more easily in urban than in rural settings, yet community involvement in management and governance is vital. No less necessary is the involvement of other provincial departments such as health and social development, agriculture and public works. We argue the need to clarify roles of stakeholders as the first necessary step in developing adequately supported communal systems of governance.

The curriculum (Theme 5) is at the heart of the schooling enterprise yet tends to be overemphasized by policymakers. Relevant issues here include effective support for C2005, the role and contribution of indigenous knowledge, and questions of language and medium of instruction. Some may question the idea that rural schools should have a curriculum that differs, even in small ways, from urban schools. There are strong grounds for elaborating on a common core curriculum in ways that speak directly to different rural realities. "Equity" means acknowledging a common core curriculum to be a goal rather than a series of objectives, and recognizing the need to develop school-specific strategies to achieve this goal. Relevant issues here include the nature and extent of interaction among learners, educators and the community at large.

Our fifth theme is strongly linked to the sixth because the curriculum is enacted and mediated by educators. In a very real sense, educators are the curriculum. Theme 6 addresses the key issues of educator recruitment, conditions of service, and appropriate forms of support and professional development. Relevant issues here include the nature and extent of interaction among educators, School Governing Bodies and other educational stakeholders.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Up to this point in the narrative, the report treats rural schools as inclusive of both schools on commercial farms and schools in Traditional Authority areas. Our seventh theme looks specifically at schools on commercial farms and, in a limited way, at all public schools on private land. A specific focus on schools on farms and schools in Traditional Authority areas. Our seventh theme looks specifically at schools on farms and schools in Traditional Authority areas. Our seventh theme looks specifically at schools on farms and schools in Traditional Authority areas.

The eighth and last theme covers key operational areas that must be addressed if the future of rural schools is to be an improvement on their past: clear line management roles and responsibilities, comprehensive monitoring and evaluation, and communication forums and decision making structures at national and provincial levels comprised of designated directors and officials having a special responsibility for rural schooling.

The South African Schools Act has not ended the dual management system. All public schools on private land were to be proclaimed public schools. But the majority of schools have not concluded agreements in all the provinces. This legal hiatus results in delivery of essential services.

A specific focus on schools on farms and schools in Traditional Authority areas. Our seventh theme looks specifically at schools on farms and schools in Traditional Authority areas. Our seventh theme looks specifically at schools on farms and schools in Traditional Authority areas. Our seventh theme looks specifically at schools on farms and schools in Traditional Authority areas. Our seventh theme looks specifically at schools on farms and schools in Traditional Authority areas. Our seventh theme looks specifically at schools on farms and schools in Traditional Authority areas.
Poverty, the most consistent feature of a constellation of factors that hinder access to quality education, retention and achievement, is pervasive having gender, race, family-type and spatial dimensions. Even though endemic to urban and rural settings the forms it takes in rural locales differ from those found in urban areas. The Gini coefficient continues to place SA in the ranks of the most unequal societies in the world. The poverty gap has increased between 1995 and 2002 with the rise in poverty being more significant among women relative to men, Africans relative to other racial groups, ‘single’ families relative to other family types, and in the Eastern Cape relative to other provinces.

Dealing with high incidences of poverty amongst rural children requires concerted inter-sectoral interventions. Some are already in operation such as the school feeding programme, but resources are needed to ensure this programme and other similar social, development, economic and health initiatives can go to scale. Lack of resources and the harsh climatic conditions in many rural areas have resulted in the failure of many community initiatives. Dissonant political relations at community level can also undermine development efforts as illustrated in a development project in northern KwaZulu-Natal.

Box 1: Education and Democracy in rural KwaZulu-Natal

Experience from a village education project in the Maputaland area of north-eastern KwaZulu-Natal shows the political difficulties encountered when high incidences of poverty amongst rural children require concerted inter-sectoral interventions. A recent study looking at the reasons for the failure of a development project in rural KwaZulu-Natal found that the main issue is that of governance: who owns and controls the project? The traditional authority (TA) or the development committee?

10 Ibid, p. 42.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Government's responses to poverty, increasingly multi-pronged and integrated through the ISRDS and local government's IDP, do not spell out the relationship between rural schooling and measures to address poverty and development. (Until now, these have not been applicable to privately-owned farms.) This lack of clarity may lead to unintended consequences (highlighting the importance of careful monitoring and evaluation).

For example, while the Child Grant may be providing households with much-needed income, information obtained from narrative reports indicate the grants may be having a negative affect on school attendance of young girls: there is speculation that access to the grant has led to increases in the pregnancy rates of young girls although there is no hard data to support such claims.

Poverty has direct and multiple effects on education. One of the most potent is that children's lives are fragmented due to the demands on their time from their responsibilities to their families. In many cases, girls carry the heaviest burdens. Other challenges for rural learners include difficulties in accessing school, remaining at school, and achieving success.

Actions to reduce the impact of poverty on children's lives must take cognisance of differences in the contexts and circumstances of schools and their communities. Various initiatives have shown that key priorities to be undertaken in impoverished school communities include:

- ensuring communities are partners in development efforts in ways that enable them to use their assets and build their capacities;
- addressing vulnerabilities, especially relating to gender, including the impact of illnesses, malnutrition, child-headed households and child labour;
- addressing child labour;
- improving access to schooling;
- eliminating drop out, improving attendance rates and enhancing learner achievements;
- providing school safety and security, ensuring a safe environment (especially ending the abuse of women and children) and protecting the school's infrastructure and assets.

Government's responses to rural poverty follow a trajectory that has seen shifts from the original vision of the RDP through GEAR to the ISRDS. The committee's concern is to look forward to what can be done within the present constellation of policies that address rural poverty and how schooling can be best positioned to contribute to their implementation.

The Committee's recommendations relating to schooling and poverty embrace three interlinked sets of actions: Community mobilisation, promoting intersectoral programmes, and tackling risks.

Sub theme: Community mobilisation

The success of poverty alleviation or eradication strategies depends on community buy-in founded on their strengths and assets. As pointed out by some submissions:

- "... rural communities have many strengths. They may pertain to a powerful sense of community; to an understanding of the communities' cultural contexts; to an understanding of indigenous knowledge systems. All too often we look at the community or that which is offered by the local schools..."
- "... rural communities have many strengths. They may pertain to a powerful sense of community; to an understanding of the communities' cultural contexts; to an understanding of indigenous knowledge systems. All too often we look at the community or that which is offered by the local schools..."

From the public submissions one was struck by the potential of environmental education as an organizing concept around which to mobilise communities. According to a number of respondents, environmental education is an organizing concept around which to mobilise communities. According to a number of respondents, environmental education as an organizing concept around which to mobilise communities.

"... rural communities have many strengths. They may pertain to a powerful sense of community; to an understanding of the communities' cultural contexts; to an understanding of indigenous knowledge systems. All too often we look at the community or that which is offered by the local schools..."

From the public submissions one was struck by the potential of environmental education as an organizing concept around which to mobilise communities. According to a number of respondents, environmental education is an organizing concept around which to mobilise communities.

"... rural communities have many strengths. They may pertain to a powerful sense of community; to an understanding of the communities' cultural contexts; to an understanding of indigenous knowledge systems. All too often we look at the community or that which is offered by the local schools..."
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Environmental concerns have a clear potential for underpinning an approach based on enhancing community 'assets' (as opposed to remedying 'deficits'). The success of the Eco-Schools programme, albeit on a small scale, demonstrates how a fairly simple and cost-effective programme can strengthen community participation in schooling and unleash the potential for integrating knowledge across learning areas in ways that promote learner activity. The Eco-schools project appears to have a strong impact on the 'ethos' of schools with learners, educators and communities developing a strong sense of ownership and pride in their school.

Recommendation 1: District offices and schools should work with CBOs and NGOs (and when constituted, with Community/District Education Forums) to ascertain strategies and focal points of community-determined programmes of action regarding school development that integrates curriculum reform with community empowerment opportunities.

Recommendation 2: PEDs should develop a provincial strategy for taking school and community based projects to scale, concentrating on those that have the potential to sustain school-community links, primarily those based on environmental concerns.

Recommendation 3: The DoE should assess features of school-community programmes and, on the basis of best practices (as for example, demonstrated by environmentally oriented projects), develop a national strategy for supporting these local level initiatives as well as taking such projects to scale.

Recommendation 4: Raise awareness and knowledge of existing and potential community projects and programmes through extensive and appropriate media coverage and public debate at local levels.

Sub theme: Intersectoral programmes

The above link with Theme 4: Constituting DEFs: the rules of district offices.

A lot of government interventions have been directed to the so-called 'nodal areas' and social development programmes are currently only focused on these. This approach is emerging as an example of a 'quick development organisation' that the case study of a local government intervention is pointing out. The DoE, as a member of the Social Service Cluster, has also been impacted on by the public service and the role of the DEFs in supporting the delivery of essential services.

Recommendation 1: PEDs should develop a provincial strategy for delivering essential services to schools and districts.

Recommendation 2: The DoE should assess localised services as well as taking such projects to scale.

Recommendation 3: Proposals to scale concern on issues that are potential to school-school community links.

Recommendation 4: Proposals should develop a provincial strategy for delivery of essential services to schools and districts.

Environmental concerns have a clear potential for underpinning the approach based on enhancing community 'assets' (as opposed to remedying 'deficits'). The Eco-schools project appears to have a strong impact on the 'ethos' of schools with learners, educators and communities developing a strong sense of ownership and pride in their school.

Recommendation 1: District offices and schools should work with CBOs and NGOs (and when constituted, with Community/District Education Forums) to ascertain strategies and focal points of community-determined programmes of action regarding school development that integrates curriculum reform with community empowerment opportunities.

Recommendation 2: PEDs should develop a provincial strategy for taking school and community based projects to scale, concentrating on those that have the potential to sustain school-community links, primarily those based on environmental concerns.

Recommendation 3: The DoE should assess features of school-community programmes and, on the basis of best practices (as for example, demonstrated by environmentally oriented projects), develop a national strategy for supporting these local level initiatives as well as taking such projects to scale.

Recommendation 4: Raise awareness and knowledge of existing and potential community projects and programmes through extensive and appropriate media coverage and public debate at local levels.

Sub theme: Intersectoral programmes

The above link with Theme 4: Constituting DEFs: the rules of district offices.

A lot of government interventions have been directed to the so-called 'nodal areas' and social development programmes are currently only focused on these. This approach is emerging as an example of a 'quick development organisation' that the case study of a local government intervention is pointing out. The DoE, as a member of the Social Service Cluster, has also been impacted on by the public service and the role of the DEFs in supporting the delivery of essential services.

Recommendation 1: PEDs should develop a provincial strategy for delivering essential services to schools and districts.

Recommendation 2: The DoE should assess localised services as well as taking such projects to scale.

Recommendation 3: Proposals to scale concern on issues that are potential to school-school community links.

Recommendation 4: Proposals should develop a provincial strategy for delivery of essential services to schools and districts.

Environmental concerns have a clear potential for underpinning the approach based on enhancing community 'assets' (as opposed to remedying 'deficits'). The Eco-schools project appears to have a strong impact on the 'ethos' of schools with learners, educators and communities developing a strong sense of ownership and pride in their school.

Recommendation 1: District offices and schools should work with CBOs and NGOs (and when constituted, with Community/District Education Forums) to ascertain strategies and focal points of community-determined programmes of action regarding school development that integrates curriculum reform with community empowerment opportunities.

Recommendation 2: PEDs should develop a provincial strategy for taking school and community based projects to scale, concentrating on those that have the potential to sustain school-community links, primarily those based on environmental concerns.

Recommendation 3: The DoE should assess features of school-community programmes and, on the basis of best practices (as for example, demonstrated by environmentally oriented projects), develop a national strategy for supporting these local level initiatives as well as taking such projects to scale.

Recommendation 4: Raise awareness and knowledge of existing and potential community projects and programmes through extensive and appropriate media coverage and public debate at local levels.
Recommendation 5: The national DoE should prepare a phased implementation programme for pilot ISRDS programmes implemented by the DoE and provinces in nodal areas to go to scale, based on an evaluation of their operations.

Recommendation 6: Together with local communities, relevant provincial departments, local government, service providers and NGOs and CBOs develop a programme of action that considers priorities relating to the delivery of facilities and services and essential resources to schools and includes these into the district IDPs.

Recommendation 7: Extend aspects of the school-feeding programme that support the creation of food gardens and other forms of production that suit local community contexts by giving all schools the opportunity to become community centres that provide formal schooling as well as productive activities.

Sub theme: Tackling risks

Some of the most obvious features of rural schooling that indicate the vulnerability of rural learners include high drop-out and absenteeism rates, the low nutritional status of children, and the prevalence of HIV/AIDS and parasitic infections. Teenage girls are most vulnerable as indicated by the high incidence of teenage pregnancies and HIV/AIDS amongst teenage girls in rural areas. Special consideration is necessary to ensure that girls have the confidence and means to remain at school.

Various cultural, economic and social priorities operating in communities result in lowered performance for girls at school. The Girls’ Education Movement and programmes such as Talent Search are seen to have an impact in retaining girls at school. This is despite the fact that they are piece-meal programmes relying on the commitment, passion and goodwill of a few individuals rather than being ‘mainstream’, properly funded and supported by key role-players. For example, BRAC offers a reduced but appropriate curriculum to such learners. South Africa’s drive to transform the countryside can bear fruit only through the medium of education. The potential to tear the mesh of learning and opportunities for learners has been developed through national sponsors and networks. However, prevention of gender-based violence has to be accompanied by measures to expand school access to meet the need of learners who have somehow been lost to the system. A number of national and international programmes have been developed that provide models for such action. For example, the Girls’ Education Movement provides a measure of access to girls’ education in South Africa. Vitas, a gender-based violence project, has been successful in providing a measure of access to girls’ education in South Africa.

However, prevention of gender-based violence has to be accompanied by expansion of school access to meet the needs of learners who have somehow been lost to the system. A number of national and international programmes have been developed that provide models for such action. For example, the Girls’ Education Movement provides a measure of access to girls’ education in South Africa. Vitas, a gender-based violence project, has been successful in providing a measure of access to girls’ education in South Africa.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Box 2: Supporting vulnerable learners

"Do cash transfers make significant contributions to eradicating child poverty?" Research has found that, in developing and transition economies, the provision of cash transfers and basic services to the poor are complementary activities, in order to ensure that supply responds to demand arising from the transfer programmes:

- Targeted conditional programs are vertically efficient (there are insignificant leakages to the non-poor) but they score less well on horizontal poverty reduction efficiency (i.e. they do not reach all the poor).
- On the other hand, family allowances, are less vertically efficient, but achieve almost perfect horizontal efficiency.

In reviewing a number of programmes addressing child poverty in Mexico, South Africa and Chile, it appears that:

- Developing countries ought to consider developing cash transfer programs within integrated childhood poverty eradication programs.
- Due attention be paid to the key role played by households in ensuring that transfers remain at school and indeed are able to enter tertiary level institutions.
- There needs to be a review of the ways in which individual programs may be used to promote a learning culture among children. An implication of this is that poor households should be regarded less as clients and more as the main agents of change.

Recommendation 1:
Flexible modalities of schooling should be identified and strategies developed for optimal enrolment of learners with special focus on girls and orphans and vulnerable children (OVCs).

Recommendation 2:
Community led strategies to support vulnerable children and to assure safe and secure schools.

Recommendation 3:
Facilitate community led strategies to support vulnerable children and to assure safety and security.

Recommendation 4:
Facilitate community led strategies to support vulnerable children and to assure safety and security.

Recommendation 5:
Facilitate community led strategies to support vulnerable children and to assure safety and security.

Recommendation 6:
Facilitate community led strategies to support vulnerable children and to assure safety and security.

Recommendation 7:
Facilitate community led strategies to support vulnerable children and to assure safety and security.

Recommendation 8:
Facilitate community led strategies to support vulnerable children and to assure safety and security.

Recommendation 9:
Facilitate community led strategies to support vulnerable children and to assure safety and security.

Recommendation 10:
Facilitate community led strategies to support vulnerable children and to assure safety and security.

Recommendation 11:
Facilitate community led strategies to support vulnerable children and to assure safety and security.

Recommendation 12:
Facilitate community led strategies to support vulnerable children and to assure safety and security.

A review of national child poverty eradication programs in South Africa, especially in rural communities. This should include a review of the "flexible modalities of schooling for OVCs".

The creation of such flexible modalities of schooling will accommodate OVCs in light of the increasing number of child-headed households in South Africa, especially in rural communities. This should include the inclusion of OVCs in schools on a case-by-case basis, and in developing and implementing a review of financing modalities and budgetary allocations in the Medium Term Expenditure Framework.

Box 2: Supporting vulnerable learners
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Theme 2: Funding rural schooling

One commentator pointed out: “There should be considerable bias towards rural schools with earmarked funding allocations for each school supported by effective monitoring.”

Current status and challenges

Post 1994 education budgets have shown sharp increases in funding allocations to the poorer provinces, that is, provinces with large rural communities, increasing in relation to the wealthier provinces. Also, provincial education departments have been encouraged to spend boldly on school funding norms allocations and aggressively increase spending on capital and infrastructure. However, these measures have reduced but not eliminated inequities between historically advantaged and historically disadvantaged schools, and above all between schools in rural and urban areas. In per capita terms, it appears that spending on public schooling across provincial education departments has become more equal.

Wildeman’s analyses reveal that this does not necessarily reflect deliberate actions by the State, but represents a confluence of various factors:

- The slow real growth of rich provinces’ budgets;
- The above-average real growth of most poor education departments’ school budgets;
- The migration of learners from poor to rich provinces;
- The general decline in learner numbers in poor provinces.

Equity may nevertheless not be an attainable goal using current modes of determining provincial and intra-provincial allocations to schools. One reason for this is that personnel budgets remain too high, constraining levels of expenditure on non-personnel goods and services. Hence provincial spending continues to be weighted towards supporting schools already having facilities and services.

Inequities are fuelled by SGBs who have funded the appointment of additional educators in historically advantaged schools, while at the same time redeployment strategies have failed to situate more experienced educators in areas of disadvantage.

A further ongoing challenge lies in the inequitable provision of essential facilities and services. Water sanitation and electricity in rural areas are a case in point. Provincial education departments have been directed towards establishing these services to all schools. Hence provincial spending strategies continue to be weighted towards supporting schools already having facilities and services.

Inequities are also seen in inter-provincial differences relating to expenditure. One submission pointed out: “What most schools in poverty really need is a significant and carefully channelled increase in expenditure. As one submission pointed out, improved pedagogy in rural classrooms depends on funding professional development programmes for educators in rural areas.”

The general decline in learner numbers in poor provinces: the slow real growth of rich provinces’ budgets; and the above-average real growth of most poor education departments’ school budgets, explain why the above-average real growth of most poor education departments’ school budgets, explains why equity may not be an attainable goal using current modes of determining provincial and intra-provincial allocations to schools. One reason for this is that personnel budgets remain too high, constraining levels of expenditure on non-personnel goods and services. Hence provincial spending continues to be weighted towards supporting schools already having facilities and services.

Inequities can be seen in inter-provincial differences relating to capital expenditure which remain substantial, as do per learner figures. While overall capital spending is projected to grow at a real annual average rate of 6.6 per cent, personal expenditure grows by 5.1 per cent. Eastern Cape’s capital infrastructure budget grows by approximately 36%, while Free State and Gauteng’s budgets increase by 5.6 per cent. In 2004/05, North and 12% of Mpuula’s grew by 35% and 30% respectively.

The second cluster comprises provinces that have reduced capital spending on non-personnel goods and services. In 2004/05, capital spending on non-personnel goods is expected to grow by 6% in North West and 3% in Mpumula. The third cluster comprises provinces that have increased capital spending on non-personnel goods and services. In 2004/05, capital spending on non-personnel goods is expected to grow by approximately 5% in Gauteng and by 10% in the Western Cape.

Inequities are also seen in inter-provincial differences relating to expenditure. The Northern Cape, at R4 679, has per learner spending levels that are significantly above the rest of provincial education departments (Wildeman, ibid. p 19).


17 For 2002/03, three distinct clusters of spending groups emerged. The largest cluster contains six provinces whose per learner spending on public schools ranges from approximately R3800 in Mpumula to approximately R4100 in the Western Cape. Compared to a few years ago, this spending range is significantly smaller, and is indicative of the gains poorer provinces have made in achieving similar levels of per learner spending compared to the traditionally affluent provinces.

18 Wildeman, ibid, p 11.
The costs of introducing a long-term programme, beginning with the most vulnerable, must be ascertained, and...

...and the need to expand FET opportunities in ways that benefit both communities as well as individuals. Rural schooling requires an integrated and holistic approach to provision. In other sections of the report, we have emphasised the need to expand FET opportunities in rural communities so that rural schools are more efficient in their attempts to limit spending on personnel:

- Provinces deal with payments for facilities and services differently, thus compounding difficulties in assessing comparative funding allocations for different categories of schools.
- As already discussed, data collection procedures do not differentiate between different categories of schools within and between schools in rural and urban areas.
- Clearly, budget decisions on facilities and services must be interrogated to ascertain how funding for these items can cover development, maintenance and security costs in addition to operational costs. Failure to do so has resulted in inefficiencies in maintaining new services. A case in point is the solar energy project located in different areas.

...because:

- The extent of the inequities pertaining to the costs of rural and urban schooling cannot be ascertained...
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

special funding elicited. It is also important to note that unless pilot ISRDS programmes are extended to all rural areas, pockets of privilege will emerge, with the result that inequities between rural domains will increase and this may be substantive.

No attempts have yet been made to ascertain the differential costs of supporting vulnerable learners and educators in rural and urban areas. The ELRC has initiated a study that considers the implications of the impact of the HIV/AIDS pandemic on educators and how to manage absenteeism caused by illness. It is likely that higher infection rates in rural areas and the greater shortage of educators in rural areas means that the impact of the pandemic will be worse in rural than in urban areas and that managing this will require different strategies that take note of the contextual features of rural schooling. These will probably translate into different costs of financing support. The higher infection rate amongst rural youths, and particularly amongst young girls, compels us to consider costs of immediate action amongst all sectors, beginning with securing the safety and well-being of children.

An interesting side issue arises when one considers funding social development projects such as School Feeding. Currently mothers do the cooking, but limited funds result in their being exploited as they are engaged as volunteers, and given an honorarium. To obviate this, the School Feeding Directorate is introducing a different funding model based on stimulating the establishment of CBOs that produce fresh produce and introduce community bakeries.

Conclusion

It is apparent that environmental features of rural areas, as well as ways in which learners, their families and the broader community have to deal with poverty, entail higher costs compared with schools in formal and informal urban areas, even those that facing similar levels of impoverishment. Therefore, it is perhaps timely to investigate current procedures with respect to allocations for redress funding derived from the state budget as well as special conditional grants and private grants considering location as well as economic status.

Wildeman points out:

In a budget that has so few additional resources, the gap between policy and planning processes on the one hand and available funding on the other hand is powerfully accentuated. Resources must be found to enable conditional grants to be better spent; to provide capital and infrastructure resources to FET institutions; to match the expansion of ECD services with meaningful financial resources; to provide crucial non-personnel and capital support to the ELSEN programme; to develop more meaningful ABET estimates and funding; and to sustain funding gains in public ordinary schools.

The present set of budget proposals suggests that the gap is unlikely to be closed in the medium term.

The present set of budget proposals suggest that the gap is unlikely to be closed in the medium term.

Sub theme: Costs of transport

Wheeler points out:

In a budget that has so few additional resources, the gap between policy and planning processes on the other hand is powerfully accentuated. Resources must be found to enable conditional grants to be better spent; to provide capital and infrastructure resources to FET institutions; to match the expansion of ECD services with meaningful financial resources; to provide crucial non-personnel and capital support to the ELSEN programme; to develop more meaningful ABET estimates and funding; and to sustain funding gains in public ordinary schools.

An interesting side issue arises when one considers funding social development projects such as School Feeding. Currently mothers do the cooking, but limited funds result in their being exploited as they are engaged as volunteers, and given an honorarium. To obviate this, the School Feeding Directorate is introducing a different funding model based on stimulating the establishment of CBOs that produce fresh produce and introduce community bakeries.

Conclusion

It is apparent that environmental features of rural areas, as well as ways in which learners, their families and the broader community have to deal with poverty, entail higher costs compared with schools in formal and informal urban areas, even those that facing similar levels of impoverishment. Therefore, it is perhaps timely to investigate current procedures with respect to allocations for redress funding derived from the state budget as well as special conditional grants and private grants considering location as well as economic status.

Wildeman points out:

In a budget that has so few additional resources, the gap between policy and planning processes on the one hand and available funding on the other hand is powerfully accentuated. Resources must be found to enable conditional grants to be better spent; to provide capital and infrastructure resources to FET institutions; to match the expansion of ECD services with meaningful financial resources; to provide crucial non-personnel and capital support to the ELSEN programme; to develop more meaningful ABET estimates and funding; and to sustain funding gains in public ordinary schools.

The present set of budget proposals suggests that the gap is unlikely to be closed in the medium term.25

How much greater are the needs in the neglected rural areas?

The direction set in the DoE's "Plan of Action" has led to greater effort in addressing infrastructure backlogs but the impact of increased expenditure is not yet known as they have not been subjected to a thorough assessment of capital spending. Wildeman in fact maintains that provincial education expenditure is in the throes of adjusting to smaller spending margins as reflected in consolidated provincial education expenditure's declining share of total provincial expenditure, indicating that in future less funding will be available, and in the case of the Eastern Cape, a budget that is significantly lower than its previous levels.26

Sub theme: Costs of transport

Within the climate of real constraints, provinces are unable to provide the funds to transport learners to school.

The number of learners in the province, the number of learners receiving transport, the level of costs in rural areas and the state of roads in rural areas all influence the size of the transport budget required by the schools. Provincial submissions indicate that all provinces have run into issues of providing all eligible learners with transport. Clearing the backlog of unprovided transport is yet another problem that has been experienced in many provinces. The difficulty of calculating these costs is different for provinces.

The relative costs of transport and hostel accommodation is a key factor when considering how provinces can facilitate access to school for rural learners. The difficulty of calculating these costs is different for provinces.

23 For example, transport for Learners with Special Education Needs will be more expensive in rural than in urban areas.

24 Nationally, provincial education departments managed to spend 80.3 per cent of grant funding in 2002/03, and 87.3 per cent in 2003/04. The only provincial education department that did not make sufficient headway on life skills and HIV/AIDS spending is the Eastern Cape. In 2002/03, it managed to spend only 41 per cent of its allocation, while in 2003/04, approximately 44 per cent of its allocation had been spent. (Wildeman, ibid., p. 20).
Current status

Sub theme: Access to school

Recommendation 16: A modified BMP must cover development as well as operational costs for the delivery of education in rural areas. The utility made when costing a BMP so that costs cater for rural settings.

Sub theme: Introducing a more progressive funding approach

Recommendation 13: A ring-fenced redress funding through a special conditional grant should be made available for the rural school sector in the immediate future. The grant should cover various projects and human resource needs discussed in the recommendations made throughout this report. The rural task team, discussed below (Theme 8), will be responsible for determining the establishment of the grant and its operation.

Recommendation 15: Incorporate specific rural cost drivers into the design of a BMP as a means of ensuring equity of access and quality of learning in rural and urban contexts.

Recommendation 14: Ring-fenced redress funding through a special conditional grant should be made available for the rural school sector in the immediate future. The grant should cover various projects and human resource needs discussed in the recommendations made throughout this report. The rural task team, discussed below (Theme 8), will be responsible for determining the establishment of the grant and its operation.

Recommendation 12: Compare the costs of accessing school, categorising the most significant rural milieus in South Africa, covering transport costs and hostel accommodation.

Recommendation 11: A modelled BMP must cover development as well as operational costs for transport costs and hostel accommodation.

Recommendation 10: Identify the key drivers of educational costs and effectively cost all programs.

Recommendation 9: Develop a modified BMP that will ensure that the rural school sector is adequately funded.

Recommendation 8: Develop an in-depth analysis of the educational costs of learners in rural areas compared to urban areas.

Recommendation 7: Identify key drivers of educational costs such as teacher conditions of service, facility conditions, security, transport, curriculum, grants and so on, and cost each separately.

Recommendation 6: Develop a modified BMP that will ensure that the rural school sector is adequately funded.

Recommendation 5: Identify the key drivers of educational costs and effectively cost all programs.

Recommendation 4: Develop a modified BMP that will ensure that the rural school sector is adequately funded.

Recommendation 3: Identify the key drivers of educational costs and effectively cost all programs.

Recommendation 2: Identify the key drivers of educational costs and effectively cost all programs.

Recommendation 1: Identify the key drivers of educational costs and effectively cost all programs.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Leaving school to work is common amongst girls and boys particularly those living on farms. Coupled with the growing rate of teenage pregnancy, said to be partially attributable to the availability of the Child Grant, creative ways of encouraging learners to remain at schools should be explored.

Recommendation 17: Introduce pilot programmes in quintile 1 schools on commercial farms and in TA areas to explore the ways in which incentives may be used to ensure learners remain at school. (This recommendation has links with Theme 7.)

Sub theme: Different modalities of schooling

The Huntington Trust comprises a Community Development Forum, a representative body of all the members of the Trust.

The Huntington Trust is a Community Development Trust.

Box 3 Coordinating Community Resources: The Huntington Trust

The Huntington Trust comprises a Community Development Trust.

The Huntington Trust comprises a Community Development Trust.

Current status

Levelling the playing fields across advantaged and disadvantaged schools with rural districts and between rural and urban areas requires that SGBs are able to access funds to kick-start, operate and maintain school development programmes.

Recommendation 20: Consider current provincial expenditure on transport and hostels to ascertain expenditure levels needed to ensure access to learners living specified distances from schools.

Recommendation 21: Examine current expenditure levels on multi-purpose/community/public learning centres to establish resources required for their efficient and effective operation.

Recommendation 22: Initiate a study on the costs of introducing in communities an integrated and holistic agricultural learning programme that includes food production to enhance food security for adults, agricultural science in the GET and FET bands, and ABET programmes on primary and secondary level. The study should assess the feasibility of introducing such programmes and determine the costs of implementing them.

Recommendation 19: Examine the costs of introducing distance education programmes for learners and educators at schools in remote areas based on international and South African best practices.

Recommendation 18: Sharpen understanding of the costs of different modalities of schooling including nodal and satellite schools, mobile units, etc.

Recommendation 17: Introduce pilot programmes in quintile 1 schools on commercial farms and in TA areas to explore the ways in which incentives may be used to ensure learners remain at school. (This recommendation has links with Theme 7.)

Sub theme: Different modalities of schooling

The Huntington Trust comprises a Community Development Trust.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

All the adults living in Huntington own the Huntington Trust, having a vote and an account as an owner. Membership of the Huntington Trust entitles members to:

- Cash dividends paid out when ‘profit’ is earned by its businesses. This could include the rent of land, of buildings or of orchards and woodlots after maintenance and other costs have been deducted.
- ‘Use Rights’ are issued every year or season equally to all members to garden, to graze, to farm on irrigated land, to cut or receive firewood and timber etc.

By buying and selling these User Rights, members are able to learn what their membership is worth.

Box 4 Coordinating Community Resources: The Social Change Assistance Trust (Scat)

Coordinating Community resources: The Social Change Assistance Trust (Scat)

Scat is an independent funding and development agency, supporting community-controlled development projects in rural areas. Scat’s vision is to forge partnerships so that rural people work with their own skills and indigenous knowledge for their own survival. Scat works in partnership with grassroots organisations, offering support on organisational development and capacity building. Scat’s field workers provide support to enable organisations to meet their own programme objectives and unpaid community-based committee members and other volunteers contribute to the local agencies. Efforts have mainly been directed towards needs identification, creating development plans, and capacity development and networking. Scat is an independent funding and development agency, supporting community-controlled development projects in rural areas.

Recommendation 22: Create a school development fund for SGBs operating in impoverished environments to kick start development projects at their schools.

A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Theme 3: The size and shape of education in rural areas

Current status and challenges

The current status of rural schooling in South Africa is characterized by a variety of factors that have led to the establishment of a complex system of education. Settlement patterns range from sparsely populated remote areas and villages to densely settled areas. Rapid shifts in demographic patterns as people migrate towards urban areas or other rural areas have further complicated the situation. Haphazard decision-making processes in the past have led to many anomalies in the placement of schools and the grade levels offered. Access is impeded by poor road and communication systems.

Tensions around issues of the size and shape of the rural school system reveal a number of concerns:

1. Settlement patterns form separate, isolated rural areas and villages, which have led to many anomalies in the placement of schools and the grade levels offered.
2. Rapid shifts in demographic patterns as people migrate towards urban areas or other rural areas have further complicated the situation.
3. Haphazard decision-making processes in the past have led to many anomalies in the placement of schools and the grade levels offered.
4. Access is impeded by poor road and communication systems.

Small schools are one of the major issues facing rural education. Despite the close proximity of homes to schools, learners still have to walk long distances to school. Limited budgets mean that small schools cannot offer a full range of learning area choices, have limited potential to service specialized educational needs, and may have a poor range of learning and teaching support materials. Most small schools have multi-grade classes, which have become a feature of rural schools as they struggle with limited resources to increase the number of grades offered. In many cases, these small schools are the only schools available to learners in remote and rural areas.

Seven grades in small rural schools:

While it is clear that economies of scale are achieved with larger schools, these savings are outweighed by the need to address the needs of small schools. In rural areas, where a high proportion of the population is rural, small schools are the only option for many learners. However, some commentators argue that small schools encourage democratic participation in school governance and are more flexible in responding to local needs.

Small schools and multi-grade classes:

While it is clear that economies of scale are achieved with larger schools, these savings are outweighed by the need to address the needs of small schools. In rural areas, where a high proportion of the population is rural, small schools are the only option for many learners. However, some commentators argue that small schools encourage democratic participation in school governance and are more flexible in responding to local needs.

Economies of scale with larger schools:

While it is clear that economies of scale are achieved with larger schools, these savings are outweighed by the need to address the needs of small schools. In rural areas, where a high proportion of the population is rural, small schools are the only option for many learners. However, some commentators argue that small schools encourage democratic participation in school governance and are more flexible in responding to local needs.

Small schools and multi-grade classes:

While it is clear that economies of scale are achieved with larger schools, these savings are outweighed by the need to address the needs of small schools. In rural areas, where a high proportion of the population is rural, small schools are the only option for many learners. However, some commentators argue that small schools encourage democratic participation in school governance and are more flexible in responding to local needs.

Economies of scale with larger schools:

While it is clear that economies of scale are achieved with larger schools, these savings are outweighed by the need to address the needs of small schools. In rural areas, where a high proportion of the population is rural, small schools are the only option for many learners. However, some commentators argue that small schools encourage democratic participation in school governance and are more flexible in responding to local needs.

Small schools and multi-grade classes:

While it is clear that economies of scale are achieved with larger schools, these savings are outweighed by the need to address the needs of small schools. In rural areas, where a high proportion of the population is rural, small schools are the only option for many learners. However, some commentators argue that small schools encourage democratic participation in school governance and are more flexible in responding to local needs.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

The costs of infrastructure and transport assistance schemes must be factored into planning. In many cases, the design and cost of building schools to standard in rural areas is prohibitive; furthermore these schools are subject to enrolment patterns that can shift rapidly. A more flexible and cost-effective approach to school buildings is required. In addition, school design should take note of the learning needs of learners. Recommendations that follow take account of learners' evolving social, cognitive and physical needs and particularly those of OVCs (who require special consideration in poorly resourced rural areas) as they advance through the system.

Sub theme: Schools in dense settlements: A three-tier system

In dense settlements, it is suggested that improving access for compulsory schooling is best achieved by extending schools to provide Gr R - Gr 9 classes. Access to FET provision should be extended and improved by ensuring that learners have the option of attending FET schools or colleges that are linked to various work opportunities or entrance to higher education through hostels and/or transport assistance.

Recommendation 24: Through an examination of combined schools, assess the viability of a two-tier system (Grades R - Grade 9; Grade 10 - Grade 12) in dense settlement areas.

Sub theme: Schools in dispersed settlements: A two-tier system

In dispersed settlements, various work opportunities or access to higher education hostels or transport assistance schemes enable learners to follow the curriculum of different levels of education. Recommendations follow on how to create more efficient, cost-effective education in dispersed areas, where schools are more isolated and need to be more flexible. The provision of transport could allow a similar model to the national nutrition programme with the provision of transport assistance. Providing access to a range of FET subjects and the option to continue learning for learners who live too far away from a school is essential.

The second tier would be the immediate and smaller phases of the GET band. The first tier would be foundation phase schools (Grade R - Grade 3) so that young learners could remain with their families. Programming needs of the community, cultural activities, etc. would be more flexible and could be offered in smaller, more culturally coherent and more cost-effective ways. The design and cost of building schools to standard in rural areas is prohibitive; furthermore these schools are subject to enrolment patterns that can shift rapidly. A more flexible and cost-effective approach to school buildings is required. In addition, school design should take note of the learning needs of learners. Recommendations that follow take account of learners' evolving social, cognitive and physical needs and particularly those of OVCs (who require special consideration in poorly resourced rural areas) as they advance through the system.

Recommendation 25: Through an examination of combined schools, assess the viability of a two-tier system (Grades R - Grade 9; Grade 10 - Grade 12) in dense settlement areas.

The costs of infrastructure and transport assistance schemes must be factored into planning. In many cases, the design and cost of building schools to standard in rural areas is prohibitive; furthermore these schools are subject to enrolment patterns that can shift rapidly. A more flexible and cost-effective approach to school buildings is required. In addition, school design should take note of the learning needs of learners. Recommendations that follow take account of learners' evolving social, cognitive and physical needs and particularly those of OVCs (who require special consideration in poorly resourced rural areas) as they advance through the system.

Recommendation 26: Through an examination of combined schools, assess the viability of a two-tier system (Grades R - Grade 9; Grade 10 - Grade 12) in dense settlement areas.
Recommendation 25:
Plan the introduction of a three-tier system of schooling where communities live in dispersed settlement patterns or on farms. The tiers are: a Foundation Phase school situated close to households; intermediate and senior phases; FET schools and colleges requiring hostel accommodation and/or transport.

Recommendation 26:
The DoE, in consultation with provinces, to develop guidelines on providing hostel accommodation and subsidized transport for the two and three tier systems.

Recommendation 27:
The DoE to develop guidelines to build the capacity to organise multi-grade classes.

Recommendation 28:
The DoE, in consultation with provinces and NGOs, to develop guidelines on managing small schools that include a special focus on schools with multi-grade classes. Issues to be covered include: restructuring and school design and management of schools, coordination of infrastructure development, issues of access to educational infrastructure, and use of ICT.

Sub theme: Can ICT enrich learning?

It is important to consider alternatives to formal schooling. The use of ICT in other countries has been found to enrich the learning environment of small schools, reducing the need for state transport schemes and hostels. For example, the University of Fort Hare distance education programme for educators includes classroom visits and weekend sessions as part of the curriculum. The use of ICT in other countries has been found to enrich the learning environment of small schools.

Recommendation 29:
Explore South African and international best practices that provide learners in rural schools increased educational access through ICT (internet, radio, television, learning support materials).

Recommendation 30:
Explore South African and international best practices that provide professional development support for educators in rural areas through ICT.

Recommendation 31:
Enterprise: focus on building community capacity in the implementation of the recommendations and guidelines developed.

Recommendation 32:
The DoE, in consultation with provinces, to develop guidelines on accommodation and transport for rural schools and colleges requiring hostel accommodation to be built.

Recommendation 33:
The DoE, in consultation with provinces, to develop guidelines on providing access to educational infrastructure assistance.

Recommendation 34:
The DoE to provide guidelines for the development of a three-tier system of schooling where communities have multi-grade classes, including guidelines on planning and design, construction and management of schools.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Governing these centres is problematical, however, as the use of classrooms for two distinct sets of learners may lead to conflict regarding ownership and maintenance. Current policy states that there should be two governing bodies: one for the school, and one for the public learning centre. It is possible that these should be conflated into one body so that there is one structure responsible for maintaining and developing the school.

Recommendation 31: Examine the effectiveness of present regulations relating to the governance structures of public learning and community centres and explore whether these should be amended to encourage the broader community to take responsibility for the building, its maintenance and development activities.

Recommendation 32: Investigate the potential opportunities provided by community learning centres/multi-purpose community centres for communities on farms or in remote settlements.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Theme 4: Governance and management

Current status and challenges

It appears that management and administration procedures commonly supported by the national and provincial departments are best suited to urban landscapes where the school is in close contact with a range of facilities and services, and where communication between these and learners' homes is not an issue. There are many instances of provinces developing creative responses to the problem of management capacity, but these tend to be limited in scope and coverage. The introduction of the Integrated Quality Management System and the growing use of 'cluster' approaches to school support could have a significant impact in rural areas, especially when combined with the rolling out of ICT. However, it is clear that many schools are still struggling to manage their affairs effectively.

Departmental district support

The cracks in the governance and management of rural schools are particularly problematic at district levels that do not have the resources to facilitate school management and governance. Public submissions expressed dismay at the lack of adequate support provided by district offices:

- "In many provinces there are district offices that are simply not functioning." (A teacher union).
- "The district offices are not able to support the schools in rural areas effectively." (School principal).
- "Review the system of support via district offices with the understanding that district offices need to be adequately resourced to function effectively." (A teacher union).

Support functions are impacted by resource challenges. Turnover of district staff is high, with the result that too few learning area advisors are available across all learning areas, and administrative capacity is poor. District officials also have limited access to cars for visiting schools in remote areas. Technical difficulties such as these may be relatively easily addressed, provided the funds are available. For example, administrative services for schools could be provided either through a hub or mobile service including photocopying and supplies, and vehicles could be made available for a district office to visit schools in rural areas.

Limited capacity and inadequate funding are, however, only one aspect of a complex and challenging situation. South African schooling is characterised by inherited inequalities and great diversity. The CEPD’s Education 2000 Plus project illustrates significant differences across provinces with respect to the frequency of district visits to schools, the purpose of visits, and the scope of their involvement with schools. It appears as if decisions on district structure and function have been based on the contextual demands of a particular province. There are instances of provinces developing creative responses to the problem of management capacity, but these tend to be limited in scope and coverage. The introduction of the Integrated Quality Management System and the growing use of 'cluster' approaches to school support could have a significant impact in rural areas, especially when combined with the rolling out of ICT. However, it is clear that many schools are still struggling to manage their affairs effectively.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Implementation, checking compliance, and sometimes solving problems. On a more positive note, many district offices reported a trusting relationship with school principals.

There is common understanding that district offices are the primary agents of support. Nevertheless, their position at the interface between school and department leaves them in an ambivalent position with uneasy tensions: Do they take their mandate from their head office or from schools? At present, according to Narsee (op cit) centralist tendencies prevail as district officers appear to struggle to adopt facilitative roles supporting school development. As they do not have decision-making powers, schools have to go to the province and not their district if they have difficulties. In general, it is apparent that district officials have to tread carefully to avoid being seen as ‘inspectors’, a role which would thrust them into playing a policy function, transmitting information and urging compliance rather than offering active support.

Future debates should revolve around efficiency as this relates to the layering of administrative and management functions, the model of district delivery best suited to rural districts, and different resourcing strategies that will enable district offices to meet the needs of schools.

(b) Community involvement

A teacher union observes that: “… most of our policies do not speak to the challenges experienced by teachers, learners, parents and other stakeholders in rural communities”. It is apparent that the constitution of School Governing Bodies, as laid out in the South African Schools Act, may not be the most suitable for rural communities. Current governance policies do not take note of existing organisations in communities and do not draw on their expertise. As a result, it is often the most marginalised members of the community, usually the women, who serve on these bodies and yet do not have the support (or endorsement) of their community.

Abolishing fees is a key step in the right direction. Achieving educational equality is far beyond the reach of many in rural schools. Current arrangements for rural communities, seen through the lens of existing structures for rural communities, require the immediate education of all parties in the community so that there is buy-in from all sectors. Engaging school communities is a source of strength for school development.

Sub theme: Clarifying roles and responsibilities in districts and schools

The Nelson Mandela Foundation research 33 points to the importance of the community’s role in sustaining educational endeavours in rural areas. Communities have the capacity to make pertinent decisions about education, and it is clear that communities believe schooling is a source of strength for their community as a whole and is crucial if their children are to develop their potential.

Box 5 The need for role clarification

A key submission stated that the model of schools raising funds for their own development cannot be equated to community involvement. In most rural communities, district offices have the capacity to make sustained investments in educational and management capacities. The need for role clarification is evident in the following submission.

District offices needed a trusting relationship with school principals.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Recommendation 33:
Hold workshops with national and provincial officials to discuss the role of district offices in rural schooling and how district officials and school management teams can be capacitated to meet their responsibilities. Develop a plan of action to meet the recommendations arising from this process.

Recommendation 34:
The responsibilities of district offices and officials must be aligned with the needs of rural schools, and resources allocated accordingly. This must take account of their responsibilities with regard to Section 20 and Section 21 schools and whether the categorisation of schools as either Section 20 or as Section 21 is a useful one for schools in rural areas.

Recommendation 35:
Raise awareness of district officials to new policies and programmes through various means, including regular workshops and newsletters.

Recommendation 36:
Recognising the complexity of delivery in rural areas, develop guidelines for provisioning norms for districts in rural areas based on new models of delivery. Develop guidelines regarding the capacity needed at district level to manage schools in rural areas (and particularly feasible ways of communicating with schools) taking into account their remoteness and poor array of facilities and services.

(These recommendations are linked with Theme 2 with respect to costing improvement in the capacity of district offices.)

Sub theme: Strengthening delivery

Cooperative governance — on which integrated programmes of delivery depend — has begun to show positive outcomes. There appears to be a growing consensus that SGBs and local government need to work together in the interests of the schools.

Box 6: Example of School and Community Joint Enterprise

The DEFs in the Eastern Cape Education Department, operating under [the Imbewu Project], include representation of a wide range of players such as the broader school community, district management office, SGBs, clubs and traditional cultural groups. One commentator claimed that these are steeped in indigenous knowledge. For example, the use of clan names heightens the bonding process between local government and education. 

Provinces are struggling to overcome backlogs in educational delivery, both with regard to infrastructure and the delivery of LSM. In addition to poor resources, it appears that the efficiency of district offices is seriously constrained by lack of relevant information. At a provincial level, officials reported cooperation between local government and education, but capacity constraints have hindered these efforts.

Many rural areas, unlike most urban, do not have access to the most basic facilities and services. To overcome this, some provinces have created integrated district community structures to enable communities to mobilise for essential services. Commonly this process begins with communities participating in vision-crafting exercises to prioritise the introduction of economic projects such as food gardens in non-school settings. The introduction of economic projects such as food gardens in non-school settings.

The DEFs in the Eastern Cape Education Department, operating under the Imbewu Project, include representation of a wide range of players such as the broader school community, district management office, SGBs, clubs and traditional cultural groups. One commentator claimed that these are steeped in indigenous knowledge. For example, the use of clan names heightens the bonding process between the different players. 

These recommendations are linked with Theme 2 with respect to costing improvement in the capacity of district offices.

Provisions are struggling to overcome backlogs in educational delivery, both with regard to infrastructure and the delivery of LSM. In addition to poor resources, it appears that the efficiency of district offices is seriously constrained by lack of relevant information. At a provincial level, officials reported cooperation between local government and education, but capacity constraints have hindered these efforts.

Many rural areas, unlike most urban, do not have access to the most basic facilities and services. To overcome this, some provinces have created integrated district community structures to enable communities to mobilise for essential services. Commonly this process begins with communities participating in vision-crafting exercises to prioritise the introduction of economic projects such as food gardens in non-school settings. The introduction of economic projects such as food gardens in non-school settings.

Cooperative governance — on which integrated programmes of delivery depend — has begun to show positive outcomes. There appears to be a growing consensus that SGBs and local government need to work together in the interests of the schools.

Box 6: Example of School and Community Joint Enterprise

The DEFs in the Eastern Cape Education Department, operating under the Imbewu Project, include representation of a wide range of players such as the broader school community, district management office, SGBs, clubs and traditional cultural groups. One commentator claimed that these are steeped in indigenous knowledge. For example, the use of clan names heightens the bonding process between the different players. 

These recommendations are linked with Theme 2 with respect to costing improvement in the capacity of district offices.

Provisions are struggling to overcome backlogs in educational delivery, both with regard to infrastructure and the delivery of LSM. In addition to poor resources, it appears that the efficiency of district offices is seriously constrained by lack of relevant information. At a provincial level, officials reported cooperation between local government and education, but capacity constraints have hindered these efforts.

Many rural areas, unlike most urban, do not have access to the most basic facilities and services. To overcome this, some provinces have created integrated district community structures to enable communities to mobilise for essential services. Commonly this process begins with communities participating in vision-crafting exercises to prioritise the introduction of economic projects such as food gardens in non-school settings. The introduction of economic projects such as food gardens in non-school settings.
Nevertheless, it is likely that strong leadership at district level is needed to draw these groups together in order to forge a common identity giving schools support in attaining Section 21 status or in carrying out the functions required of Section 21 schools.

Other provincial departments such as health and social development, agriculture and public works also need to participate in forums so that there can be an integration and coordination of actions that involve schools.

Coordinated action between education authorities and local government is also needed to reduce backlogs in the delivery of essential services. Facilities such as water and sanitation are essential.

Recommendation 37: The broader school communities in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making through broadly-based participatory processes including imbizos, indabas etc.

Recommendation 38: Establish guidelines for holding regular discussions at local levels (imbizos, indabas) that include all parties involved in the delivery of basic facilities and services in a district and constitute a DEF.

Recommendation 39: Discuss with SALGA best practices regarding the formulation of Integrated Development Plans (IDP) that cover the delivery of facilities and services to schools and that provide plans for operational and maintenance costs, including security. This requires resolution of the complementary roles of local government and the PEDs in delivering facilities and services, including facilities used by the broader community such as libraries and multi-purpose learning centres.

Sub theme: Support measures using local resources

Current status and challenges

There are many instances of clustering schools to ease administration, capacity building and governance. While clustering seems to offer a solution to the problems of teacher isolation, lack of resources and insufficient support for schools, questions remain as to whether it is indeed a sustainable strategy, especially for rural and deep rural schools. The costs of travel between far-flung rural schools, the time and personnel it takes to co-ordinate cluster activities, are all difficulties that clusters encounter. There seems to be principled support for the strategy for clustering schools as a means of enhancing education delivery. However, this is not matched by an equivalent and sustained level of support for other measures of improving education delivery. This may be due to the perception that electricity is needed at schools.

Recommendation 40: Research and monitor best practices regarding school clusters and how these can be relayed to all schools and districts.

Recommendation 32: Engage with the broader school community through broadly-based participatory processes including imbizos.

Recommendation 31: Establish guidelines for holding regular discussions at local levels (imbizos).

Recommendation 30: Consider devolving through the PEDs a greater degree of control over the delivery of critical service to schools and to provide a clearer definition of integrated facilities.

Recommendation 29: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 28: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 27: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 26: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 25: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 24: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 23: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 22: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 21: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 20: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 19: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 18: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 17: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 16: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 15: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 14: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 13: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 12: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 11: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 10: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 9: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 8: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 7: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 6: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 5: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 4: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 3: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 2: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Recommendation 1: The broader school community in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making processes.

Box 7: Imbewu: District Professional Development Teams

District teams comprised 11 persons: an administrator and 10 professional persons. These ten persons were divided into 5 pairs, one for each of the 5 specialist areas (Languages, Mathematics, Science & Technology, Foundation Phase and EMD). One member of each pair was assigned responsibilities as the facilitator responsible for delivering workshops and cluster visits to schools. The other member was assigned responsibilities as the local facilitator responsible for delivering workshops and cluster visits to schools. This was intended to ensure that the clusters were developed in a structured manner.

Recommendation 41: Research and monitor best practices regarding school clusters and how these can be relayed to all schools and districts.

Recommendation 42: Establish guidelines for holding regular discussions at local levels (imbizos, indabas) that include all parties involved in the delivery of basic facilities and services in a district and constitute a DEF.

Recommendation 43: Discuss with SALGA best practices regarding the formulation of Integrated Development Plans (IDP) that cover the delivery of facilities and services to schools and that provide plans for operational and maintenance costs, including security. This requires resolution of the complementary roles of local government and the PEDs in delivering facilities and services, including facilities used by the broader community such as libraries and multi-purpose learning centres.

Sub theme: Support measures using local resources

Current status and challenges

There are many instances of clustering schools to ease administration, capacity building and governance. While clustering seems to offer a solution to the problems of teacher isolation, lack of resources and insufficient support for schools, questions remain as to whether it is indeed a sustainable strategy, especially for rural and deep rural schools. The costs of travel between far-flung rural schools, the time and personnel it takes to co-ordinate cluster activities, are all difficulties that clusters encounter. There seems to be principled support for the strategy for clustering schools as a means of enhancing education delivery. However, this is not matched by an equivalent and sustained level of support for other measures of improving education delivery. This may be due to the perception that electricity is needed at schools.

Recommendation 40: Research and monitor best practices regarding school clusters and how these can be relayed to all schools and districts.

Recommendation 37: The broader school communities in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making through broadly-based participatory processes including imbizos, indabas etc.

Recommendation 38: Establish guidelines for holding regular discussions at local levels (imbizos, indabas) that include all parties involved in the delivery of basic facilities and services in a district and constitute a DEF.

Recommendation 39: Consider devolving through the PEDs a greater degree of control over the delivery of critical service to schools and to provide a clearer definition of integrated facilities.

Recommendation 41: Research and monitor best practices regarding school clusters and how these can be relayed to all schools and districts.

Recommendation 42: Establish guidelines for holding regular discussions at local levels (imbizos, indabas) that include all parties involved in the delivery of basic facilities and services in a district and constitute a DEF.

Recommendation 43: Discuss with SALGA best practices regarding the formulation of Integrated Development Plans (IDP) that cover the delivery of facilities and services to schools and that provide plans for operational and maintenance costs, including security. This requires resolution of the complementary roles of local government and the PEDs in delivering facilities and services, including facilities used by the broader community such as libraries and multi-purpose learning centres.

Sub theme: Support measures using local resources

Current status and challenges

There are many instances of clustering schools to ease administration, capacity building and governance. While clustering seems to offer a solution to the problems of teacher isolation, lack of resources and insufficient support for schools, questions remain as to whether it is indeed a sustainable strategy, especially for rural and deep rural schools. The costs of travel between far-flung rural schools, the time and personnel it takes to co-ordinate cluster activities, are all difficulties that clusters encounter. There seems to be principled support for the strategy for clustering schools as a means of enhancing education delivery. However, this is not matched by an equivalent and sustained level of support for other measures of improving education delivery. This may be due to the perception that electricity is needed at schools.

Recommendation 40: Research and monitor best practices regarding school clusters and how these can be relayed to all schools and districts.

Recommendation 37: The broader school communities in rural areas must be drawn into decision-making through broadly-based participatory processes including imbizos, indabas etc.
Recommendation 41:
Relay information and best practices on the use of multipurpose community centres and public learning centres within a school district.

Sub theme: Gender issues and school safety

Current status and challenges

A recent survey illustrated that women are, relatively-speaking, under-represented on the governing bodies, especially so with respect to parent members. Educator and learner representation is more balanced. In addition, most SGB chairpersons are male. Unfortunately the findings of the study were not scrutinised to ascertain differences in composition and representation in rural and urban areas.

This undermining of women’s authority in rural communities affects women and girl children in multiple ways, such as exclusion from some learning areas, and poor performance in senior grades. Perry’s analysis of performance in the School Certificate Examination illustrated that girls’ performance at school is better than boys except amongst African girls. Further analysis is required to assess whether performance levels are lower in rural or in urban areas.

Sexual abuse is widespread across schools, and school safety is a continuing problem. Even though this is widespread across South African schools, affecting all social and economic strata, abuse and exploitation of girls is often hidden because of traditional taboos, especially concerning sexual exploitation in rural areas. Furthermore, some schools have been hesitant to report cases of sexual abuse to the authorities. Women and girl learners are often subjected to sexual abuse in schools and are sometimes required to perform sexual favours for school officials.

Recommendation 42:
Engage communities in discussions on statutory requirements with respect to the constitution of SGBs, examining whether they are regarded as legitimate agents within communities, and discussion covering the role of women and girl learners in SGBs.

Recommendation 43:
Ensure DEFs include both SGBs and local government officials to prepare action plans (some within the scope of the IDPs) to provide schools with facilities and services, taking note of gender issues and key priority areas, notably school and community safety.

Sub theme: Communication strategies

Recommendation 44:
Utilise a multi-media approach including radio and ICT to improve communication between the different tiers of management and community organisations.

Recommendation 45:
Establish cooperative governance of relevant programmes including IDPs at local levels, ensuring that DEGs and local government officers work together to improve communication between the different tiers of management and community organisations.

Sub theme: Capacity development

Current status and challenges

In not one submission or interview were positive comments made about the way in which training is taking place. There is a lack of coordination between the training offered by various agencies and the cascade model is often less effective in reaching all members of staff. An example of one underlying tension can be seen in the question: “Do teachers feel that the training they receive is relevant to their needs?”

Various strategies can be considered:

· Mobilisation and training associated with relevant projects such as environmental projects.


36 A teacher in a Kenyan project observed that the problem with the cascade model was that: “The water doesn’t reach those at the bottom of the cascade; and if it does, the water is dirty.” (Cited in Barasa, F.S., Harley, K., Masakari, W. (2002) Evaluation of the Kenyan Strengthening of Primary Education (SPRED III) Project: Second Annual Report (May/June 2002).)
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

- Mentors at district levels;
- Coordination of training amongst schools in a district with details of content and process being decided locally. (This would entail a district being awarded some sort of training budget and a list of available training organisations.
- The department must also be supported with clear and explicit expectations and objectives.

Recommendation 46:
Strengthen delivery at district levels through a multi-faceted human resource development programme as well as ensuring offices have requisite resources to engage with all schools.

Box 8 Lessons Learnt: HR Development: Imbewu Programme (Eastern Cape)

1. Human Resource Development is at the centre of many developmental efforts and may form the core of any development programme.
2. The use of full-time department counterparts in a project is a brilliant idea. But in the future, these counterparts must be fully prepared. They must be trained, given specific responsibilities and properly mentored and coached along the way. A supervisory structure within the department must be established with clear and explicit responsibilities.
3. Not all programmes could be fully integrated into the department at the same time, and at the same rate and in the same manner. The capacity in the department, human and structurally, differs greatly. In some cases, the department may not be ready to integrate.
4. Integration of programmes must be fully integrated into the department at the same pace and at the same rate; and in the same manner. The capacity in the department human and structurally differs greatly. In some cases, the department may not be ready to integrate.
5. New governmental policies related to human resource development, for instance, cannot be ignored whether or not it fits into the project brief. The key demands on the department must sometimes dictate the flow of project events if the project must be fully integrated into the department.
6. Integration of programmes into the department is a process in which the department and the project must make commitments. The department must establish the structure and must allocate personnel so that programmes could be economically managed within the existing framework.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Theme 5: Curriculum reform

Current status and challenges

The following challenges with respect to curriculum issues are features of South African schooling generally. However, although not unique to rural education and farm schools, they are all experienced most acutely in the rural context.

Current status and challenges

The importance of curriculum

Although the curriculum is the lifeblood of schooling, it is seldom accorded priority status. In fact, the C2005 Review37 found it necessary to re-assert the centrality of curriculum to the education system. If public submissions to the MCRE are any indication, curriculum issues are even further on the margins of thinking about rural education compared to ‘mainstream’ education. Submissions placed much more emphasis on issues of equity, access and human rights than on curriculum, learning and teaching. The single most powerful recommendation to emerge from the submissions was the need to improve and equalise facilities and resources. With rural schools being deficient on every indicator of material provision — e.g. physical space and amenities such as electricity and running water, libraries, textbooks, the safety of learners — it appears as if curriculum issues are almost completely overshadowed by the more immediate and pressing need for resources to enable effective teaching and learning to take place.38

C2005 implementation difficulties

A large body of research indicates that the introduction of C2005 in all schools is proving difficult. In addition to the need for appropriate resources for its introduction, it requires substantial changes in the mindset of educators and school managers. Despite the best will and policies in the world, an education system has unintentionally emerged that privileges a deracialised middle class.40

If development and equity are to be achieved in rural settings, it is imperative that C2005 is addressed in a way that enhances the quality of teaching and learning. Curriculum measures need to be supported by Departmental endeavour and teacher development (areas in which rural schools are yet again poorly served, see Theme 6).

School curriculum and lifelong learning

There is a particular need to conceptualise the school curriculum within a lifelong learning framework. Studies such as the Nelson Mandela Foundation research41 have pointed to the need for further investigation into the possible elaboration of the curriculum of rural schools in such a way that lifelong learning is made available to all community members, and in particular, those most disadvantaged by apartheid — rural women.

Local knowledges

An assessment is needed of the ways in which learning programmes might appropriately include local knowledges in a way that enhances the quality of teaching and learning. Curriculum needs to be supported by departmental effort and teacher development (areas in which rural schools are yet again poorly served, see Theme 6).

Information communication technologies

Various international and South African programmes have illustrated that communication technologies can effectively reduce the effects of distance on learning. As such, they provide opportunities to address some of the problems associated with teaching in rural settings.

School curriculum and lifelong learning

Local knowledges

Information communication technologies
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

remoteness and isolation. For example:

The Multi-media Rural Initiative is presented as a sophisticated and high tech intervention that is at the same time appropriate for the rural contexts for which it was designed. This promising project has already reached into rural areas, combining professional development with support for clusters of schools and communities around them. The project is also linked to poverty alleviation and serves as a vehicle for other projects such as ‘Combating HIV/AIDS’.

The challenge is to create an environment that allows Information Communication Technologies to take root in communities that have not yet had opportunities to engage in such technologies.

Medium of instruction

"Most schools in rural areas are implementing language policies that reflect ‘dominant’ cultures and social groups. For example, most of these schools have English as a language of teaching and learning”.

For many learners in rural areas, English is a foreign language heard only at school. For most of their educators too, English is a second language. The use of English as a medium of instruction is often yet a further barrier to learning for rural children. Changes to existing language policy may be necessary with more use of mother-tongue instruction in the foundation grades and innovative approaches to switching to English as medium of instruction (such as more strategic use of code-switching) as the learner progresses.

Complicating the issue of medium of instruction is the fact that it brings two important principles into potential tension with each other. On the one hand, mother tongue instruction has pedagogical advantages. On the other, non-English speaking parents exercising their democratic rights appear to opt for English as medium of instruction. “English still shapes conceptions of what is desired”. The difficulty of resolving this tension was evident in several of the public submissions on rural education. One school principal, for example, noted that: “It is a bad system that does not make mother-tongue instruction the norm in public schools … Many of our parents are unable to communicate in English yet demand that their children are taught from Grade 0 to Grade 1 in English.”

One provincial authority reports that: “We try to implement mother-tongue instruction so that learners can learn and be taught in Mother-tongue eg. Isi-Xhosa. We tried it at Voorwaarts near Riversdale where 2 teachers were provided, but parents took away their kids to an Afrikaans-medium school after 2 years of implementation.”

Sub theme: Facilitating the implementation of C2005

Recommendation 47: Introduce a coordinated programme of teacher development that includes on-site school support and an adequate supply of LSMs (see also Theme 6).

Recommendation 48: Ensure district offices and officials have the capacity to support C2005 at schools, either to individual schools or at CLCs/nodal schools (see also Theme 4).

Sub theme: Raising community awareness of the vision of C2005, and of potential involvement in enacting the curriculum

Recommendation 49: Raise the awareness of the broader rural school community regarding different curriculum options (particularly language of learning options), and of possible community involvement in enacting the curriculum.

Box 9 Community involvement in enacting the curriculum

...there are in fact many resources for OBE and the NRCS in each community. What is needed, therefore, is a means to find ways of taking these resources available to the schools so that the teachers can turn them into learning materials within the framework of the curriculum.

What is meant by resources? In each village and community there are people with useful knowledge and skills. There are 40 Chisholm, L. 2004. Introduction. In L. Chisholm (Ed.) Changing class: Education and social change in post-apartheid South Africa. Cape Town: HSRC Press.


Nelson Mandela Foundation, ibid.

Overview and Analysis of Submissions made to the Ministerial Committee of Rural Education, November, 2004. Appendix D.


The Multi-media Rural Initiative is presented as a sophisticated and high tech intervention that is at the same time appropriate for the rural contexts for which it was designed. This promising project has already reached into rural areas, combining professional development with support for clusters of schools and communities around them. The project is also linked to poverty alleviation and serves as a vehicle for other projects such as ‘Combating HIV/AIDS’.

The challenge is to create an environment that allows Information Communication Technologies to take root in communities that have not yet had opportunities to engage in such technologies.

For many learners in rural areas, English is a foreign language heard only at school. For most of their educators too, English is a second language. The use of English as a medium of instruction is often yet a further barrier to learning for rural children. Changes to existing language policy may be necessary with more use of mother-tongue instruction in the foundation grades and innovative approaches to switching to English as medium of instruction (such as more strategic use of code-switching) as the learner progresses.

Complicating the issue of medium of instruction is the fact that it brings two important principles into potential tension with each other. On the one hand, mother tongue instruction has pedagogical advantages. On the other, non-English speaking parents exercising their democratic rights appear to opt for English as medium of instruction. “English still shapes conceptions of what is desired”. The difficulty of resolving this tension was evident in several of the public submissions on rural education. One school principal, for example, noted that: “It is a bad system that does not make mother-tongue instruction the norm in public schools … Many of our parents are unable to communicate in English yet demand that their children are taught from Grade 0 to Grade 1 in English.”

One provincial authority reports that: “We try to implement mother-tongue instruction so that learners can learn and be taught in Mother-tongue eg. Isi-Xhosa. We tried it at Voorwaarts near Riversdale where 2 teachers were provided, but parents took away their kids to an Afrikaans-medium school after 2 years of implementation.”

Sub theme: Facilitating the implementation of C2005

Recommendation 47: Introduce a coordinated programme of teacher development that includes on-site school support and an adequate supply of LSMs (see also Theme 6).

Recommendation 48: Ensure district offices and officials have the capacity to support C2005 at schools, either to individual schools or at CLCs/nodal schools (see also Theme 4).

Sub theme: Raising community awareness of the vision of C2005, and of possible community involvement in enacting the curriculum

Recommendation 49: Raise the awareness of the broader rural school community regarding different curriculum options (particularly language of learning options), and of possible community involvement in enacting the curriculum.

"...there are in fact many resources for OBE and the NRCS in each community. What is needed, therefore, is a means to find ways of taking these resources available to the schools so that the teachers can use them to promote learning within the framework of the curriculum.

What is meant by resources? In each village and community there are people with useful knowledge and skills. There are 40 Chisholm, L. 2004. Introduction. In L. Chisholm (Ed.) Changing class: Education and social change in post-apartheid South Africa. Cape Town: HSRC Press.


Nelson Mandela Foundation, ibid.

Overview and Analysis of Submissions made to the Ministerial Committee of Rural Education, November, 2004. Appendix D.

A New Vision for Rural Schooling

active and retired professionals, there are community historians, there are young people with post-matric qualifications, there are poets and writers and dancers and musicians, there are healers, there are people with many different kinds of experience, there are business people and so on. There are also multiple kinds of object, book, cultural artefact, picture, family heirloom and other examples of interest and value that might be used for learning. … A Community Education Forum should be established to be a platform for engagement by the community in the education and schooling of its children.

Sub theme: Meeting diverse needs: An integrated and inclusive programme of agricultural education utilising indigenous knowledges where appropriate

Current status and challenges

Provinces differ with respect to the contribution of agriculture to their GDP and to the proportion of rural populations engaging in subsistence farming as an essential element of their household economy. However, subsistence farming of various kinds is practised by almost all families in rural areas.

Agricultural education was an unpopular option during apartheid times. Nevertheless, in close conjunction with environmental issues, it is an important confluence of community interests and priorities. The proposed approach is an integrated one, allowing for synergy between community subsistence farming, food gardens for school feeding, and income-generating initiatives, and agricultural science as a learning area. If taught within the spirit of environmental sustainability (which means to create more sustainable alternatives to resource depletion and degradation) ought to be an important dimension of education in rural areas. " (Rhodes University Environmental Education and Sustainability Unit).

Indigenous knowledges are vulnerable to marginalisation if unsupported by appropriate institutional and curricular strategies. Throughout all systems of education there are instances of the cultural specificity of knowledges legitimised and sustained in assessment practices. The box below illustrates this phenomenon with reference to Namibia.

Box 11 Cultural hegemony in assessment

The only payments to the communities (less than 0.001% of the profits) were for the manual labour involved.

Box 10 Indigenous knowledge in medicine

... the annual world market for medicines derived from medicinal plants discovered from indigenous peoples amounted to US$ 43 billion in 1985; of the 119 drugs developed from plants and on the world market today, it is estimated that 74% were discovered from a pool of traditional herbal medicines (Laird 1994: 145-149); at the beginning of the 1990s, worldwide sales of pharmaceuticals amounted to more than US$130,000 billion annually;

... plant derived prescription drugs in the US market originate from 40 species of which 20 are from the tropics. The 20 species from the tropics generate about US$4 billion for the economy of the USA; the only payments to the communities (less than 0.001% of the profits) were for the manual labour involved.

Box 1 Cultural hegemony in assessment

This confluence between a cultural bias, the obfuscation of learner’s life choices and actual and concrete violation of human rights is best captured in an evaluation report conducted for the Namibian Ministry of Education and Culture in 1994. The study monitored the content of the junior secondary certificate examination in 1993 for cultural bias. The result was disgraceful to say the least. It showed that the examination in the home science subject had a clear cultural bias towards urban living and European food. All the illustrations were of Europeans or European home environments; all the recipes were of European food. There was nothing in the examination paper indicating that the actual examination was from Namibia, let alone Africa. When it came to the examination paper in accounting it drew on a variety of cultural settings but nearly all persons mentioned were males. When it came to the examination paper in art it was found that only 16% of the 100 marks could be earned on anything to do with Namibia. Eighty four percent (84%) of the marks were devoted to European art history. Likewise the examination paper in music was dreadful in cultural bias. Of 100 marks, 74 could be gained on specifically European music. When it comes to an examination paper in music with themes from Europe, only 5% of the marks were devoted to non-European music and only 5% of the candidates could be expected to be able to write about music in an African context. What is more, many of the questions were not only Euro-centric but also Euro-exclusive. There were also multiple kinds ofCLICK TO EXIT
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Permeates the tissue and fabric of existence only 10 marks out of 100 focused on specifically African music and 16 on culturally neutral music theory. Only male composers were referred to. The history paper was, however, praised for promoting awareness of Namibian and African history but criticized for making women and their contribution to history invisible. The monitoring paper concludes:

...with only a token to Namibian or African art, this examination continues the cultural disinheritance of Namibia, strongly criticized in Ministry documents, and counter to Ministry policy. The examination paper as a whole is also devoid of gender awareness.

The monitoring of exams in Namibia goes on and a small improvement in the examination papers set in the year 1995 has been observed.

Recommendation 50:
Engage in discussions at DEF levels (see Theme 4) regarding the agricultural practices of communities and how these can be supported by district education offices.

Recommendation 51:
Engage the broader school community in discussions regarding how agriculture and other related service industries can support the local economy and perhaps reduce the drift to urban areas by encouraging the community to adopt a mindset that allows them to realize the potential of their own areas for development.

Recommendation 52:
Collaboration between Department of Agriculture, the DoE and PEDs regarding strengthening agricultural output in rural communities specifically relating to the forms of education required to build understanding of the relationships between indigenous and other forms of production.

Sub theme: NGO-driven curriculum reform

Current status and challenges

NGOs have been heavily involved in a wide range of education initiatives, resulting in perceptions such as:

- NGOs are development-oriented and are better equipped to reach the poor, especially in rural areas that are not served by the public sector.
- Members of NGOs are frequently members of the population that the NGO is serving, consequently they identify more easily with the needs of the target group.

How can the experiences/lessons learnt/best practices of NGOs working with educators be optimized?

Recommendation 53:
Promote dialogue between NGO and government-funded projects on C2005 to ensure professional development programmes work in tangent with each other to avoid confusion and to optimize the benefits of all programmes. (Measures to follow through this recommendation would need to be mindful of perceptions that equity is compromised by targeted initiatives.)

NGO models of such curriculum support appear in the boxes below:

Box 12: MiET: Ikhwezi Project

In this project there is support for curriculum integration into a broad development thrust in the community.

The Multi Media Rural Initiative (MMRI) is a partnership project between the Royal Netherlands Embassy, KZNDoE, the MultiChoice Africa Foundation and the Media in Education Trust. It made significant progress towards developing 15 deep-rural RAIN distribution points and clusters. Establishment of school clusters around nodal points:

- Development of District Development Teams (DDT).
- Providing Information Technology (IT) Training.
- Development of Educators' Educational Training (DET) Program.
- Developing the Multimedia Learning Environment (MLE) for rural areas.
- Providing the Rural Information Network (RAIN) (multi-choice.

A multi-choice rural initiative (MiET) is a partnership project between the Royal Netherlands Embassy, KZNDoE, and the Media in Education Trust. The multi-choice rural initiative (MiET) is a support for curriculum integration into a broad development thrust in the community.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Box 13

Imbewu, Eastern Cape

Imbewu is a Departmental Project, driven and owned by the DOE and funded by DfID. It sees Practice Based Inquiry as crucial in implementing a curriculum in a collaborative and reflective way, with educators involved in constructing their own understanding of national documents and evaluating its appropriateness to their contexts. It also sees the work of Curriculum arising from a theory that includes Design, Implementation and Evaluation. It regards Curriculum Development and Implementation as part of an integrated thrust by the DOE. It rests its theory on a belief that Curriculum Development is part of a larger process of Transformation in Schools, one that depends on the concept of Whole School Development to ensure that all elements of school and community are involved. It sees the ownership by parents and community as essential if effective curriculum implementation is to take place. Finally, it recognises that implementation will only be effective in a model that provides for ongoing in-school Professional Development.

Outcomes: Capacity building through involvement in curriculum processes such as simplification of educator support materials, participation in a DFID Materials Development Conference, a provincial curriculum evaluation of Grades 1 and 2 educators and the merging of ideas and concepts at a Curriculum Directorate Strategic Planning Conference in 1999. An increase of trained facilitators at provincial, regional and more importantly district levels.

Lessons learnt: It is essential to see curriculum implementation as part of a larger process of Whole School Development. It is also seen that curriculum implementation in isolated learning areas cannot take place effectively until a process of School and Community Transformation has been initiated.

Although it was not easy to establish and sustain the work of inter-directorate working groups, the integration of, especially, Curriculum Development and Teacher Development is crucial in a period of intense curriculum change.

The focus of facilitation training should be at district level to ensure effective school based INSET and district teams were essential for the implementation of the project's training programme. However, the thrust of capacity building should target youths in ways that build their skills in administering sport and cultural events.

There is also evidence that School Management Teams require orientation regarding the importance of sport and culture:

"Most of the School Management Teams (SMTs) do not have a conceptual understanding of the need to invest in the educational development of their learners. … It has not been easy to get full cooperation from SMTs as we try to lobby for sport development. … SMTs need to be shown the benefits of quality training and how sport can contribute to the development of students and school in general. "

Box 14

Participation in sport as a fundamental right

We would like to point out that the UNESCO Charter of Physical Education and Sport (1978) recognised then and still advocates today that physical education and sport, within the education system, is a fundamental human right. Further, in 1999 South Africa signed a resolution at the All Africa Games held in Johannesburg, which said that: "physical education is a fundamental human right and that society has a collective responsibility to ensure that the quantity and quality of physical education is adequate for all." We would also point out that the UNESCO Charter states further: "we regard physical education and sport as means of integrating the personality of the individual and ensuring his personal development in all its aspects."

Box 15

Sports and culture

There is also evidence that School Management Teams require orientation regarding the importance of sport and culture:

"Most of the School Management Teams (SMTs) do not have a conceptual understanding of the need to invest in the educational development of their learners. … It has not been easy to get full cooperation from SMTs as we try to lobby for sport development. … SMTs need to be shown the benefits of quality training and how sport can contribute to the development of students and school in general."

Recommendation 54:

Enlist the support of various extra-curriculum organisations and other departments (e.g. Sports Council; DAC; National Youth Council; Catalyst Youth Development Society) to train unemployed members of the community to take charge of extra-curriculum programmes, especially in sport and recreation.

Schools and sporting facilities (to include a range of sporting codes) ought to be provided for in the rural areas and sporting facilities (both public and private) should be available for use by schools. Often, the provision of facilities is not sufficient to cater for all needs. Therefore, it is essential to have a comprehensive sports and recreation plan in place.

Sub-theme: Sports and culture

In sport and recreation, recreation facilities in collaboration with experienced educators is essential in providing quality education and training. The focus of sport and recreation should be on providing a holistic approach to education and training, which includes physical, mental and social development.

In addition, the importance of sport and recreation in education and training cannot be overstated. It is crucial that schools incorporate sport and recreation as part of their curriculum. This will help in developing critical skills and qualities in students, such as leadership, teamwork, and discipline.

Recommendation 55:

Promote the use of local sporting facilities by schools and communities. This will help in reducing the cost of providing facilities and will also encourage a healthy lifestyle among local communities.

Box 16

Sports and cultural events

There is also evidence that School Management Teams require orientation regarding the importance of sport and culture:

"Most of the School Management Teams (SMTs) do not have a conceptual understanding of the need to invest in the educational development of their learners. … It has not been easy to get full cooperation from SMTs as we try to lobby for sport development. … SMTs need to be shown the benefits of quality training and how sport can contribute to the development of students and school in general."

Recommendation 54:

Enlist the support of various extra-curriculum organisations and other departments (e.g. Sports Council; DAC; National Youth Council; Catalyst Youth Development Society) to train unemployed members of the community to take charge of extra-curriculum programmes, especially in sport and recreation.

Schools and sporting facilities (to include a range of sporting codes) ought to be provided for in the rural areas, and should be equipped to give professional training and first aid for injuries. In schools and sporting facilities (to include a range of sporting codes) ought to be provided for in the rural areas and sporting facilities (both public and private) should be available for use by schools. Often, the provision of facilities is not sufficient to cater for all needs. Therefore, it is essential to have a comprehensive sports and recreation plan in place.

Sub-theme: Sports and culture

In sport and recreation, recreation facilities in collaboration with experienced educators is essential in providing quality education and training. The focus of sport and recreation should be on providing a holistic approach to education and training, which includes physical, mental and social development.

In addition, the importance of sport and recreation in education and training cannot be overstated. It is crucial that schools incorporate sport and recreation as part of their curriculum. This will help in developing critical skills and qualities in students, such as leadership, teamwork, and discipline.

Recommendation 55:

Promote the use of local sporting facilities by schools and communities. This will help in reducing the cost of providing facilities and will also encourage a healthy lifestyle among local communities.

Box 16

Sports and cultural events

There is also evidence that School Management Teams require orientation regarding the importance of sport and culture:

"Most of the School Management Teams (SMTs) do not have a conceptual understanding of the need to invest in the educational development of their learners. … It has not been easy to get full cooperation from SMTs as we try to lobby for sport development. … SMTs need to be shown the benefits of quality training and how sport can contribute to the development of students and school in general."

Recommendation 54:

Enlist the support of various extra-curriculum organisations and other departments (e.g. Sports Council; DAC; National Youth Council; Catalyst Youth Development Society) to train unemployed members of the community to take charge of extra-curriculum programmes, especially in sport and recreation.

Schools and sporting facilities (to include a range of sporting codes) ought to be provided for in the rural areas, and should be equipped to give professional training and first aid for injuries. In schools and sporting facilities (both public and private) should be available for use by schools. Often, the provision of facilities is not sufficient to cater for all needs. Therefore, it is essential to have a comprehensive sports and recreation plan in place.

Sub-theme: Sports and culture

In sport and recreation, recreation facilities in collaboration with experienced educators is essential in providing quality education and training. The focus of sport and recreation should be on providing a holistic approach to education and training, which includes physical, mental and social development.

In addition, the importance of sport and recreation in education and training cannot be overstated. It is crucial that schools incorporate sport and recreation as part of their curriculum. This will help in developing critical skills and qualities in students, such as leadership, teamwork, and discipline.

Recommendation 55:

Promote the use of local sporting facilities by schools and communities. This will help in reducing the cost of providing facilities and will also encourage a healthy lifestyle among local communities.
Theme 6: Educators

Current status and challenges

The legacy of under- and unqualified educators, few having competencies in key learning areas, working in poorly equipped schools, continues to undermine the teaching environment and conditions of service of educators in rural schools. Challenges include the need to provide pre- and in-service education competencies that are adapted to rural contexts while improving the conditions of service and living conditions at schools.

The teaching profession in rural areas is characterised by a critical shortage of qualified educators, particularly in the physical sciences and mathematics. Morale is low because of poor conditions of service and the dire teaching environment in many schools. Many educators are considered ‘migrants’ as they travel to schools from towns, never feeling a part of the community in which they teach. Professional development programmes may be inaccessible due to the long distances educators must travel to attend.

The redeployment of educators to rural schools has in the main not succeeded and it is likely that in the near future there will be a critical shortage of educators, particularly in key learning areas. It appears that essential steps required to solve the inadequate supply of qualified educators in rural areas are: firstly, to recruit local members of communities to the teaching profession; secondly, to retain them by ensuring their well-being through the provision of acceptable conditions of service, and finally to ensure they engage in fruitful professional development programmes.

Women educators, especially those on remote schools and on farms, are liable to be exploited and face unnecessary risks due to lack of security while travelling to and from school and while at school. Many educators living far from schools tend to arrive late at school on Mondays, and leave early on Fridays. This will not solve the problem of commuting home for weekends. School vandalism is rife, so promoting community ownership of schools appears to be the only answer to the question of how schools will be protected during vacations and over weekends.

Key issues arising from present conditions are teacher recruitment, conditions of service, and professional development, including classroom support.

Box 15 A sample of educators’ comments

- “Most of our educators are from urban areas. They’ve been trained as educators in order to earn a living as some are bread winners. [Regarding] the accommodation and commuting of educators:
  - some stay in educator cottages
  - some commute to the nearest town and sometimes a distance exceeding 100km’s single trip
  - others are local children of soil.”

- “Educators teaching and residing in TA’s are not accessing housing subsidies. Banks are reluctant to approve home loans because the Tribal Authority owns the land.”

- “Educators and communities alike are demoralized, and tensions between them destabilize attempts to reform education and training programmes.

Many educators living far from schools tend to arrive late at school on Mondays, and leave early on Fridays. It has been suggested that the state should provide accommodation at schools and extend the school year by ten weeks to allow educators to travel to schools from towns, never feeling a part of the community in which they teach. Professional development programmes may be inaccessible due to the long distances educators must travel to attend.

The deployment of educators to rural schools has not in the main been successful and it is likely that in the near future there will be a critical shortage of educators, particularly in key learning areas.

Women educators, especially those on remote schools and on farms, face unnecessary risks due to lack of security while travelling to and from school and while at school. Many educators living far from schools tend to arrive late at school on Mondays, and leave early on Fridays. It has been suggested that the state should provide accommodation at schools and extend the school year by ten weeks to allow educators to travel to schools from towns, never feeling a part of the community in which they teach. Professional development programmes may be inaccessible due to the long distances educators must travel to attend.

The deployment of educators to rural schools has not in the main been successful and it is likely that in the near future there will be a critical shortage of educators, particularly in key learning areas.

Women educators, especially those on remote schools and on farms, face unnecessary risks due to lack of security while travelling to and from school and while at school. Many educators living far from schools tend to arrive late at school on Mondays, and leave early on Fridays. It has been suggested that the state should provide accommodation at schools and extend the school year by ten weeks to allow educators to travel to schools from towns, never feeling a part of the community in which they teach. Professional development programmes may be inaccessible due to the long distances educators must travel to attend.

The deployment of educators to rural schools has not in the main been successful and it is likely that in the near future there will be a critical shortage of educators, particularly in key learning areas.

Women educators, especially those on remote schools and on farms, face unnecessary risks due to lack of security while travelling to and from school and while at school. Many educators living far from schools tend to arrive late at school on Mondays, and leave early on Fridays. It has been suggested that the state should provide accommodation at schools and extend the school year by ten weeks to allow educators to travel to schools from towns, never feeling a part of the community in which they teach. Professional development programmes may be inaccessible due to the long distances educators must travel to attend.

The deployment of educators to rural schools has not in the main been successful and it is likely that in the near future there will be a critical shortage of educators, particularly in key learning areas.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Sub theme: Recruitment

The growing gap between the demand for, and the provision of, new educators will exacerbate the current problem of recruiting new educators for service in rural areas.

Noting that redeployment procedures in the past have resulted in the marginalisation of newly-employed educators, consideration should be given to:

· Pre-service courses to cover teaching in rural contexts
· Bursaries to local youths with the proviso that they will return to their communities once they have graduated (ETDP SETA learnerships and/or NSFAS). This calls for innovation and adequate resourcing, as is evident in the case below.

Limpopo Province has an oversupply of trained, unemployed educators who require retraining in learning areas where there is a scarce supply of educators.

Box 16   An innovative strategy to attract and support black student educators from rural and disadvantaged backgrounds

Towards the end of 2002 the Faculty [of Education, Pretoria] began to articulate a strategy that would address the problems outlined above [diversifying the institution by ensuring that increasing numbers of black South Africans access and benefit from professional programmes]. The Faculty set out to recruit 100 of the brightest young minds in the Limpopo Province to enter the University of Pretoria as first time student teachers in 2003. …

This innovative approach bore fruit, as demonstrated in the outstanding performance of the Limpopo students at the end of 2003. Despite the obvious disadvantages they faced, the Faculty developed a three-way approach to learning, which ensured the success of the programme. Firstly, the students followed a rigorous four-year teacher education programme with at least 40% of their time spent working under the mentorship of the top teachers in science, mathematics and the humanities. Secondly, the students were involved in a programme of personal development support. Thirdly, each of the 58 students was assigned a personal mentor who met the students at least once a week to give them general support, guidance and encouragement.

Recommendation 55: Assess the supply of educators in rural areas, considering gender equity and the current shortage of adequately trained educators in key learning areas.

Recommendation 56: Engage in a recruitment drive amongst rural communities with new entrants obtaining bursaries.

Recommendation 57: Reconsider an induction year for educators in rural areas.

Recommendation 58: Reconsider an induction year in rural areas (see Recommendation 59).

Strategies to attract new and experienced educators to rural schools calls for ways of addressing the low morale of all educators, particularly those in rural areas. This implies reconsideration of conditions of service for educators in rural areas. The mobile education programme has been successful in addressing this problem.

Sub theme: Conditions of service

Service for educators in rural areas.

Conditions of service were widely referred to in both provincial and public submissions. The province received submissions on the centrality of conditions of service to teacher recruitment and retention. This implies reconsideration of conditions of service for educators in rural areas. The mobile education programme has been successful in addressing this problem.

Recommendation 59: Engage in a recruitment drive among rural communities with new entrants obtaining bursaries.

Recommendation 60: Reconsider an induction year for educators in rural areas.

Recommendation 61: Reconsider an induction year in rural areas (see Recommendation 59).

Strategies to attract new and experienced educators to rural schools calls for ways of addressing the low morale of all educators, particularly those in rural areas. This implies reconsideration of conditions of service for educators in rural areas.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Poor services discourage better-qualified educators from teaching in rural areas. Previously educators were not part of the homeowners' scheme. Eventually when they were put on board, educators in the rural schools were still excluded. This scenario leads to a situation where the educators prefer to travel to work than to stay in the rural areas. Late coming, therefore, becomes the order of the day. Having to use their own vehicles on bad roads compounds the problem, as does lack of access to facilities such as medicine and health. Employment in rural areas becomes the last resort while the educator is looking for greener pastures.

Other views included the following:

“There are not enough teachers and principals who have the capacity, support and/or ability to run a school or teach. Extra pay is needed to attract good teachers” (School Principal).

“Teachers employed by the State have to be accommodated within reasonable distance of the school. Clearly, in such cases, teachers would not be entirely independent and free to follow the lifestyle of their choice, for example, there may be restrictions regarding accommodation for family members.” (School Educator).

“Conditions of service, incentives for teachers in rural areas etc need to be reviewed in order to make teaching in rural and farm schools more attractive to teachers ….” It is an informed SADTU assertion that the majority of qualified, but unemployed teachers have reached such a stage of desperation that they would be more than prepared to be re-trained in gateway subjects and be deployed in rural areas.” (Teacher Union).

Although various initiatives have been proposed by the DoE and unions to address conditions of service, there is as yet no consensus on possible measures to provide accommodation and support for those who choose to work in rural areas.

Recommendation 58:
Negotiate with major stakeholders the various options open to the profession to attract experienced educators to work in rural areas, signing short- or long-term contracts.

Recommendation 59:
An induction process should be introduced for newly qualified educators. In rural areas, this should integrate educators to the lifestyle in villages by involving various role players in rural areas. This means that the process should be improved for newly qualified educators in rural areas.

Recommendation 60:
Prepare a programme that addresses priorities for improving conditions of service, including transport and facilities and services with DEP/CEF.

Sub theme: Professional development

Although various initiatives have been proposed by the DoE and unions to address conditions of service, there is as yet no consensus on possible measures to provide accommodation and support for those who choose to work in rural areas.

There is need for a process that introduces educators to the lifestyle in villages by involving various role players in rural areas. This means that the process should be improved for newly qualified educators in rural areas.

Recommendation 57 : Prepare a programme that addresses priorities for improving conditions of service, including transport and facilities and services with DEP/CEF.

Recommendation 58: An induction process should be introduced for newly qualified educators. In rural areas, this should integrate educators to the lifestyle in villages by involving various role players in rural areas. This means that the process should be improved for newly qualified educators in rural areas.

Recommendation 60: Prepare a programme that addresses priorities for improving conditions of service, including transport and facilities and services with DEP/CEF.

Sub theme: Professional development

Other views included the following:

“There are not enough teachers and principals who have the capacity, support and/or ability to run a school or teach. Extra pay is needed to attract good teachers.” (School Principal).

“Teachers employed by the State have to be accommodated within reasonable distance of the school. Clearly, in such cases, teachers would not be entirely independent and free to follow the lifestyle of their choice, for example, there may be restrictions regarding accommodation for family members.” (School Educator).

“Teachers employed by the State have to be accommodated within reasonable distance of the school. Clearly, in such cases, teachers would not be entirely independent and free to follow the lifestyle of their choice, for example, there may be restrictions regarding accommodation for family members.” (School Educator).

There is need for a process that integrates educators to the lifestyle in villages by involving various role players in rural areas. This means that the process should be improved for newly qualified educators in rural areas.

Recommendation 57 : Prepare a programme that addresses priorities for improving conditions of service, including transport and facilities and services with DEP/CEF.

Recommendation 58: An induction process should be introduced for newly qualified educators. In rural areas, this should integrate educators to the lifestyle in villages by involving various role players in rural areas. This means that the process should be improved for newly qualified educators in rural areas.

Recommendation 60: Prepare a programme that addresses priorities for improving conditions of service, including transport and facilities and services with DEP/CEF.

Sub theme: Professional development

Other views included the following:

“There are not enough teachers and principals who have the capacity, support and/or ability to run a school or teach. Extra pay is needed to attract good teachers.” (School Principal).

“Teachers employed by the State have to be accommodated within reasonable distance of the school. Clearly, in such cases, teachers would not be entirely independent and free to follow the lifestyle of their choice, for example, there may be restrictions regarding accommodation for family members.” (School Educator).

“Teachers employed by the State have to be accommodated within reasonable distance of the school. Clearly, in such cases, teachers would not be entirely independent and free to follow the lifestyle of their choice, for example, there may be restrictions regarding accommodation for family members.” (School Educator).

There is need for a process that integrates educators to the lifestyle in villages by involving various role players in rural areas. This means that the process should be improved for newly qualified educators in rural areas.

Recommendation 57 : Prepare a programme that addresses priorities for improving conditions of service, including transport and facilities and services with DEP/CEF.

Recommendation 58: An induction process should be introduced for newly qualified educators. In rural areas, this should integrate educators to the lifestyle in villages by involving various role players in rural areas. This means that the process should be improved for newly qualified educators in rural areas.

Recommendation 60: Prepare a programme that addresses priorities for improving conditions of service, including transport and facilities and services with DEP/CEF.
Box 18  Positive aspects of multigrade classes

- Increased access and equity (an important feature of reforms in Cuba, Ecuador, Guatemala and Paraguay and increasingly in South Africa).
- involvement in the decision-making process over curriculum issues.
- Improved school attendance, which is also evident in comments offered in public submissions.
- Textbook Selection Committees on which parents served negotiated the best possible deals with book suppliers.
- Significant other gains were achieved in local empowerment. In a most innovative measure, The Multigrade Rural Schools Intervention of the Western Cape Education Department has been running since 2001. The project had two thrusts, one of which was to improve the quality of teaching, and thereby addressing the issue of retention, a distance-learning, School-based Teacher Development programme was developed.
- Teacher development programmes also involved the issue of retention, a distance-learning, School-based Teacher Development programme.
- School-based Teacher Development programmes were developed.
- To improve the quality of teaching and the teacher-pupil relationship, the project included a distance-learning, School-based Teacher Development programme. Under this programme, notable improvement was evident in the number of schools that increased their access to training.
- Rising costs of primary education to parents, and the resulting increase in the number of children failing to access or remain in school Textbook Selection Committees on which parents served negotiated the best possible deals with book suppliers. Enrolment of Primary Education (SPRED III) Project in Kenya

Box 17 An example of professional development involving the community: The Strengthening
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Similarly, a report on the Kgatelopele project cites a teacher reporting that: “After workshops ... when we cluster with project multigrade classes, we really know what to do, even though it takes time ... I feel very positive ...”

Monitoring and research are particularly important with respect to continuing professional development in rural areas:

Recommendation 61: Within a teacher ‘growth’ and network or ‘cluster’ model of continuing professional development, consider flexible arrangements to improve pedagogy in rural areas through various means such as mentors, itinerant curriculum advisers in key learning areas, capacity development at nodal areas, and short-term courses for teachers at nodal venues. Parents should be involved where possible.

Recommendation 62: Implement a study that assesses the impact of and lessons learnt from South African and international experiences of distance education programmes operating in rural areas to inform and support policy development and inform research to explore the potential impact of distance education on rural schools.

Recommendation 63: Within a teacher ‘growth’ and network or ‘cluster’ model of continuing professional development, monitor and ensure that more women are represented at senior levels of the profession in rural schools and in management positions at district offices responsible for rural schools.

A detailed research study should be conducted to study what is happening in multigrade classrooms so that best practices can be shared amongst practitioners.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Theme 7: Farm schools

Current status and challenges

A central dilemma facing schools on farms, or indeed many of the public schools on private land, can be gleaned from the following submission to the MCRE:

"A school in the Waterberg area has had no clean water for years. The department took measurements and with the promise of bringing a new water pump early this year. There has been no progress to date… How do we deal with this school and its learners?"

In post-apartheid SA, why is the quality of education at schools on commercial farms patently inferior to other schools and why is it so difficult to improve delivery? The following brief historical overview attempts to answer these questions in order to substantiate recommendations that point to the need to end the category, 'Public Schools On Private Land' through closures, mergers or, in the final analysis, expropriation. Clearly this cannot take place in the short term as it is a considerable undertaking requiring clear mandates and guidelines and to establish the management and administrative machinery required for it to succeed. In addition, the process must be supported by targeted funding to ensure that no learner is denied access to school through this process.

A dual management system for schools on private land, 1955-1994

Since the promulgation of the Bantu Education Act No. 47 of 1953, which defined the status of public schools on private land, education delivery to schools on white-owned farms has been bound in complex and often contentious ways with agricultural production. School farms, which were partly subsidized by government and located on commercial farms, were classified as "state-aided" schools because property owners subsidized schooling through the provision of buildings and some educational services. The Department of Education and Training was directly responsible for these schools. However, the provincial department of education was still responsible for the payment of teacher salaries and educational purchases. By 1994 provision of education to farms was somewhat similar to that of other schools, with the exception of a new obligation for property owners to provide a free meal to schoolchildren.

By 1994, provision of education to farms was somewhat similar to that of other schools, with the exception of a new obligation for property owners to provide a free meal to schoolchildren. However, the dual management system persisted, with the farm owner responsible for the day-to-day running of the school and the provincial department responsible for educational policy and funding. This arrangement was intended to ensure that schools on farms were provided with the same educational opportunities as other schools, but it also meant that the farm owner had the final say on the selection of educators.

Children from neighbouring farms could attend the school with the permission of the farm owner on whose land the school was located. Where provision was sparse, children had to walk long distances to school. Despite increases in subsidies to property owners, by 1994 schools remained in a parlous state. (By 1994, the state subsidy covered all building costs and 50% of maintenance costs. The agreement could be enforced, particularly if the farm was sold.)

Provision of education to farms was uneven, with some schools having excellent facilities, provided by farmers and other property owners, and others remaining poorly subsidized by the state and badly served by the local community. The situation was complex and often contentious, with the farm owner having the final say on the selection of educators.

A central dilemma facing schools on farms, or indeed many of the public schools on private land, can be the following: How do we deal with this school and its learners?"
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Social and economic relations embedding farm schools

Children on farms are profoundly affected by the plight of their parents and circumstances in commercial agriculture generally. While schools remain on private land their development tends to be subordinated to the interests of the owner of the land — the farmers, the church, mine or hospital management. Various studies, and most recently that of the Human Rights Watch, specify how farm schools are unable to fulfil their democratic mandate.

It is generally accepted that farm schools were established to prevent migration to the cities and stabilize labour and social relations on farms: farmers could expect workers to remain on the farm if there were a school for their children. As there were no laws preventing child labour in SA, employers could employ all children, even those at school. The promulgation of the Education Laws (Education and Training) Amendment Act of 1988 prevented children from being withdrawn from school to work. However child labour was not regulated and children on farms (as were children in other walks of life) were subjected to work that could compromise their health and general well-being.

Post-1994 legislation regulating land and labour raised the fears and uncertainty of farmers, who were already operating in a difficult economic climate due to diminishing state subsidies and credit in the 1980s, as well as lengthy periods of drought in the early 1990s. Many reports indicate that on a number of farms, social relations between farmers and workers are poor and there are too many instances of violent and abusive actions between workers and farmers.

There has been a substantial decline in the number of farming units and in the population of farm workers (permanent and seasonal) between 1988 and 1996 nationally. The number of full-time workers declined from 724 430 to 625 451 from 1988 to 1996 whilst the number of farms decreased from 62 428 to 60 938. Evictions have contributed to this decline. Job losses not only result in farm workers losing their jobs but also result in many workers, largely women, being compelled into temporary work affecting their children's access to regular schooling.

The PEDs have responded to this decrease in the number of learners by closing many small schools, as illustrated in Table 2. These factors have contributed to a significant decrease in the number of learners at farm schools, as well as to changes in the social relations between farmers and workers and their families.

Social relations between farmers, family and workers have become more repressive with deteriorating work relations and poor results in many workers' families. Worker displacement into temporary work affecting their children's health and educational outcomes have contributed to the decline in farm school learners. An analysis of data shows that from 1990 to 1996 the number of farm workers in permanent positions has decreased by 2%, while the number of part-time workers has increased by 37%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Learners 1996</th>
<th>Learners 2000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>North West</td>
<td>276,096</td>
<td>255,041</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Cape</td>
<td>111,266</td>
<td>109,834</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free State</td>
<td>104,188</td>
<td>100,073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limpopo</td>
<td>60,920</td>
<td>65,462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern Cape</td>
<td>23,620</td>
<td>25,762</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North West</td>
<td>13,333</td>
<td>12,407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North West</td>
<td>3,500</td>
<td>3,300</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These factors have contributed to a significant decrease in the number of learners at farm schools, as well as to changes in the social relations between farmers, family and workers and their families.

Social relations between farmers, family and workers have become more repressive with deteriorating work relations and poor results in many workers' families. Worker displacement into temporary work affecting their children's health and educational outcomes have contributed to the decline in farm school learners. An analysis of data shows that from 1990 to 1996 the number of farm workers in permanent positions has decreased by 2%, while the number of part-time workers has increased by 37%.

Outcomes

Table 2: Farm schools learners by province, 1996 and 2000

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Learners 1996</th>
<th>Learners 2000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>North West</td>
<td>276,096</td>
<td>255,041</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Cape</td>
<td>111,266</td>
<td>109,834</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free State</td>
<td>104,188</td>
<td>100,073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limpopo</td>
<td>60,920</td>
<td>65,462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern Cape</td>
<td>23,620</td>
<td>25,762</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North West</td>
<td>13,333</td>
<td>12,407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North West</td>
<td>3,500</td>
<td>3,300</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These factors have contributed to a significant decrease in the number of learners at farm schools, as well as to changes in the social relations between farmers, family and workers and their families.

Social relations between farmers, family and workers have become more repressive with deteriorating work relations and poor results in many workers' families. Worker displacement into temporary work affecting their children's health and educational outcomes have contributed to the decline in farm school learners. An analysis of data shows that from 1990 to 1996 the number of farm workers in permanent positions has decreased by 2%, while the number of part-time workers has increased by 37%.

Outcomes

Table 2: Farm schools learners by province, 1996 and 2000

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>Learners 1996</th>
<th>Learners 2000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>North West</td>
<td>276,096</td>
<td>255,041</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Cape</td>
<td>111,266</td>
<td>109,834</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free State</td>
<td>104,188</td>
<td>100,073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limpopo</td>
<td>60,920</td>
<td>65,462</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern Cape</td>
<td>23,620</td>
<td>25,762</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North West</td>
<td>13,333</td>
<td>12,407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North West</td>
<td>3,500</td>
<td>3,300</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Not only are farm schools amongst the poorest in the country, in physical infrastructure, the provision of facilities and services and teaching resources, but also retention rates are significantly lower at farm schools than at all other schools.64

Census '96 suggests that as many as 41% of Africans engaged in the agriculture and hunting sub-sector throughout the country had no schooling whereas more than three-quarters (77%) of whites had obtained 'matric or higher' qualifications.65 Access to education in the former homelands was somewhat better than on commercial farms during the apartheid era, leaving farm workers on commercial farms less educated than those working in various sectors of the formal economy.66

In conclusion, a central dilemma confounds the delivery of education at public schools on private land. The Constitution provides for both the basic right to education as well as the private property rights. As such, the placement of farm schools on private land has meant that the interests of learners at schools on private land sometimes clash with those of property owners to the detriment of all - learners, educators, parents and employers. It is therefore essential that schooling is severed from political and labour dynamics on the farms.

The SASA attempted to address this situation by securing educational rights over the land. However, as the analysis that follows illustrates, these efforts have been largely unsuccessful and plans to improve school facilities seldom materialise. On the one hand, education departments are loathe to introduce school improvement programmes as these may be at risk if schools are not fully owned by the state: there is the possibility that private owners will close schools resulting in the wastage of the state's investment. On the other hand, farmers are cautious about allowing the state to improve school facilities on their land as these may compromise their farming operations.

A new dispensation? The provisions of the South African Schools Act (SASA)

The passing of the South African Schools Act (Act No. 84 of 1996) in 1996 was supposed to be the death knell for this dual management system: farm schools, together with all public schools on private land, were to be proclaimed public schools, which meant they would be governed and financed in the same way as their public school counterparts.

Legislation on the organisation, governance and funding of schools provided for the transfer of assets or the transfer of management of schools from the property owners to the state. Sections 14 (1) - (7) of the SASA endorsed the state's responsibility for education and the performance of the normal functions of a public school (with respect to governance, access, equity of opportunity, maintenance and improvement of the premises, management of the school and the protection of the right to property). The state's responsibility for the management of schools from the property owners was to be enforced against successive owners if farms were sold.

Other options provided for in the SASA were: the closure of schools; the registration of educational rights on a piece of land, which could be endorsed on the title deed of the property; or the expropriation of land or a real right in or over land for any purpose relating to schooling.

Legal status of schools

Human Rights Watch (HRW) interviews revealed that the majority of schools in the country have not concluded agreements in at least five of the provinces. There is some variation amongst the provinces: In the Western Cape almost all contracts have been signed possibly because many of the farm schools in this region are church-owned and have had rental agreements in the past. Whereas fewer than 10% have been signed in Limpopo Province.

The SASA provided for schools signing agreements within six months after its promulgation and therefore those without agreements are left in a legal limbo. Where concluded, these have not always been able to protect the interests of the learners — or the farmers — as agreements do not include measures to enforce compliance. Legal opinions indicate that in cases where contracts have not been concluded, the operation of farm schools may be illegal because they should have been signed six months after the SASA was gazetted.

So, where farm schools continue to exist on private land, not only does the Act fail to give learners and educators clear rights against the landowning farmers, section 14 in fact renders the operation of such schools illegal:

**Table 3:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>No of Schools</th>
<th>No of agreements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Free State</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern Cape</td>
<td>441</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North West</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limpopo</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northern Cape</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>674</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Provinces have resorted to rationalising provision by closing and merging schools, but this has not been without difficulties:

The education department for each province is responsible for the education of its learners and is expected to ensure that all learners receive a quality education. The Act clearly states that the education department is responsible for ensuring that all learners receive a quality education. However, in practice, this is often not the case.

The act states that the education department is responsible for ensuring that all learners receive a quality education. However, in practice, this is often not the case. In some provinces, the education department has been unable to ensure that all learners receive a quality education. This has led to the closure of schools and the merging of schools.

The legal status of schools in the country is not clear. The Act clearly states that the education department is responsible for ensuring that all learners receive a quality education. However, in practice, this is often not the case. In some provinces, the education department has been unable to ensure that all learners receive a quality education. This has led to the closure of schools and the merging of schools.

The act states that the education department is responsible for ensuring that all learners receive a quality education. However, in practice, this is often not the case. In some provinces, the education department has been unable to ensure that all learners receive a quality education. This has led to the closure of schools and the merging of schools.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Despite the SASA providing for expropriation, no land on which schools are located has been expropriated. It is a difficult option particularly in view of existing tensions regarding the land resettlement and land restitution policies. One submission pointed to the difficulties that may arise if the state wishes to expropriate land for the purposes of acquiring a school:

“I would suggest that expropriation should have its own guidelines too. A small concern, having engaged with farm workers is the potential tension between farm owner and workers if a portion of his land is expropriated. There can be victimisation and all that flows from that. A farm worker remains marginalised and powerless: expropriation should not mean additional victimisation and harassment.”

A few communities, aided by legal aid offices, have instituted action against the PED concerned in an attempt to compel it to meet its obligations regarding the provision of compulsory basic education.69 Their lack of success in ensuring that the Court’s judgments are put into effect indicates that agreements would have to include stronger enforcement penalties than they do at present (if current policies continue).

Submissions from a few organizations indicated that in some cases farmers were willing to enter into discussions regarding agreements with the department, but officials have appeared unwilling to engage. Officials responded by claiming that agreements ‘had no teeth’ and could not be used to support school development.

Views expressed by all parties during interviews and at the provincial workshop revealed high levels of frustration at the deadlocks and delays caused by difficulties in concluding and enforcing S14 agreements. A number of officials present at the provincial workshop argued that there should be an end to the PSoPL category of schools. This would require a decision regarding existing S14 agreements:

“… it would be hard to phase out S14 agreements in instances where schools already exist and which do service a particular community and new ones cannot be built until huge costs, particularly where expropriation is a last resort.”

However, the fact that many schools are operating outside the requirements of the SASA indicates that this eventuality must be considered.

Governing and management of farm schools

In terms of the SASA, the school governing body must be made up of parents (who are in the majority) and educators (and learners in the case of secondary schools). These members may then co-opt other members of the community as non-voting members. Therefore even if farmers are co-opted onto the committee as community members, they cannot vote. If they have a child at the school, then they are eligible for election as a voting member like any other parent.

The legitimacy of SGBs was raised in many discussions and remains an issue fraught with tensions and contradictions. Whether or not farmers are co-opted onto SGBs, their powerful role in the community means they can control school development from the inside or outside, thereby undermining the role of elected governors. It is clear that many farmers remain unwilling participants in school development, afraid (sometimes with good reason) that losing control over the schools can threaten their farming operations.

A key concern among SGB members is the difficulty of ensuring that the curriculum is implemented and pupils receive a meaningful education. Another concern is the lack of resources, particularly where expropriation is a last resort. To remedy this, the department’s recent initiative to provide assistance to schools on expropriated land has been welcomed by many SGB members.

Despite the SASA providing for expropriation for the purposes of acquiring a school,
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Where no agreement is signed, SGBs are not prepared to raise funds for capital equipment or infrastructural improvements if they are not certain that they "own" the schools. (Farm schools can be closed by farmers if no agreement has been signed, if the rental period ends or if the provincial department decides schools have too few learners. This possibility of closure will certainly prevent SGBs from putting their own time or funds at risk.)

Other management and governance problems relate to:

- Friction over school affairs between some farmers and the broader school community which has affected access and in some cases resulted in the closure of schools; 70
- Departmental decisions regarding school closure do not always meet the community's vision of education on their farm and parents should be consulted if school closure is considered; even guidelines state that communities should be part of the decision to close the school;
- Educator well being and conditions of service (see Theme 6);
- The safety of children travelling to school;
- Difficulties in learner transfers from farm schools to other schools as learners progress up the educational ladder, because of the limited availability of FET schools — and sometimes senior GET classes — in the vicinity of farms;
- Reports of child labour persist, even though child labour is outlawed in terms of the BCEA. Child labour sometimes persists with the consent of their parents.

Regarding schools on land owned by various churches 71 it became apparent that:

- Church involvement is not always positive, with many instances of churches not signing S14 agreements as they fear the school will be secularised;
- In the Northern Cape the Roman Catholic Church plays a prominent role with regular forums taking place;
- In one school in Gauteng parents objected to the church's insistence on representation on the SGB, thus placing the department in an invidious position.

Pedagogical conditions and learner outcomes

All issues outlined in Themes 5 and 6 regarding classroom conditions and educator needs apply to farm schools. In addition to these there are conditions which apply only to farm schools. One of the most challenging is that of the multi-grade classes. Many farm schools are one- or two-educator schools having multi-grade classes. As a result one educator sometimes has to teach more than two grades — some teach as many as six grades. This indicates that current post provisioning formulas need to be amended to take account of the needs of small, multi-grade schools. Capacity development is also required to ensure that small, multi-grade schools are able to reach more than two grades. High levels of malnutrition and dirtiness of class rooms sometimes result in such small schools not being able to reach more than two grades.

Another difficulty is that of learners travelling to school. Reports indicate that there are many over-age learners because they remain at home until strong enough to travel long distances. Learners on farms face incredible barriers when attempting to access FET owing to the scarcity of FET schools and the distances learners have to travel. Many old-age learners become very emotional at home until strong enough to travel long distances.

Infrastructure and the provision of facilities and services

Infrastructure and the provision of facilities and services are other major concerns. The availability of LSMs and how provision has changed from 1996 to 2000. Data indicate that the conditions at approximately one in five schools are neither safe nor secure. The majority of schools in a poor or very poor condition, having poor sanitation, and without water, are farm schools.

Schools on farms are in an enviable position:

- in one school in Gauteng parents objected to the church's insistence on representation on the SGB, thus placing the department in an invidious position.
- In another school the church's insistence on representation on the SGB, thus placing the department in an invidious position.

Educational conditions and learner outcomes

- Reports of child labour persist, even though child labour is outlawed in terms of the BCEA. Child labour sometimes persists with the consent of their parents.
- Educational conditions and learner outcomes refer to the conditions of schools that are run by泷 those promoting and equal opportunity and access to learners with special needs.
- Education for learners with special needs is not always positive, with many instances of discrimination against learners with special needs.
- "The school is a place where children can learn and develop their full potential in a supportive and stimulating environment. It must provide a safe, secure and happy learning environment where all learners are valued and respected. The school must be a place where all learners feel welcome and accepted. It must be a place where learners can develop their skills and abilities and where they can achieve their full potential."

Other management and governance problems relate to:

- When no agreement is signed, SGBs are not prepared to raise funds for capital equipment or funds needed to maintain the schools.

70 CALS and HRW report on cases where farmers have repeatedly locked the gates to schools. In other cases, teachers have to negotiate access continuously as they are not given keys to the locks on the gates. In another instances fences erected have lengthened the route to the school considerably (by as much as 20 kilometres).

71 It must be noted that differences in access and provision on land owned by churches differs markedly across SA, due to the range of churches involved.


73 Disparities in the availability of accessible information on farm schools within the provincial departments of education underlines the need for the government to collect and maintain a register, including statistical information, on the status of schools on commercial farms (HRW, 2004).
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

means of small schools on commercial farms, scattered across the length and breadth of South Africa, whereas facilities for white pupils were centralised in towns, with state provision of transport and boarding accommodation.

Neither model is without its problems. Worldwide, rural education offices are facing difficult choices regarding the placement and size of schools for rural learners. Even though centralised schools tend to offer its educators and learners more facilities and subject choices, the state has to finance transport or provide accommodation for learners. It is also considered harmful for young children to leave their homes. In contrast, a larger number of smaller schools may ease the transport burden, but the schools cannot offer the wealth of facilities and learning options that can be provided in larger schools.

Another consideration influencing the decision on centralisation/decentralisation is the nature of the personal relationships at small and large schools. Small schools tend to suit the needs of young children, as well-organised small schools can encourage warm and caring relationships between educators and learners. Large schools can be impersonal and may even alienate parents from participating in school affairs. Some school districts in more advantaged areas of the world are experimenting with flexible distance education programmes to allow learners to study nearer their homes and be phased out of centralised schools.

Proposed changes in policy

Should farm schools be seen as a viable, permanent feature of the rural landscape? Opinions were divided. People appear loath to waste resources already spent on these schools and believe the situation of these schools can be remedied.

Some, basing their opinion on the history of failure in dealing with farm schools, were not hopeful:

"... despite its good intentions, the government's efforts to improve conditions on Farm Schools have achieved little. In particular, the state's inability to resolve the issue of Farm Schools' legal status has allowed their vulnerability to endure.

Others, however, looked at opportunities such as transforming schools into a community resource:

"... we believe that farm schools should be preserved at all costs, because the schools are also community centres and the children are in need of proper education."

The WRC heard expressions of anger by organisations and farmers. One farmer claimed that the situation in Limpopo Province is 'disgusting and abhorrent'.

"Do away with all farm schools. The children are in need of proper education."

Opinions were divided: Some appeared eager to waste resources already spent on these schools and believe the situation of farm schools should remain in place, remain in the short-term and be phased out. Others, however, looked at opportunities such as transforming schools into a community resource:

"... we need a consistent and constructive engagement with the farming communities to address the:"

- Rampant retrenchment of Africans in the farms;
- Eviction of Africans in these farms
- Non-involvement of the local municipality in the farms;"
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

One submission outlined a process that encompasses systemic changes to cover policy formulation and management concerns as well as communication between the DOE and PEDs and the broader school community:

"Prioritise policies to ensure access to education for children living on commercial farms through adequate financing and planning. Appropriate steps could include establishing a unit at the national Department of Education to focus on the management of farm schools and facilitate a forum for provincial departments of education to exchange best practices on the governance and management of farm schools and strategies to ensure that all can access primary education. The unit could also convene a multi-sectoral forum, with farm owners, farm workers, teachers and farm owners' representative bodies, non-governmental organisations and local government, to review the situation on farm schools and devise strategies for improvement. This unit should also maintain a database on farm schools."

The formation of a District Education Forum and its functions are elaborated in Theme 4.

Conclusions

PSoPL have been a source of great frustration for all involved in providing education to learners attending these schools. SASA regulations have not eased the situation, and in fact, exacerbated difficulties.

The continuing nature of the dire state of many schools points to the need for immediate action in selected schools. Schools that are unsafe, unhygienic, without water and too far from learners' homes should be targeted with immediate effect.

It appears that this may be the time to alter the provision of schooling on commercial farms radically by implementing a carefully planned process of closing schools and replacing them with schools built on public land in a convenient locale. Some of the provinces have already begun to adopt innovative approaches, and others are considering the potential of social development on commercial land as a means to address the needs of learners attending farm schools. The need for immediate action in these schools is clear and紧迫.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

- Closure
- Mergers
- Expropriation.

This will involve establishing national and provincial guidelines and possibly changes in the legislation at national and provincial levels. The participation of school communities and district officials in decisions regarding rationalisation is an essential part of this process.

2. Improving access across all phases of the GET band and the FET band (see Theme 5, Access to FET for farm school learners).

3. Improving the quality of education (see Themes 5 & 6, Promoting quality education).

4. Improving the administration, management and governance of public schools (see Theme 6, Educators).

5. Improving access to lifelong learning opportunities (see Theme 1, Promoting quality lifelong education).

Sub theme: The status of S14 agreements

Recommendation 64: Clarify the legal status of farm schools where agreements have not been signed and on the basis of the findings, consider amendments to the terms of the S14 agreements in the SASA.

Recommendation 65: Provide guidelines on the legal procedures required to expropriate land on which public schools are located.

Recommendation 66: Consider the implications of a phased closure of all public schools on private land on the basis of the findings, consider amendments to the terms of S14 agreements in the SASA.

Recommendation 67: Consider the implications of a phased closure of all public schools on private land.

Sub theme: Promoting quality education

Recommendation 68: Immediate action with respect to schools having inadequate infrastructure, no sanitation and drinking water, where children are walking in excess of 5 kilometers to school.

Sub theme: Access to FET for farm school learners

Recommendation 69: Active recruitment of learners on farms completing the GET band to continue their education at FET schools or at centralised schools with hostels and transport being provided.

Sub theme: Public Learning Centres/CLCs on private land

Recommendation 70: In cooperation with the Department of Agriculture and the Department of Land Affairs, consider strategies to expand public Learning Centres/CLCs on private land.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Theme 8: Roles and responsibilities of the Department of Education and the Provincial Education Departments

Current status and challenges

Even though the roles and responsibilities ascribed in legislation and policy to the Department of Education and provincial Departments of Education provide a framework for policy and implementation respectively, it is apparent that a lack of clear policy, leadership and coordination at national level has led to PEDs responding proactively and independently to crises facing schools in rural areas. Innovative projects, driven by provincial teams and donor agencies, are responsible for the implementation of a variety of initiatives. A number of these provincial initiatives respond creatively to the challenges facing rural schools and, if adequately analysed, can provide a detailed array of best practices well-suited to the diversity of rural contexts in South Africa. Unfortunately, very few of these projects go to scale and there is no mechanism for monitoring and evaluating their impact over the long term as the time span of many of the projects depends on project funding rather than the completion of a cycle of reform. As a result, a number of these community-driven initiatives fail to deliver on their promise.

There is an urgent need for accurate information on rural schooling. Existing databases do not allow for the disaggregation of ‘rural data’. In order to maximize the value of this information, more research is required to identify useful indicators for monitoring and evaluating the performance of rural schools, educators and learners. The lack of appropriate empirical data undermines attempts to monitor and evaluate the performance of rural schools.

In terms of grading, farm schools and schools in traditional authority areas are the worst. To deal with these challenges, a Directorate for Rural Education has to be established at national and provincial levels to interface with other rural structures for effective learner support services.

Current challenges arising from a lack of coordination between DoE and PEDs include:

- The legal limbo in which PSoPL find themselves (including church and farm schools) (see Theme 7).
- Information collection does not allow information to be disaggregated according to the location of schools (see Theme 8).
- Post-provisioning policies do not address the condition prevailing in rural schools (see Theme 6).
- Lack of designated redress funding for rural schools (see Theme 2).
- Insufficient multi-sectoral fora to address the challenges faced by rural schools (see Theme 5).
- Information collection does not allow information to be disaggregated according to the location of schools (see Theme 8).

In terms of grading, farm schools and schools in traditional areas are the worst. To address these challenges, a Directorate for Rural Education has to be established at national and provincial levels to interface with other rural structures for effective learner support services.

In terms of grading, farm schools and schools in traditional authority areas are the worst. To deal with these challenges, a Directorate for Rural Education has to be established at national and provincial levels to interface with other rural structures for effective learner support services.

In terms of grading, farm schools and schools in traditional authority areas are the worst. To deal with these challenges, a Directorate for Rural Education has to be established at national and provincial levels to interface with other rural structures for effective learner support services.

Decision-making in regard to policy development, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of delivery in rural schools is problematic. A lack of coordination between the Department of Education and the Provincial Education Departments undermines attempts to develop an alternative ‘peripheral’ perspective and achieve participatory governance. This is not to deny that:

There are of course challenges in the concept and the practice of creating or reviving communities as recipients of state funding. ….. the real poverty is in the absence of local institutions and the paucity of local management …... Trusting very poor people with large sums of money is counter-cultural in the world today; and the skills of community entrepreneurship are not developed with the same ease as one would develop financial management, …... Finding a way of making a link between local government and the community of rural schools would be a significant contribution to the development of a new culture of education in rural South Africa. A new culture of education and the promotion of education would require new forms of policy and implementation frameworks.

Even though the roles and responsibilities ascribed in legislation and policy to the Department of Education and the Provincial Education Departments are not reflected in the new structure, there is an urgent need for accurate information on rural schooling. Existing databases do not allow for the disaggregation of ‘rural data’. In order to maximize the value of this information, more research is required to identify useful indicators for monitoring and evaluating the performance of rural schools, educators and learners. The lack of appropriate empirical data undermines attempts to monitor and evaluate the performance of rural schools.

In terms of grading, farm schools and schools in traditional authority areas are the worst. To deal with these challenges, a Directorate for Rural Education has to be established at national and provincial levels to interface with other rural structures for effective learner support services.

Even though the roles and responsibilities ascribed in legislation and policy to the Department of Education and the Provincial Education Departments are not reflected in the new structure, there is an urgent need for accurate information on rural schooling. Existing databases do not allow for the disaggregation of ‘rural data’. In order to maximize the value of this information, more research is required to identify useful indicators for monitoring and evaluating the performance of rural schools, educators and learners. The lack of appropriate empirical data undermines attempts to monitor and evaluate the performance of rural schools.

In terms of grading, farm schools and schools in traditional authority areas are the worst. To deal with these challenges, a Directorate for Rural Education has to be established at national and provincial levels to interface with other rural structures for effective learner support services.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Sub theme: Decision-making: National and provincial structures

At present, the DoE acknowledges rural schooling as a special case, but in a general manner — as a ‘concern’ of the department. If progress is to be made improving rural schooling, it has to be lead by the DoE. This requires leadership and a focused and sustained programme of action managed by designated structures and persons within the DoE and PEDs. No such line-management responsibilities exist in the DoE and in most PEDs. This undercuts possibilities for coordination between the DoE and PEDs and for the development and operationalization of integrated, multi-sectoral plans that relate to rural schooling.

If democracy has to be deepened in the true sense of the word, concerted efforts have to be made to address the plight of the marginalized rural learners. At the most basic level, water, sanitation, and electricity have to be provided. Incentives have to be provided to attract educators to offer their services to rural schools.

Recommendation 71:
Designate responsibility for rural schooling within the national department that provides a coordinating function across all branches and liaising functions between the DoE and the PEDs, the DoE and other government departments and non-government sectors (see Theme 4).

Recommendation 72:
Designate similar responsibilities at provincial level with an additional emphasis on links at local and district levels (see Theme 4).

Recommendation 73:
Hold regular meetings of DoE and PED officials responsible for rural schooling to share information about rural schooling, debate the impact of policy and implementation strategies (lessons learnt, best practices) and publicise these to a wide audience.

Sub theme: Entering rural domains

The major risk facing intervention strategies lead by national and provincial government lies in a lack of ‘take-up’ at district level and by the school (management, educators, learners), and community (parents and other stakeholders). Without their engagement and participation, reforms are unlikely to succeed. Developing appropriate strategies to address this policy/reality gap requires a sensitivity to rurality — an ability to see the world from the point of view of a person on the periphery of everything. This is best done by enabling rural voices to participate in decision-making processes at district and local level and at national level (through parent organisations, local traditional authority structures, and other stakeholders). Within their remit, the DoE and PEDs must ensure that the voices of learners and the community are heard.

Recommendation 74:
Devise and implement strategies to include community structures and individuals in school affairs by building on existing decision-making bodies and processes at community level. The major risk facing intervention strategies lead by national and provincial government lies in a lack of ‘take-up’ at district level and by the school (management, educators, learners), and community (parents and other stakeholders). Without their engagement and participation, reforms are unlikely to succeed. Developing appropriate strategies to address this policy/reality gap requires a sensitivity to rurality — an ability to see the world from the point of view of a person on the periphery of everything. This is best done by enabling rural voices to participate in decision-making processes at district and local level and at national level (through parent organisations, local traditional authority structures, and other stakeholders). Within their remit, the DoE and PEDs must ensure that the voices of learners and the community are heard.

Recommendation 75:
Using the public media and local radio and newspapers, provide information and develop appropriate media that reaches rural communities.

Sub theme: Forging partnerships

To rural schools, educationally there to be provided and to ensure that education is of the highest possible standards. At the most basic level, water, sanitation, and electricity have to be provided. Incentives have to be provided to attract educators to offer their services to rural schools.

Recommendation 76:
Devise and implement strategies for rural schooling as a special case, but in a general manner — as a

Recommendation 77:
Devise and implement strategies for rural schooling as a special case, but in a general manner — as a

Recommendation 78:
Devise and implement strategies for rural schooling as a special case, but in a general manner — as a

Recommendation 79:
Devise and implement strategies for rural schooling as a special case, but in a general manner — as a

Recommendation 80:
Devise and implement strategies for rural schooling as a special case, but in a general manner — as a

Recommendation 81:
Devise and implement strategies for rural schooling as a special case, but in a general manner — as a

Recommendation 82:
Devise and implement strategies for rural schooling as a special case, but in a general manner — as a
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

education NGOs or consultants (sometimes foreign) as partners. These projects could be an important source for ‘lessons learnt’ and of examples of best and worst practice. Unfortunately, there is little communication, coordination, sharing or disseminating of information between projects, PEDs and DoE.

**Recommendation 76:** Construct a national database of all projects with a rural schooling focus and develop appropriate forums for interaction between these projects.

**Recommendation 77:** Coordinate a colloquium based on rural schooling projects that have or continue to operate, to consider how best practices and lessons learnt can be captured and communicated at national, provincial and local levels and how these practices may go to scale.

**Recommendation 78:** Plan and introduce a programme of monitoring and evaluation of delivery in rural areas.

**Recommendation 79:** Evaluate the effectiveness of existing indicators to monitor and evaluate schools.

**Recommendation 80:** Develop a national database of all projects with a rural schooling focus and coordinate a colloquium based on these projects.

**Recommendation 81:** The Quality Assurance branch of the DoE should investigate ways in which the integrated Quality Management System should be adapted to make it more useful for monitoring and evaluating whole school development and educator and learner performance in rural schools.

Sub theme: Monitoring and evaluation

**Recommendation 72:** Collect data and information on rural schools.

**Recommendation 73:** Evaluate the effectiveness of existing indicators to monitor and evaluate schools.

**Recommendation 74:** Develop appropriate tools for information between these projects.

Although donor funded projects are evaluated, the reports or findings often remain in the private domain. The programme of evaluation needs to be expanded to include all parts of the rural education system and should be a requirement for all projects of a specified nature.

**Recommendation 75:** Construct a national database of all projects with a rural schooling focus and coordinate a colloquium based on these projects. These projects could be an important source for ‘lessons learnt’ and of examples of best and worst practice. There is also the potential to lever resources from non-South African (sometimes foreign) partners. These projects could be an important source for ‘lessons learnt’ and of examples of best and worst practice.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Appendix A: The Composition of the Committee

- Professor Ben Parker, University of Fort Hare (Chairperson).
- Dr Adele Gordon: Farm school education specialist and Associate of the Centre for Policy Development, Evaluation and Management (CEPD) (Research Coordinator and main writer).
- Professor Meshack Jongilanga Matshazi, University of Fort Hare
- Ms Nnyadi Boitumelo Boshego, Programme manager, Nelson Mandela Foundation
- Mr Mzikayise Sipho Khumalo, General Secretary: South African Agricultural Plantation and Allied Workers Union
- Mr H van der Merwe, CEO: Agri South Africa

Dr Gordon was responsible for directing and coordinating the consultation process and for the major share of the writing of the report. The committee was assisted by Professor Ken Harley who reviewed the public submissions and assisted with the writing of the report. The committee was given logistical and administrative support by personnel located in the Directorate: Policy Support in the System Planning Branch in the office of the Deputy Director-General: System Planning.

Ms Carol Nuga-Deliwe (Director)
Mr Mmeli Macanda (Until May 2004)
Ms Ellen Machate
Ms Thandile Khumalo (From May 2004)
Mr Mthembela Macanda (From May 2004)
Mr Deaes Gordon. From school education specialist and Associate of the Centre for Policy Development, Evaluation and Management (CEPD) (Research Coordinator and main writer).

Appendix A: The Composition of the Committee
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interviewer</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Office</th>
<th>Tel.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Director of Early Childcare Development</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5343</td>
<td>Tel:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAMUELs</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Early Childcare Development</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRANched</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Early Childcare Development</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. M A. P</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Early Childcare Development</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. M A. D</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Early Childcare Development</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. N. J. M</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Early Childcare Development</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. M S. M</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Early Childcare Development</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. M E. A</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Early Childcare Development</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. M A M</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Early Childcare Development</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. M S V</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Early Childcare Development</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. M S G</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Early Childcare Development</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. M S M</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Early Childcare Development</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. M M M</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Early Childcare Development</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. M P. P</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Early Childcare Development</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviewer</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Office</td>
<td>Tel.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deputy Director General</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
<td>Tel:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRANched</td>
<td>Deputy Director General</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. D. I. A</td>
<td>Deputy Director General</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. D. J. E</td>
<td>Deputy Director General</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. M P. W</td>
<td>Deputy Director General</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. M A. D</td>
<td>Deputy Director General</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. N. J. M</td>
<td>Deputy Director General</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. M S. M</td>
<td>Deputy Director General</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. M E. A</td>
<td>Deputy Director General</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. M A M</td>
<td>Deputy Director General</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. M S V</td>
<td>Deputy Director General</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. M S G</td>
<td>Deputy Director General</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. M S M</td>
<td>Deputy Director General</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. M M M</td>
<td>Deputy Director General</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. M P. P</td>
<td>Deputy Director General</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviewer</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Office</td>
<td>Tel.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
<td>Tel:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRANched</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. D. I. A</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. D. J. E</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. M P. W</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. M A. D</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. N. J. M</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. M S. M</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. M E. A</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. M A M</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. M S V</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. M S G</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. M S M</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. M M M</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. M P. P</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interviewer</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Office</td>
<td>Tel.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
<td>Tel:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRANched</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. D. I. A</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. D. J. E</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. M P. W</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. M A. D</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. N. J. M</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. M S. M</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. M E. A</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. M A M</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. M S V</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. M S G</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. M S M</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. M M M</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. M P. P</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>312 5361</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendix B: Interviews

National Department of Education
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interview</th>
<th>Tel.</th>
<th>Organization/Specification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>012 669 4197</td>
<td>SAVU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>012 276 8200</td>
<td>NAC'TU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>011 779 609</td>
<td>CASTU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>012 667 6244/33</td>
<td>SAVU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>011 334 4830</td>
<td>SAVU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>012 309 732</td>
<td>NVC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group Interview</td>
<td>012 324 5214</td>
<td>NAP'TOSA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Interview</td>
<td>011 433 1888</td>
<td>CIE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 18. Mr. Chris Pucall, IT Power SA. |
| 17. Mr. Akufo-Addo, Ministry of Education |
| 16. Mr. Johnnie Jansen, Aghsa |
| 15. Ms. Eunice Oduber, SGU |
| 14. Mrs. Anna Brown, VSU |
| 13. Mr. Thomas Sowa, Education Commissioner |
| 12. Mr. Michael Ofori, Ministry of Education |
| 11. Mr. Kwesi Agyeman, NAC'TU |
| 10. Ms. Sarah Wilson, Researcher (Reasearch) |
| 9. Mr. Kwabena Adjei, CAS |
| 8. Mr. Osei Okyere, SAVU |
| 7. Mr. Robert Quaye, SAVU |
| 6. Mr. Martin Ayikpo, NVC |
| 5. Mr. John Doe, NAP'TOSA |
| 4. Mr. Michael Wilson, CIE |
| 3. Mr. Steve Miller, CIE |
| 2. Mr. Frederick Williams, CIE |
| 1. Mr. John Doe, CIE |
Appendix C: Information provided by Bophimra Region, Northwest Province

Contents

1. Preamble
2. Nature of the Region
3. Statistics
  3.1. Small rural schools (roll < 50)
  3.2. Small farm schools (roll < 50)
4. Challenges of rural education
  4.1. Infrastructure
  4.2. Educational resources
  4.3. Human resources
  4.4. Governance
  4.5. Access to education
  4.6. Clusters of rural education
  4.7. Other challenges: asbestos infected areas

Recommendations

Conclusion

Curriculum Planning

1. Preamble

Provision of education in rural areas has always been regarded to be of inferior quality than in urban areas. We have no empirical evidence to confirm this statement, but we have factual evidence that provision of education in rural areas has more and serious challenges than in urban areas. Many of these issues are related to the nature of the region and the existing educational infrastructure.

2. Nature of the Region

Bophimra region is the most rural of the five regions of the North West Education department. Out of 472 schools, the majority are peri-urban and rural schools. Historically, infrastructural and social development was confined to urban areas, which resulted in a lack of educational programs and resources. This situation has led to a decline in educational quality and standards.

Although a number of policies have been put in place to address these issues, the impact on education is still felt. The Regional infrastructure with regard to roads, telecommunications, health centers, water and sanitation is shared with the Department of Education, but these areas are not specifically designated for education.

Good management and governance of schools in rural areas are key to successful implementation of educational programs and sustainable development. These two aspects have been observed to be lacking in most rural education environments.

We have to do better: Redressing the imbalance of the past.

3. Statistics

3.1. Small rural schools (roll < 50)

4. Challenges of rural education

4.1. Infrastructure

4.2. Educational resources

4.3. Human resources

4.4. Governance

4.5. Access to education

4.6. Clusters of rural education

4.7. Other challenges: asbestos infected areas

7. Recommendations

6. Conclusion

5. Curriculum Planning

4.7. Other challenges: asbestos infected areas

3.2. Small farm schools (roll < 50)

3.1. Small rural schools (roll < 50)

3. Human resources

4. Educational resources

4.1. Infrastructure

4.4. Governance
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

The planning of settlements has been allowed to continue in a haphazard manner, making it difficult for the North West Education Department to plan for new schools. Integrated Development Planning with municipalities and local authorities has not yet borne any fruit.

3. STATISTICS

3.1. Small Rural Schools (Roll <50):
- The trend displayed by most schools is that the numbers are dropping/decreasing. Communities also tend to expect the Department to provide Secondary schools in their villages regardless of the present numbers of learners admitted in primary schools.
- The allocation of teaching personnel is very problematic. Deviations from post-provisioning model create extra costs on the Department personnel budget.
- Clustering of schools as a solution has serious financial implications for the Department with regard to transport, boarding and lodging subsidies.

3.2. Small Farm Schools (Roll <50):
- The numbers keep on decreasing as a result of population movements related to farm workers. Clustering of schools as a solution has serious financial implications for the Department with regard to transport, boarding and lodging subsidies.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of School</th>
<th>Roll</th>
<th>No. of Educators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Agqunhuqhu Primary</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Baqemane Primary</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Bekwane Primary</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Baqahle Primary</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Baqemane Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Baqemane Primary</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Baqemane Primary</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Baqemane Primary</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Baqemane Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. Baqemyama Primary</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Has not yet done any farm.
4.1.1. Poor infrastructure is one of the main challenges of rural education. Most of the schools in rural areas are lacking educational resources. However, various initiatives received various educational resources.

4.1.2. Lack of sanitation is one of the major challenges. This is a heartbreaking issue in most of the rural schools. The present condition is a serious health hazard.

4.1.3. Most of the roads to rural schools are of very poor condition. This causes problems of access to schools.

4.1.4. Some of the rural schools do not have access to clean water, electricity and telephone facilities. The necessary infrastructure for the education of the learners is also one of the major challenges in rural education. Schools cannot access all facilities.

4.2. Educational resources

4.2.1. Most of the schools in rural areas are lacking educational resources. Projects involving NGO’s were active in rural schools as such schools in rural areas receive various educational resources. However, various projects involving rural schools.

4.2.2. Projects that were involving rural schools:

- Oxford
- FEBDEP (Commercial subjects)
- STANGIC (Commercial subjects)
- TANIC (Arts and culture)
- NEEP
- MCPT (Mathematics)
- READ (Literacy - Foundation phase)
- OLSET
- MMRI

4.2.3. The resources received from the above NGO projects covers a wide spectrum including:

- Water
- Toilet
- literacy
- Commercial subjects (TANIC, STANGIC)
- Mathematics
- Arts and culture
- Literacy
- Reading
- Mathematics
- Science
- Social Sciences
- Languages
- Computer Studies
- Sports
- Music
- Art
- Physical Education
- English
- Science
- Math

4.3. Challenges of rural education

- Infrastructure
  - Poor infrastructure is one of the main challenges of rural education. Most of the schools in rural areas are lacking educational resources. However, various initiatives received various educational resources.
  - Lack of sanitation is one of the major challenges. This is a heartbreaking issue in most of the rural schools. The present condition is a serious health hazard.
  - Most of the roads to rural schools are of very poor condition. This causes problems of access to schools.
  - Some of the rural schools do not have access to clean water, electricity and telephone facilities. The necessary infrastructure for the education of the learners is also one of the major challenges in rural education. Schools cannot access all facilities.

- Educational resources
  - Projects involving NGO’s were active in rural schools as such schools in rural areas receive various educational resources. However, various projects involving rural schools.

- Projects that were involving rural schools:
  - Oxford
  - FEBDEP (Commercial subjects)
  - STANGIC (Commercial subjects)
  - TANIC (Arts and culture)
  - NEEP
  - MCPT (Mathematics)
  - READ (Literacy - Foundation phase)
  - OLSET
  - MMRI

- The resources received from the above NGO projects covers a wide spectrum including:
  - Water
  - Toilet
  - literacy
  - Commercial subjects (TANIC, STANGIC)
  - Mathematics
  - Arts and culture
  - Literacy
  - Reading
  - Mathematics
  - Science
  - Social Sciences
  - Languages
  - Computer Studies
  - Sports
  - Music
  - Art
  - Physical Education
  - English
  - Science
  - Math
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

- Atlases
- Mathematics kits
- Workbooks
- Radios
- Resource center equipments

4.2.4. An aspect which must be noted is that although a relatively large number of NGO partners are present in the region, the number of schools supported is very small. Special reference is made to textbooks in the FET phase; a possible reason might be the implementation of Curriculum 2005 in rural schools.

4.3. Human resources

4.3.1. Both unqualified and under qualified educators were dealt with via Resolution 1 of 2003. Underqualified educators were being assisted through the National Programme for Educators Development.

5. CURRICULUM PLANNING

5.1. As from Grade R to Grade 9, learning areas are compulsory in all schools as determined by Resolution 1 of 2003.

5.2. In the FET band, educational needs are addressed in the curriculum offerings at rural schools. The majority of schools have a basic number of subjects, mostly 2 languages and 1 mathematics. Special reference is made to the curriculum offerings at rural schools.

Other Challenges

4.4. Governance

4.4.1. This is one area which is impacting on the performance of rural schools. Some members of the governing structures of these schools need training in a number of things so as to be capacitated to do enough to keep the schools on track.

4.4.2. Due to lack of proper governance of schools, some parents neglect their main role of being in loco parentis with the educators. The governing structures do not do enough as they are not sure of their responsibilities.

4.5. Asbestos affected areas still pose a great challenge as they are a health hazard.

4.5.1. Overqualified educators in rural schools possibly due to child labour in farms/rural schools.

4.5.2. Absences involved areas still pose a great challenge as they are a health hazard.

5.1.1. Overqualified educators in rural schools possibly due to child labour in farms/rural schools.

5.2.1. As from Grade R to Grade 9, learning areas are compulsory in all schools as determined by Resolution 1 of 2003.

5.2.2. The trend is also for learners to enrol for subjects on standard grade level, as performance of learners who opted for standard grade level does not meet that of a learner who opted for higher grade level.

5.2.3. The trend is also for learners to enrol for subjects on standard grade level, as performance of learners who opted for higher grade level does not meet that of a learner who opted for standard grade level.

5.2.4. In the FET band, educational needs are addressed in the curriculum offerings at rural schools. The majority of schools have a basic number of subjects, mostly 2 languages and 1 mathematics. Special reference is made to the curriculum offerings at rural schools.

5.3. Human resources

5.3.1. As from Grade R to Grade 9, learning areas are compulsory in all schools as determined by Resolution 1 of 2003.

5.3.2. Small rural/farm schools are adversely affected by post provisioning model.
5.3. Subject offered at rural schools quite often find it difficult to find relevant qualified educators.

5.5. Specialist subjects e.g. Technical subjects, computer science are almost non-existent in rural schools.

5.6. Small rural/farm schools with only one or two educators and a curriculum from grades 1 to 6 find it extremely challenging to cope. Small number of learners per grade as opposed to large scale schools.

6. CONCLUSION

It must be noted that in spite of these challenges, the Department has made remarkable strides in developing rural education. Some rural areas have modern facilities and suitably qualified human resources.

7. RECOMMENDATIONS

· Focus training on Government matters should be conducted at rural schools.
· School infrastructure in rural areas needs to be revisited to benefit rural schools.
· Child labour needs to be discouraged by the relevant Department and Transversors need to be discouraged.
· In-service training programmes for HIV/AIDS, access to social grants need to be heightened.
· In-service training programmes need to be included in rural areas.
· Teacher education programmes.
· Preference for school infrastructure should be in rural areas.
· Departmental needs to be biased in favour of rural areas.
· Focus training on Government matters should be conducted at rural schools.
· Child labour needs to be discouraged by the relevant Department and Transversors need to be discouraged.
· In-service training programmes for HIV/AIDS, access to social grants need to be heightened.
· In-service training programmes need to be included in rural areas.
· Teacher education programmes.
· Preference for school infrastructure should be in rural areas.
· Departmental needs to be biased in favour of rural areas.
· Focus training on Government matters should be conducted at rural schools.
· Child labour needs to be discouraged by the relevant Department and Transversors need to be discouraged.
· In-service training programmes for HIV/AIDS, access to social grants need to be heightened.
· In-service training programmes need to be included in rural areas.
· Teacher education programmes.
· Preference for school infrastructure should be in rural areas.
· Departmental needs to be biased in favour of rural areas.

6. CONCLUSION

It must be noted that in spite of these challenges, the Department has made remarkable strides in developing rural education. Some rural areas have modern facilities and suitably qualified human resources.

5.6. Small rural/farm schools with only one or two educators and a curriculum from grades 1 to 6 find it extremely challenging to cope. Small number of learners per grade as opposed to large scale schools.

5.5. Specialist subjects e.g. Technical subjects, computer science are almost non-existent in rural schools.

5.3. Subject offered at rural schools quite often find it difficult to find relevant qualified educators.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Appendix D: Overview and Analysis of Submissions made to the Ministerial Committee of Rural Education, November, 2004

Professor Ken Harley, November 2004

Background

On 11 March 2004 the then Minister of Education Professor Kadar Asmal gazetted the establishment of a Ministerial Committee on Rural Education (MCRE) to explore conditions of rural education and training. The Committee’s brief was to focus on issues relating to the quality of learning and teaching, to clarify issues affecting education outcomes in General Education and Training and in the schooling stream of Further Education and Training. In particular, the MCRE was to focus on institutions in commercial farming areas, institutions in the former homelands, and in peri-urban locations.

The public was invited to make submissions on the subject of rural education. This was followed by a letter from the Director-General of Education to Provincial Departments of Education, asking for a response to a detailed questionnaire on rural education.

Sixty-three public and provincial submissions were received. The present document is a collective representation of public submissions and the provincial questionnaire. It has two parts:

(a) Overview and Summary of submissions
(b) Analysis of submissions.

Note: for purposes of this document, questionnaires were conflated with public submissions in the Overview and Analysis because a detailed analysis of the questionnaires would not have yielded the representative picture of provincial practices in line with the format of the questionnaire. Reasons for this will be evident in subsequent discussion.

Method of summarising and analysing submissions

The analysis was carried out on a commissioned 10 day contract basis.

Respondents’ comments on the call for submissions

It is clear that the Minister’s call for submissions struck a responsive chord. Several submissions were prefaced with comments such as:

“I firstly thank the Minister of Education for this initiative.”

“Thank you for this opportunity to raise some of the highlights as well as the problems / deficiencies regarding education within this Municipal area.”

Respondents, comments on the call for submissions

From the summary, it is apparent that respondents focused on the mission of MCRE.

The analysis of submissions (Section B) is more interpretative. It was aimed at identifying issues arising from the summary for purposes of contributing to, and taking forward, the mission of MCRE.

Section A: Overview and Summary of Submissions

Respondents were invited to submit comments on the call for submissions. It is clear that the Minister’s call for submissions struck a responsive chord. Several submissions were prefaced with comments such as:

“I firstly thank the Minister of Education for this initiative.”

“Thank you for this opportunity to raise some of the highlights as well as the problems / deficiencies regarding education within this Municipal area.”

The analyses was carried out on a commissioned 10 day contract basis.

Method of summarising and analysing submissions

The analysis was carried out on a commissioned 10 day contract basis.

Respondents’ comments on the call for submissions

It is clear that the Minister’s call for submissions struck a responsive chord. Several submissions were prefaced with comments such as:

“I firstly thank the Minister of Education for this initiative.”

“Thank you for this opportunity to raise some of the highlights as well as the problems / deficiencies regarding education within this Municipal area.”

Background

On 11 March 2004 the then Minister of Education Professor Kadar Asmal gazetted the establishment of a Ministerial Committee on Rural Education, November, 2004
However, there was one significant note of discord concerning the medium of communication in this regard:

"SADTU would like to raise a serious concern regarding the manner in which the consultative process is unfolding. We view the use of the website as an exclusionary strategy which leaves most of the people who have an interest in the status of rural education, with a lack of opportunity to input into the process. … What other mechanism did the Ministerial Committee embark upon in order to hear the voices of the rural poor themselves …? We are appealing to the Ministerial Committee to reconsider other interactive and communicative mechanisms that might enrich the consultative process …"

Another voice of discord seems to imply a certain lack of confidence in the process to be followed in taking submissions forward:

"… on 25th August 2000, I made a submission to the National Ministry of Education when they were seeking public opinion about 'Review of Curriculum 2005'. A national call for public input went out and I am sad to report that I am still awaiting an acknowledgement of receipt or a response on my submission."

Nevertheless, the comprehensive nature of many responses suggests that respondents were at pains to respond constructively to an issue they clearly perceived to be very important.

The nature of submissions

Submission forms a single individual or organization was regarded as a single unit.

Individual responses

Table 2 (see Annex 1) provides the overview of individual submissions:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Respondent</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Universities*</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education Departments</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizations</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individuals</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* The figure for universities includes 1 technikon and 1 university from USA.

** Of the seven Departmental submissions, 3 were in response to the public invitation and 4 in response to the provincial questionnaire. The submissions included a funding proposal for the extension of the life of a project, a report on the School Nutrition Programme, and a report on policy with respect to centres of learning. While these have relevance to rural education and certainly contribute towards it, they were not framed on rural education and dealt on certain contributory elements of the review process. While those have relevance to rural education and the work of the Committee, they do not address the question of the extent to which rural education is undermined by the more general weaknesses of the education system.

The challenge of interpreting submissions of this kind and of allocating categories to an analytic framework must be acknowledged as a limitation of this Overview and Analysis.

Table 1 (see Annex 1) provides the overview of individual submissions:

Submissions varied considerably with respect to:

Length, which varied between less than single page statements to lengthy, detailed reports. Such reports dealt with research, reviews, and project or course material. For purposes of analysis, a submission from a single individual or organization was regarded as a single unit.

Inferences and conclusions

By design of default, look pieces in rural settings. Such submissions fill the MCRE to draw their own conclusions. However, most took the form of accounts of research or experience of specific activities that by design or default took place in rural settings. Such submissions left the MCRE to draw their own inferences and conclusions.

Nonetheless, the comprehensive nature of many responses suggests that respondents were at pains to respond constructively to an issue they clearly perceived to be very important. However, there was one significant note of discord concerning the medium of communication in this regard.

Individual responses

Table 2 (see Annex 1) provides the overview of individual submissions:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Respondent</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Universities*</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education Departments</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizations</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individuals</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* The figure for universities includes 1 technikon and 1 university from USA.

** Of the seven Departmental submissions, 3 were in response to the public invitation and 4 in response to the provincial questionnaire. The submissions included a funding proposal for the extension of the life of a project, a report on the School Nutrition Programme, and a report on policy with respect to centres of learning. While these have relevance to rural education and certainly contribute towards it, they were not derived from specific policy on rural education. Details on responses to the provincial questionnaire follow under a separate heading.

76 There were 5 such responses from individuals (2 principals and 3 individuals likely to be teachers), and 2 teacher unions. Human Rights Watch and the Education Rights Project addressed farm schools, but not rural education more broadly.

77 The challenge of interpreting submissions of this kind and of allocating categories to an analytic framework must be acknowledged as a limitation of this Overview and Analysis.

78 Note on reading the tables: Statistics based on open-ended responses are inevitably approximations. Statistics in the following tables are best read as relative weightings of emphasis. Totals in the tables are not equivalent to the number of submissions – e.g. one submission was anonymous, and 5 were no more than acknowledgements. Categories that appeared to be of secondary significance to respondents were also omitted in the interests of not diverting from numerically strong points.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Notes:

- A surprising feature of responses from higher education is that only 6 were from Faculties or Schools of Education. Other main contributors were Humanities (3), Maths and Science (3) and Psychology (2). From the schooling sector, there were 2 submissions from school principals, and a number of the individual submissions appeared to be from teachers. A more positive way of looking at the relatively weak representation of ‘mainstream’ education is to assert that other disciplinary areas are relatively strongly represented.

- Formal schooling enjoyed almost exclusive focus. ABET was barely mentioned. Of the 20 organizations, half did not have education as their main focus (e.g., the focus was on nutrition, agriculture, the rights of children).

Table 3  Basis of submissions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code of submission</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4  Apparent value basis of submission (impressionistic judgment)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category of concern</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Concern for human rights, social development, equity, safety, health</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality / process of learning experience, cognitive issues</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bureaucratic accountability</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5  MCRE Terms of Reference addressed - a prominent thrust of submission was on:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term of Reference</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Offering recommendations</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conditions in rural schools</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of learning and teaching</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcomes of educational practice</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6  Perception of 'rural education'

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Perception of rural education</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Seen in terms of opportunity to build</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seen in terms of obstacles to development</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7  Basis of submissions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code of submission</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes:

- One organization provided 2 sets of documents, one providing research, one defining a service.

- Submissions evidenced an acute awareness of human rights issues and the Constitution, as in: “Section 29 of the Constitution states: ‘Everyone has a right to basic education’ …” or: “Preamble to the SA Schools Act states: ‘This country requires a new national system for schools which will address past injustices in the schools sector …’”.

- Concerns addressed were primarily Scottish, education, etc., and not a focus on education per se.

- Suggestion of reaction was less explicit, but a few responses mentioned a need for better education and training of teachers.

- The focus was on nutrition, agriculture, etc., rather than education per se.

- Departments of children.

- Of the organizations, only 3 had not received any submission at all. The focus was on nutrition, agriculture, etc.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Table 7  Major points of recommendation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendations</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Improve/equalise facilities/resources</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Build on/around community approaches</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrated, multi-sectoral approaches</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>'Whole school/district' approach to development</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improved management/leadership</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better departmental support</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Links with HE institutions, other schools, industry</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improved management/leadership</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improved multi-sectoral approaches</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Built on/around community approaches</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improved facilities/reserves</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes:
- The benefit of schools operating in 'clusters' was frequently implicit. Surprisingly, it was not explicitly offered as a recommendation.
- One possible reason for this is that it seems to be regarded as a fact of life in sites where it has been in operation.

Table 8  Main focus of submission: conditions to enable learning, or focus on curriculum issues?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Submission mainly concerned with conditions to enable learning or focus on curriculum issues</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Submission included focus on actual learning/curriculum issues</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submission included focus on learning/curriculum issues</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A note on responses to Provincial questionnaires

| Of the four responses received, one was received too late for inclusion in the analysis; and of the other three, only one followed the format of the questionnaire in a consolidated way. The other two provided documentation relevant to questionnaire items, but not necessarily in direct response to them. It appeared as if collating holistic information was no easy task for provincial departments as different classes of information appear to reside in different directorates or in district offices. In a covering letter accompanying one of the returned questionnaires it was stated: “Please note the positioning of education in the province is not clearly divided into rural and urban. It is therefore difficult to respond to all the questions due to the absence of clear criteria to differentiate the schools…” The Department does not have a committee dedicated to rural education, however, rural education matters are discussed within the Cross-Border Committee of the Department. Western Cape Education Department has a “Rural Education Provisioning Framework” which tries to ensure quality education for rural schools. This involves measures of economy of scale, expressed in terms of such things as “Farm schools > 25 learners to amalgamate or close; if <100 learners only 2 phases per school; Learner Transport Schemes (LTS) to be phased out gradually.” In the Western Cape we have ensured this right [learners having access to farm schools and adequate learning conditions] by making sure that all 315 farm schools have been signed.

Successes and Failures

As a follow up to the general features of submissions, here we list successes and failures as indicated, or alluded to, by respondents. Some of these successes and failures might be of a limited scale or even anecdotal by respondents. Some of these successes and failures as indicated, or inferred from responses to Provincial questionnaires, are:

- Central role of farm schools
- Better provision for teachers (including incentives)
- Improved departmental support
- Links with universities, other schools, industry
- Improved management/leadership
- Improved multi-sectoral approaches
- Built on/around community approaches
- Improved facilities/reserves

Western Cape Education Department has a “Rural Education Provisioning Framework” which tries to ensure quality education for rural schools. This involves measures of economy of scale, expressed as principles such as: “Farm schools > 25 learners to amalgamate or close; if <100 learners only 2 phases per school; Learner Transport Schemes (LTS) to be phased out gradually.” In the Western Cape we have ensured this right [learners having access to farm schools and adequate learning conditions] by making sure that all 315 farm schools have been signed.

80 An additional four provincial submissions were received subsequent to the writing of this analysis of submissions and the information was included in the final report.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Successes

Initiatives involving partnerships and multi-sectoral approaches

Whatever tensions and stresses might have occurred were not mentioned in reports. In fact, the partnership model is widely accepted and praised as being essential for success.

_initiatives involving partnerships and multi-sectoral approaches_

Feeding schemes

In school building design and management, together with community support, after pilot, it was found that:

School Infrastructure and Community

In instances of community and policy support for a school

School infrastructure work wonders for quality education

School infrastructure work wonders for quality education

Involving a Farm School

Several submissions alluded to community support as essential ingredients in the success initiative.

School Infrastructure and Community

Involving a Farm School

Several submissions alluded to community support as essential ingredients in the success initiative.

Feeding schemes

Overall, the permutations of partnerships are varied and impressive.

School Infrastructure and Community

Involving a Farm School

Several submissions alluded to community support as essential ingredients in the success initiative.

Feeding schemes

Overall, the permutations of partnerships are varied and impressive.

School Infrastructure and Community

Involving a Farm School

Several submissions alluded to community support as essential ingredients in the success initiative.

Feeding schemes

Overall, the permutations of partnerships are varied and impressive.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

are forced to teach more than one grade at once." However, seemingly disadvantage has the potential to
be turned into a positive feature:

"The Multigrade Rural Schools Intervention of the Western Cape Education Department has been running since 2001.
A considerable amount of experience (dominant practices - different from those in urban areas) and data have been built up …
As noted in this document, properly supported, it has the potential to encourage self directed learning and learner activity
methods."

One form of support mentioned was through the use of technology in the form of the Multigrade website
which could be accessed at http://wced.wcape.gov.za.

Similarly, a report on the Kgatelopele project cites a teacher reporting that:

"[After workshops] … when we cluster with project multigrade classes, we really know what to do, even though it takes time …
I feel very positive …"

The clustering of schools for development and support has become a standard feature of most funded
projects. Reports are consistently positive, e.g.:

"Many NGOs involved in teacher development have used clusters as an organizational tool in their delivery of training. It is
believed that clustering can help address the often limited or insufficient impact of cascade training, and that clustering fits in well
with the move to decentralization of educational services. It also purports to offer a means of countering the shortfall in district
personnel in terms of school-based support in under-resourced districts."

School clusters

The clustering of schools for development and support has become a standard feature of most funded
projects. Reports are consistently positive, e.g.:

The distribution of materials to schools, the Resources and Information Network (RAIN) has achieved
striking success in distributing materials to the 6000 schools in KwaZulu-Natal. In conjunction with the
operation of school clusters, RAIN has provided a valuable infrastructure and pool of expertise.

Whereas the broader literature on materials distribution in Africa reports depressingly consistent failure in
distributing materials to schools, the Resources and Information Network (RAIN) has achieved
striking success in distributing materials to the 6000 schools in KwaZulu-Natal. In conjunction with the
operation of school clusters, RAIN has provided a valuable infrastructure and pool of expertise.

With support, the cluster model appears sustainable: "Clusters can now run the model on their own, but
schools and develop a shared vision of how they will jointly use resources, support and maintain these centres to meet
needs."

The school cluster community is actively involved in the provision of support for school clusters, and is supported by a national coordination body.

Project experiences

It is rare for projects to report failure, especially as evaluation reports are frequently based upon
the perceptions and opinions of stakeholders. Nevertheless, amongst the reported successes submitted,
several projects stand out. The Multimedia Rural Initiative is presented as a sophisticated and high
tech intervention that is at the same time applicable to the rural contexts for which it was designed. This
promising project has already reached into rural areas, combining professional development with support
for clusters of schools and communities around them. This project is also linked to poverty alleviation and
the eradication of HIV/AIDS. Therefore, the education and health strategies employed in the project can be seen as
complementary, and the project can be seen as an example of successful integration of education and health.

The project has been evaluated in terms of its impact on teacher professional development, and the results have been positive. Teachers reported feeling more confident and competent in delivering multimedia lessons, and students showed an increased interest in learning.

The project has also been evaluated in terms of its impact on school leadership and management. The results have been positive, with leaders reporting an increased ability to lead and manage schools effectively.

Overall, there is a rich body of knowledge on project experiences. Much of it, however, has not been
deliberately exposed to the public domain.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Small scale, locally relevant teacher development works?

Success has been reported in relatively small but locally relevant teacher development initiatives. One such reads:

"The dramatic growth patterns observed in the teachers' professional development is phenomenal. This improvement in skills can be attributed to a combination of factors such as facilitation during classroom visits, lesson modelling, workshops and ultimately the implementation of learning material to change an overwhelmingly facilitation style or approach to teaching. All of this occurred within the OBE paradigm."

Failures

It is notable that the successes identified above do not represent advances at a systemic level. With the exception of the National School Nutrition Programme, the successes have come about as a result of 'add on' initiatives and projects that have taken place outside of the formal educational system (even though provincial departments are invariably partners in project conceptualisation and management).

In the judgement of respondents, the system itself has failed rural schools, or at least has failed them relative to their urban counterparts. The first failure described below is of the system itself. It is followed by descriptions of failures that are constituent parts of the system.

Rural and farm schooling at a systemic level

In the judgement of respondents, the system itself has failed rural schools, or at least has failed them relative to their urban counterparts. The first failure described below is of the system itself. It is followed by descriptions of failures that are constituent parts of the system.

Public schools on private property

While the legal framework adopted by the government to convert schools on commercial farms is in place, "the process of concluding these contracts has been unacceptably slow and threatens the continued operation of these schools. To date, a minority of these farm schools is governed by such agreements. To deal a major blow to farm schools, the government has legislated the closure or conversion to rural schools."

A legal question asked is: "...given that 88 percent of Farm Schools were not covered by Section 14 agreements by the end of 2000, why might this be?"

When the legal frameworks adopted by the government to convert schools on commercial farms are in place, rural and farm schools were specifically described as being underdeveloped and incapable of the educational quality of the system.

Lack of departmental support for school managers and teachers

Departmental support was a powerful and consistent theme, e.g.

"In many provinces they are the main drivers for generic and targeted training. The improvement in skills has resulted from the attendance of this province's professional development initiatives."

"A legal question asked is: "...given that 88 percent of Farm Schools were not covered by Section 14 agreements by the end of 2000, why might this be?"

At the same time, it is acknowledged that the issue is complex, with some suspicion on both sides. Broad changes impinge too: the changing nature of farming operations in some regions reportedly affects prospects for amelioration, and "in some cases, farmers refuse to sign agreements that pending land claims where farm schools are located."

Rural and farm schooling at a systemic level

In the judgement of respondents, the system itself has failed rural schools, or at least has failed them relative to their urban counterparts. The first failure described below is thus of the system itself. It is followed by descriptions of failures that are constituent parts of the system.

Rural and farm schooling at a systemic level

In the judgement of respondents, the system itself has failed rural schools, or at least has failed them relative to their urban counterparts. The first failure described below is thus of the system itself. It is followed by descriptions of failures that are constituent parts of the system.

Failure 1: Provincial departments are inadequate partners in professional development and management.

Provincial departments are inadequate partners in professional development and management, e.g.

"The problem is that the South African Department of Education has not taken the lead role in the development and management of the National School Improvement Programme. "The success rate has improved as a result of the Department's active role in the promotion and management of the National School Improvement Programme.""
Implementation of C2005

are the key problems at places of higher education. Ensuring that money is received and the fee paid through the student's union is a challenging task. There are also concerns that the amount of money paid is not enough for the students.

"The highly qualified and skilled personnel have little impact on the quality of education. The economy is shrinking rapidly and the funding for education is limited. Some universities have to provide additional funds to attract students."

The lack of transparency and accountability is also a concern. It is not clear how much of the government's money is being used for education.

Lack of accountability

linked to support for school personnel is the question of their accountability. This is especially true in rural areas where there is a lack of transparency and accountability.

A Provincial Department noted that:

"The influence of local politicians is very minimal. Most members of SGBs are elected, but their influence on policy implementation is minimal."

Non-functional or dysfunctional SGBs

The provinces have few meeting places and SGBs' meeting places are often underutilized. The high illiteracy levels of SGB members contribute to their non-functional or dysfunctional state.

One Department noted:

"The highly qualified and skilled personnel have been idle for most of the past eighteen months. The Giyani Multi-Purpose Centre is standing empty and its staff, I wish to reiterate, underutilized. Some persons make no effort to report or register that they are around, and others are allowed to sign in on their behalf. There are staff members who are currently studying as if they are full-time students at places of higher education, enjoying their monthly remuneration and time they are granted."

Implementation of C2005

Curriculum and issues of education quality were seemingly overshadowed by the more immediate and pressing problems of needs and resources (see Table 8). Insufficient comment on the part of respondents makes it difficult to assert too much in this regard, but there were suggestions that C2005 was not being implemented in a manner consistent with policy script. For example, one Department noted that schools were not yet using "the NQF" as a framework. The isolation of schools was compounded by problems such as overcrowding and lack of learning materials.

Lack of resources and lack of utilization of available resources

Therefore, the problem of school resources is widespread. The highly qualified and skilled personnel have been idle for most of the past eighteen months. The Giyani Multi-Purpose Centre is standing empty and its staff, I wish to reiterate, underutilized. Some persons make no effort to report or register that they are around, and others are allowed to sign in on their behalf. There are staff members who are currently studying as if they are full-time students at places of higher education, enjoying their monthly remuneration and time they are granted.

"The highly qualified and skilled personnel have little impact on the quality of education. The economy is shrinking rapidly and the funding for education is limited. Some universities have to provide additional funds to attract students."

The lack of transparency and accountability is also a concern. It is not clear how much of the government's money is being used for education.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Difficulties; and teachers suffered from "work overload because of multigrade classes" and were in need of training.

Conditions of service for teachers

There is widespread agreement that there is a problem around conditions of service for teachers in rural areas. This is best reflected in a report from one province:

"Poor services discourage better-qualified educators from teaching in rural areas. Previously educators were not part of the homeowners' scheme. Eventually when they were put on board, educators in the rural schools were still excluded. This scenario leads to a situation where the educators prefer to travel to work than to stay in the rural areas. Late coming, therefore, becomes the order of the day."

Having to use their own vehicles on bad roads compounds the problem, as does lack of access to facilities such as medicine and health. Thus: "Employment in rural areas becomes the last resort while the educator is looking for greener pastures."

Omissions / areas accorded secondary status

In terms of the range of organizations and individuals who made submissions, there is an imbalance favoring providers of education. An impressive range of service providers and interested parties made submissions. However, there is a completed void with respect to the intended beneficiaries of education. Not a single voice from parents and learners is represented in this report.

In terms of issues raised, there were some surprising omissions or lack of emphasis:

- Issues of gender were barely touched on (and when they were, by organizations such as a youth development agency).
- One would imagine that medium of instruction would be a pressing issue in rural and farm schools, but there were few references to it. Exceptions were the principal who declared that it was a bad system that did not provide mother-tongue instruction; and a teacher union which commented on the relationship between the dominant language - English - and power relations.
- FET was barely mentioned (with an exception being the teacher union which drew attention to the issue of gender equity pending on how many boys, by organizations such as a youth development agency).
- There is a wide spread of organizations and individuals who made submissions, there is need to look at the range of organizations and individuals who made submissions, and then assess areas accorded secondary status.

In terms of issues raised, there were some surprising omissions or lack of emphasis.

There is widespread agreement that there is a problem around conditions of service for teachers in rural areas; and teachers suffered from "work overload because of multigrade classes" and were in need of training.
Section B: Analysis of submissions

This analysis is intended to build on issues arising from the Overview, with the intention of moving towards pointers and strategies as the next step for the MCRE.

Experience and knowledge base from submissions

Notwithstanding the unfortunate fact that parents and learners did not make submissions, the activities outlined in submissions are testimony to the commitment and passion of a wide range of parties who are intent on improving the lives of all South Africans through education. There is an acute awareness of social justice and human rights issues.

The range of organisations who made submissions is one indication of the number and diversity of the parties interested in rural education. Reports on initiatives to improve rural schooling provide a further indication of the diversity of ‘players’ in the field, as is evident in submissions from organisations such as Municipalities, the Health sector, and Human Rights Watch. The culture of ‘partnerships’ is flourishing too – at least 10 of the reported initiatives in the field involved partnerships of one kind or another. In terms of research, initiatives and inventions in the field, submissions testify to the value and promise of creative local solutions to our particular challenges.

Involvement in rural education is clearly not the sole preserve of ‘formal’ or ‘mainstream’ education. On the contrary, ‘mainstream’ education is relatively weakly represented in the submissions from institutions of higher education. (This is linked, perhaps, to the lack of focus on curriculum and teaching and learning in the submissions.) Similarly, with one exception, reports from the provincial departments did not convey an impression of being ‘on top’ of service delivery or even planning with respect to rural education and farm schools. In contrast with the innovation evident in project initiatives, provinces seem to be locked into existing bureaucratic arrangements which appear to be given as evident in the following response:

“Directorate to concentrate on the farm schools seems to a non-starter. If this route has to be taken then a sub-Directorate under the General Education and Training Directorate may be considered like it is the case with the Adult Basic Education and Training (ABET) issue. …. Any committee or structure created outside the Circuit Office is a non-starter.”

Tensions in the views of respondents

One of the weaknesses in the type of Overview and Summary in Section A of this report is that the views and experiences of individual respondents may not be broadly representative. Respondents may also not agree with each other. Potential areas of disagreement or tension were evident in submissions, and it can be helpful to identify these. Briefly:

· How does education serve development when much of its attraction is that it provides the avenue for some successful individuals to escape to modernity?

The strong stress on building education within the Community, and respecting indigenous knowledges, in many submissions may be in tension with curriculum policy with its underpinning principles of learner centredness, and creative and critical thinking.

The range of organisations which made submissions is one indication of the number and diversity of the parties interested in rural education. There is an acute awareness of social justice and human rights issues.

This analysis is intended to build on issues arising from the Overview, with the intention of moving towards pointers and strategies as the next step for the MCRE.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

The experience of the community in practice should be mirrored by policies that address these issues. Most respondents saw rural education in completely different terms. Some, on the other hand, saw rural issues of asset or potential. This clearly important distinction is developed in the section that follows.

In some views, a continuous professional development model “may take us beyond the ‘workshop culture’ that has overtaken professional development in South Africa.” At the same time, workshops are an integral feature of some of the successful small scale local development projects reported in submissions.

Do democratic principles or educational principles prevail? For example, in one provincial report parents did not avail themselves of opportunity for early mother tongue instruction when 2 teachers were provided, but parents took away their kids to an Afrikaans-medium school. Where teachers were provided, the parents took away their kids to an Afrikaans-medium school. Some, on the other hand, saw rural communities in terms of asset or potential. This distinction is developed in the section that follows.

84 This submission also contained negative stereotypes: “Schools in rural areas seen not to stick to time schedule.” “Pupils and teachers arrive very late at school — loss of teaching hours.” … “History has proved that the parent or rural learners are not involved and do not accept responsibility for either the establishment or upkeep of teaching facilities of their children.” Rather than blaming the history and systems for poverty, this submission appeared to be blaming the poor for their poverty.
Establishing principles

Possibilities for taking forward the work of MCRE
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

“EMDCs cover:
Farm land
Small towns
Informal settlements

But the statistics hide essential differences:
Gender differences across the province relating to access, retention and learning achievement.
Urban rural differences relating to success, retention and learning achievement.
Historically advantaged vs historically disadvantaged schools
Economic profiles of learners.

What about the differences in infrastructure and service delivery?

It is essential for these differences to be highlighted in future so that the success of policies can be monitored and evaluated.”

A submission from another province highlights the point regarding the lack of differentiation between schools. The KwaZulu-Natal policy on Education Centres has obvious relevance and potential to meet the special needs of rural schools, yet in it there is no distinction between rural and urban. Brute statistics for different categories of educational services and achievements will also inevitably be flattened out when no distinction exists between classes of schools.

If it is accepted that rural and farm schools should constitute a special category of school, definition will be necessary. In most submissions there was an assumed, taken-for-granted image of what rural education is, and what its parameters are. A small number of submissions grappled with definition without reaching firm conclusions. In various ways it was certainly depicted as a multi-facetted concept that could include cultural as well as geographic factors, poverty indices, and even unique school challenges:

The challenges that confront these schools are very often different from the challenges faced by other public schools.”

Other submissions alluded to potentially fraught social relationships embodying potential tensions between insiders and outsiders, modernity and tradition.

Towards strategies

On the basis of submissions, consideration of strategies to improve rural education would seem to revolve around two basic, inter-related questions. First of all, what is the relationship between a focus on resources to achieve equity of access, on the one hand, and a focus on curriculum issues on the other? Submissions placed much more emphasis on curriculum, learning and teaching (see Section A, Table 4). Similarly, the dominant recommendation in Table 7 was the need to improve and equalise facilities and resources. None of the categories in Table 7 invoked curriculum issues. Table 8 reflects the situation most clearly: above all, submissions were concerned with the provision of enabling conditions for learning and teaching.

The seeming neglect of curriculum issues could be serious. Recent literature is taken into account. There is no evidence that inequalities stem neither from resources, nor from the overt content of the curriculum, nor in an emphasis on learner-centred or teacher-centred philosophies, but in persistent evolved classroom practices that engage and enable different learners unequally.86

Submissions alluded to potentially fraught social relationships embodying potential tensions between insiders and outsiders, modernity and tradition.

Other submissions alluded to potentially fraught social relationships embodying potential tensions between insiders and outsiders, modernity and tradition.

A submission from another province highlights the point regarding the lack of differentiation between schools. The KwaZulu-Natal policy on Education Centres has obvious relevance and potential to meet the special needs of rural schools, yet in it there is no distinction between rural and urban. Brute statistics for different categories of educational services and achievements will also inevitably be flattened out when no distinction exists between classes of schools.

If it is accepted that rural and farm schools should constitute a special category of school, definition will be necessary. In most submissions there was an assumed, taken-for-granted image of what rural education is, and what its parameters are. A small number of submissions grappled with definition without reaching firm conclusions. In various ways it was certainly depicted as a multi-facetted concept that could include cultural as well as geographic factors, poverty indices, and even unique school challenges:

The challenges that confront these schools are very often different from the challenges faced by other public schools.”

Other submissions alluded to potentially fraught social relationships embodying potential tensions between insiders and outsiders, modernity and tradition.

Towards strategies

On the basis of submissions, consideration of strategies to improve rural education would seem to revolve around two basic, inter-related questions. First of all, what is the relationship between a focus on resources to achieve equity of access, on the one hand, and a focus on curriculum issues on the other? Submissions placed much more emphasis on curriculum, learning and teaching (see Section A, Table 4). Similarly, the dominant recommendation in Table 7 was the need to improve and equalise facilities and resources. None of the categories in Table 7 invoked curriculum issues. Table 8 reflects the situation most clearly: above all, submissions were concerned with the provision of enabling conditions for learning and teaching.

The seeming neglect of curriculum issues could be serious. Recent literature is taken into account. There is no evidence that inequalities stem neither from resources, nor from the overt content of the curriculum, nor in an emphasis on learner-centred or teacher-centred philosophies, but in persistent evolved classroom practices that engage and enable different learners unequally.86

Submissions alluded to potentially fraught social relationships embodying potential tensions between insiders and outsiders, modernity and tradition.

Other submissions alluded to potentially fraught social relationships embodying potential tensions between insiders and outsiders, modernity and tradition.

A submission from another province highlights the point regarding the lack of differentiation between schools. The KwaZulu-Natal policy on Education Centres has obvious relevance and potential to meet the special needs of rural schools, yet in it there is no distinction between rural and urban. Brute statistics for different categories of educational services and achievements will also inevitably be flattened out when no distinction exists between classes of schools.

If it is accepted that rural and farm schools should constitute a special category of school, definition will be necessary. In most submissions there was an assumed, taken-for-granted image of what rural education is, and what its parameters are. A small number of submissions grappled with definition without reaching firm conclusions. In various ways it was certainly depicted as a multi-facetted concept that could include cultural as well as geographic factors, poverty indices, and even unique school challenges:

The challenges that confront these schools are very often different from the challenges faced by other public schools.”

Other submissions alluded to potentially fraught social relationships embodying potential tensions between insiders and outsiders, modernity and tradition.

Towards strategies

On the basis of submissions, consideration of strategies to improve rural education would seem to revolve around two basic, inter-related questions. First of all, what is the relationship between a focus on resources to achieve equity of access, on the one hand, and a focus on curriculum issues on the other? Submissions placed much more emphasis on curriculum, learning and teaching (see Section A, Table 4). Similarly, the dominant recommendation in Table 7 was the need to improve and equalise facilities and resources. None of the categories in Table 7 invoked curriculum issues. Table 8 reflects the situation most clearly: above all, submissions were concerned with the provision of enabling conditions for learning and teaching.

The seeming neglect of curriculum issues could be serious. Recent literature is taken into account. There is no evidence that inequalities stem neither from resources, nor from the overt content of the curriculum, nor in an emphasis on learner-centred or teacher-centred philosophies, but in persistent evolved classroom practices that engage and enable different learners unequally.86

Submissions alluded to potentially fraught social relationships embodying potential tensions between insiders and outsiders, modernity and tradition.

A submission from another province highlights the point regarding the lack of differentiation between schools. The KwaZulu-Natal policy on Education Centres has obvious relevance and potential to meet the special needs of rural schools, yet in it there is no distinction between rural and urban. Brute statistics for different categories of educational services and achievements will also inevitably be flattened out when no distinction exists between classes of schools.

If it is accepted that rural and farm schools should constitute a special category of school, definition will be necessary. In most submissions there was an assumed, taken-for-granted image of what rural education is, and what its parameters are. A small number of submissions grappled with definition without reaching firm conclusions. In various ways it was certainly depicted as a multi-facetted concept that could include cultural as well as geographic factors, poverty indices, and even unique school challenges:

The challenges that confront these schools are very often different from the challenges faced by other public schools.”

86 See also provincial comments under the subheading ‘A note on responses to Provincial questionnaire’, Section A.

86 Similar kinds of conclusions have recently been drawn by Taylor et al (2003) and Harley and Wedekind (2004).
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Were submissions unmindful of the ultimately crucial importance of the quality of teaching and learning, or are inequalities of provision so vast that these must be addressed before curriculum issues can even be considered? In the opinion of this writer, the issue of resources had a powerfully overriding symbolic role in some submissions. A number of submissions from teachers were of this kind: rural schools did not have the computer. This seemed to become an issue in itself. On the other hand, a number of other submissions invoked the resources/enabling argument as a necessary but perhaps not sufficient condition for quality learning and teaching. This judgement is well captured in the words of a university researcher doing development work in a rural area:

"... the problem of scholastic underachievement in South Africa is by no means linearly a problem of scholastic underachievement. This problem is embedded in much deeper and more critical issues. In most schools teaching facilities are sorely lacking. We wonder how it is possible to facilitate achievement ... when children live in poor conditions often without even a toilet, a meal, running water or a bar of soap. In these circumstances, the initial aim of our research in Limpopo soon paled into insignificance. As in any intervention strategy, the individuals and their environments must be treated holistically." 87

In the judgement of the writer of this Analysis, respondents were indeed arguing for equity of provision from a human rights perspective, but that at an often implicit level, the ultimate purpose was to achieve quality of learning as well. If this interpretation is correct, corrective strategies should not view the resourcing of schools and curriculum in practice as either/or questions. The answer from respondents would seem to be: Equity of provision and quality of curriculum are indivisible.

The second question is about how 'rural' should be conceptualised in any policy or implementation strategy. Arguments concerned mainly with conditions to enable learning (see Table 8) lead easily to deficit views of rural schools and the communities in which they are situated. Indeed, Table 6 (Section A) indicates that 'rural' was indeed perceived in overwhelmingly deficit terms. How should strategies view the intended beneficiaries of reform: as Deficit or Asset?

A number of submissions pointed out the perils of conceptualising 'rural' in purely deficit terms. Such perceptions lead readily to approaches which in the words of one respondent "start by focusing on the needs, deficiencies and problems of communities and accordingly devise strategies to address these needs, deficiencies and problems of communities. This empties education of its empowering potential and reduces the quality of learning." How should strategies view the intended beneficiaries of reform: as Deficit or Asset?

Ways of taking conditions and recommendations into schools in the opinion of the writer be framed by

the community's asset/potential / focus on quality and real change with respect to what individual

Way of taking conditions and recommendations into schools in the opinion of the writer be framed by

the community's asset/potential / focus on quality and real change with respect to what individual

Ways of taking conditions and recommendations into schools in the opinion of the writer be framed by

the community's asset/potential / focus on quality and real change with respect to what individual

87 One can see how this might happen, even in a well intentioned scheme described by one respondent: "The advanced successful city or private schools have to mentor the poor and under-performing rural schools. For this to be a success the rural schools must see the benefits of this mutual relationship. They themselves must identify their mentor schools and be willing to get help. The challenge therefore is to help rural schools to see the need of learning from the successful ones."
Reconsidering ‘rural’ and rural education: (from periphery to the centre)

Rather than interpretations of respondents’ views (as immediately above) this section includes a number of quotes from respondents that might contribute to the categories with which the MCRE is currently working.

Quotes for consideration by the MCRE

A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Rather than interpretations of respondents’ views (as immediately above) this section includes a number of quotes from respondents that might contribute to the categories with which the MCRE is currently working.

"What is the meaning of resources? In each village and community there are people with useful knowledge and skills. There are active and retired professionals, there are community historians, there are those who study the land, there are the ‘wise elders’, there are traditional healers, there are people with many different kinds of experience. There are business people and so on.

There are also multiple kinds of object, book, cultural artefact, picture, family heirloom and other examples of interest and value that might be used for learning...”

"...A Community Education Forum should be established to be a platform for engagement by the community in the education and schooling of its children..."
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Poverty alleviation and rural development

The Multi-media Rural Initiative has poverty alleviation built in - but this did not seem to be a factor in other sub-missions. No illustrative quotes are available.

Special interventions: School feeding, HIV/AIDS, school safety and donor-assisted initiatives

School feeding schemes have been reported to be successful (see successes in Section A).

Funding rural education

A provincial response notes that technicalities in differentiation between levels of poverty in individual schools could lead to farm schools not being classified as the most needy.

"What most schools in poverty really require is a significant and carefully channelled increase in absolute levels of funding, designed to build capacity and improve the quality of educators. The Norms and Standards are unlikely to provide that."

"There should be a considerable bias towards rural schools supported by effective monitoring committees for earmarked fund allocation for each school."

The shape and size of the rural school system

"Overall, the capacity in rural areas is very weak and so learners are leaving for bigger centres, better schools."

One province notes a drop in the number of learners from Grade 7 onwards.

Governance and management across all tiers

(A School Principal):

"What the capacity in rural areas is very weak and so learners are leaving for bigger centres, better schools."

Governance and management across all tiers

The shape and size of the rural school system

Earmarked and allocated for each school (Provincial Education Department).

"There should be a considerable bias towards rural schools supported by effective monitoring committees for earmarked fund allocation for each school."

... under the policy of differentiation between levels of poverty in individual schools..."
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

While clustering seems to offer a solution to the problems of teacher isolation, lack of resources and insufficient support for schools, questions remain as to whether it is indeed a sustainable strategy, especially for rural and deep rural schools. The costs of travel between far-flung rural schools, the time and personnel it takes to co-ordinate cluster activities, are all difficulties that clusters encounter. Yet there seems to be principled support for the strategy for clustering schools as a means of enhancing education delivery. However, this is not translated into significant and concrete support for the clusters. At the provincial level, no department of education seems to have a formal policy in place that makes the point that we will take these issues seriously.

In terms of grading the farm schools and traditional authority areas school are the worst (sic). To deal with these challenges a Directorate of Rural Education has to be established at provincial level to interface with all other rural community structures for effective learner support services.

Curriculum and priority learning areas

Very little was offered here. There is a need to make mother-tongue instruction the norm in public schools. Many of our parents are unable to communicate in English yet demand that their children are taught from Grade 0 to Grade 1 in English. It is a bad system that does not make mother-tongue instruction the norm in public schools. A good teacher can provide education to about 50% of learners in the public school system. Public schools on private commercial farms constitute 13 percent of all state-funded schools and numbers appear to have been declining since 1994.

Farm schools

Farm schools based on education to provide support services. It will take a very serious campaign from very high up to make the point that we will take these issues seriously.

Educators (recruitment, conditions of service, professional development)

There are not enough teachers and principals who have the capability, support and ability to run a school. Many of our parents are unable to communicate in English yet demand that their children are taught from Grade 0 to Grade 1 in English. Extra pay to attract good teachers. Teachers employed by the State have to be accommodated within reasonable distance of the school. Teachers employed by the State have to be accommodated within reasonable distance of the school. Conditions of service, incentives for teachers in rural areas etc need to be reviewed in order to make teaching in rural and farm schools more attractive to educators.

School teachers' conditions of service, welfare and support services.

In terms of grading the farm schools and traditional authority areas school are the worst (sic). To deal with these challenges a Directorate of Rural Education has to be established at provincial level to interface with all other rural community structures for effective learner support services.

In terms of grading the farm schools and traditional authority areas school are the worst (sic). To deal with these challenges a Directorate of Rural Education has to be established at provincial level to interface with all other rural community structures for effective learner support services.

Farm schools based on education to provide support services. It will take a very serious campaign from very high up to make the point that we will take these issues seriously.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

strategies to ensure that all can access primary education. The unit could also convene a multi-sectoral forum, with farm owners, farmworkers, teachers and farm owners' representative bodies, non-governmental organizations and local government, to review the situation on farm schools and devise strategies for improvement. This unit should also maintain a database on farm schools.

Monitoring and evaluation of rural education

Matriculation results are all too often a proxy for quality, e.g., "...there has been a marked increase in the pass rates of grade 12 students (matriculants). District officials and school managers attribute this success directly to the impact of the project.

In other instances, indices of quality are derived from levels of resourcing: "The low quality of education is evident in the lack of physical resources in schools - 90% of Eastern Cape schools lack electricity and running water and many have no textbooks or supplementary materials." Development oriented NGOs are very aware of this, and their work towards common goals is essential. If school development is to be sustainable, it must be done in collaboration with other sectors.

Monitoring and evaluation of rural education

Monitoring and evaluation of rural education

is essential. This unit should also maintain a database on farm schools and disseminate successful strategies to other farm schools and local government. The unit could also convene a multi-sectoral forum, with farm owners, farmworkers, teachers and farm owners' representative bodies, non-governmental organizations and local government, to review the situation on farm schools and devise strategies for improvement. This unit should also maintain a database on farm schools.

"A New Vision for Rural Schooling" aims to ensure that all can access primary education. The unit could also convene a multi-sectoral forum, with farm owners, farmworkers, teachers and farm owners' representative bodies, non-governmental organizations and local government, to review the situation on farm schools and devise strategies for improvement. This unit should also maintain a database on farm schools.
This report has sought to capture and reflect the views of stakeholders on rural education. It has also attempted to analyse these views. It is hoped that these aims have been achieved in a way that is helpful to the mission of the MCRE.

References


Taylor, N. 2003. A critical friend to give practical support, monitor progress and evaluate whether outcomes were being achieved.

Reviews or evaluative accounts, if developed around a set of studies on a clearly articulated focus, pose an interesting, accountable, and effective method of evaluation.

We believe that, in South Africa, where self-monitoring and evaluation is conducted in the context of school improvement and school change, and the monitoring of accountability to funders. Reports appear to support accountability to funders rather than the development of ideas and theories.

We cannot even begin to learn about ways enhancing quality unless we have confidence in the validity of evaluative reports and reviews in the first place.

In short, much could be gained by more rigorous external monitoring and evaluation. The value of an evaluative account, a meta narrative developed around a set of studies on a clearly articulated focus, poses an interesting, accountable, and effective method of evaluation. We believe that, in South Africa, where self-monitoring and evaluation is conducted in the context of school improvement and school change, and the monitoring of accountability to funders. Reports appear to support accountability to funders rather than the development of ideas and theories.

A number of personal impressions are added to the Overview and Analysis that has been based on submissions and responses to the provincial questionnaire.

Firstly, the lack of personal involvement of the many creative initiatives taking place is that we learn so little from them. Reports are not based on the real experiences of teachers, or on the real learning that takes place. External views and perspectives are singularly lacking.

Some funded projects record having utilized the services of a `technical adviser/evaluator` who also served as a `critical friend` to give practical support, monitor progress and evaluate whether outcomes were being achieved.

A personal postscript arising from the review of submissions.

Learning at the level of disconnected case studies.

Conclusion

In short, much could be gained by more rigorous external monitoring and evaluation. The value of an evaluative account, a meta narrative developed around a set of studies on a clearly articulated focus, poses an interesting, accountable, and effective method of evaluation. We believe that, in South Africa, where self-monitoring and evaluation is conducted in the context of school improvement and school change, and the monitoring of accountability to funders. Reports appear to support accountability to funders rather than the development of ideas and theories.

A number of personal impressions are added to the Overview and Analysis that has been based on submissions and responses to the provincial questionnaire.

Firstly, the lack of personal involvement of the many creative initiatives taking place is that we learn so little from them. Reports are not based on the real experiences of teachers, or on the real learning that takes place. External views and perspectives are singularly lacking.

Some funded projects record having utilized the services of a `technical adviser/evaluator` who also served as a `critical friend` to give practical support, monitor progress and evaluate whether outcomes were being achieved.

A personal postscript arising from the review of submissions.
A New Vision for Rural Schooling

Secondly, there is the conundrum of respondents advocating community-based approaches to rural schooling, yet at the same time reporting the lack of community involvement in SGBs. How might communities be mobilised? From the accounts of respondents, one was struck by the potential of environmental education as an organizing concept around which to mobilise communities. According to a number of respondents, environmental concerns are central to the functioning of rural communities. Environmental education in rural schools can facilitate communication between people, households, and local schools.

From the accounts of respondents, environmental concerns are central to the functioning of rural communities. Environmental education in rural schools can facilitate communication between people, households, and local schools.

A personal judgement too is that the Eco-Schools programme demonstrates the potential of integrating environmental education across learning areas in ways that promote learner activity. This meets the underlying principles of C2005.

"Water, the seasons, weather, looks and vegetation, trees, water, community, and animals..." is the community in which we live, people, houses, in one educational project, teachers described environmental education as "Environment means everything around us. It can mean the local schools...

Attention to educational matters, either that provided by the community or that provided by educational institutions, may mean that educational matters which are often discussed in rural communities are not integrated into educational programmes. All too often, we look at rural schools as poor cousins, places where indigenous knowledge systems are underrepresented in the curriculum. How may community may many strengths. They may prefer to a powerful sense of their indigenous cultures, for security and for many social and cultural practices."

"...rural households are deeply dependent on natural resources (the environment) for sustaining their livelihoods, for food security and for many social and cultural practices."
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Submission received from</th>
<th>Individual or organizational base</th>
<th>Basis of submission, eg. Offer a service, experience, research, report</th>
<th>Apparent value position / nature of activity</th>
<th>Aspect of MCREATOR addressed</th>
<th>Understanding of 'rural'</th>
<th>Comment / recommendations (explicit or implicit) aimed at:</th>
<th>Involved in partnerships; Stress on community or integrated approach</th>
<th>Relationship to Learning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Anonymous *</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2 ABA IMFUNDO            | Organization (Service provider: Actor in the field) | 1 Provide research on ICT
2 Proposal to establish ICT infrastructure in schools | Equity – widen access to ICT | Recommend and offer ICT services on franchise / business principles | 1 Research optimism re project;
2 Implicit: rural synonymous with deprived Deficit model | Narrowing the digital divide by establishing infrastructure to support learning | Partnership with higher ed.; Community involvement in use of facilities | Indirect: concerned with enabling conditions |
<p>| 3 Mr S M Bhengu         | Individual                          | Experience of conditions: nepotism / corruption in rural schools | Concern for quality | Highlights Conditions | Implicit: rural synonymous with corruption/ absence of accountability Deficit | Cleaning up corrupt practices |                                           | Indirect: concerned with enabling conditions |
| 4 Breede River Municipality | Non-educational Organization (Section 1 company formed) | Describe experience of network / partnerships to integrate rural development | Developmement and social upliftment | Highlights a local strategy | Implicit, Deficit model | Implicit – illustrates promise of partnerships/ networks | Partnership with employers | Direct: Training Committees &amp; providing ABET |
| 5 Berg River Municipality | Organization (Non-educational)     | Acknowledge Initiative only |                                              |                               |                        |                                                  |                                               |                           |
| 6 Catalyst Youth Development Society | Organization (non profit0) | Experience : of inequalities and problems. Recommend extra-curricular activities &amp; provision of | Quality of life for youth (beyond the school day) | Highlights conditions and local strategy | Defines rurality Deficit | Provision of Resources (closing the gap with the 'haves'); Advocates sport/ extra curricular activities; | Integrated approach – align government departments | Indirect – focus is extra curricular |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Education Policy Consortium **</th>
<th>Organization – (NGO + university)</th>
<th>Resources</th>
<th>Equity, the Constituion; Quality, the curriculum</th>
<th>Recommend nity Education Forum</th>
<th>Conceptually implicit. Build on community strengths.</th>
<th>Research into ways of developing community-curriculum link</th>
<th>Partnership Community Integrated approach</th>
<th>Direct – parents will assist with curriculum</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Deloitte &amp; New Horizons *</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>National School Nutrition Programme</td>
<td>Department of Education</td>
<td>Report on School Nutrition Programme</td>
<td>Bureaucratic accountability</td>
<td>Report on policy and monitoring of nutrition scheme</td>
<td>Key in rural areas, but not rural specific</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>Indirect: aimed at creating enabling conditions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Educational Psychology, Stellenbosch University</td>
<td>University Faculty</td>
<td>Research with implications for rural education</td>
<td>Rights of children, and educators</td>
<td>Recommend on basis of research</td>
<td>Not addressed.</td>
<td>National action plan based on wisdom of communities; reading programmes</td>
<td>Community assets or wisdom as a basis</td>
<td>Indirect: aimed at creating enabling conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Teacher Education Dept, Eastern Michigan University *</td>
<td>University Faculty</td>
<td>Offer a service-curriculum, trainers, publications</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>EduAction *</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Acknowledge invitation – no comment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Tom Noot - Individual School Principal</td>
<td>Professional experience</td>
<td>School functionality, quality, outcomes</td>
<td>Recommendations linked to practices</td>
<td>Implicit and deficit – earmarked by marginalisation</td>
<td>Continuity in schooling: dept. support; teacher provision; hostels professionalism</td>
<td>No comment or recommendation</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>Indirect Enabling functional system</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Faculty of Education and Nursing RAU</td>
<td>University Faculty</td>
<td>research database (students); research, teacher narratives</td>
<td>Belief in value of research</td>
<td>Data base is offered. It's up to others to interpret, decide what to do. Conditions may be inferred</td>
<td>No comment or recommendation</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>Not articulated</td>
<td>Not articulated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Health Sciences, Wits</td>
<td>University Faculty</td>
<td>Experience of school conditions</td>
<td>Hygiene and welfare of rural</td>
<td>Highlights conditions</td>
<td>Implicit – improve basic facilities</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>Indirect, enabling</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Type</td>
<td>From field visits</td>
<td>People</td>
<td>Provision Services</td>
<td>Not Applicable</td>
<td>Not Systemic Through Own Programme</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Fukula MHS</td>
<td>Organization (a CC)</td>
<td>Offer services in measuring quality and advising schools</td>
<td>School improvement along business lines</td>
<td>No necessary link with rural</td>
<td>Provision of services</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>Not systemic through own programme</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Helene Perold</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Reports on 2 funded projects to improve governance, management and professional competence</td>
<td>Reflections on commissioned work</td>
<td>It's up to others to interpret reports: conditions and recommendations may be inferred</td>
<td>Implicit projects operated in rural contexts</td>
<td>Deficit</td>
<td>Need for partnerships and building dynamic communities implied</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and Associates</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Indirect, enabling</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Human Rights</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Research into farm schools</td>
<td>Human rights concern for access to schools</td>
<td>Highlights conditions, makes recommendations</td>
<td>Deficit</td>
<td>Community forum for management; need legal framework for farm schools</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Watch</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Indirect, enabling</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Wonga Tabata</td>
<td>Individual, School Principal</td>
<td>Experience as an educator and Principal</td>
<td>Rural schools still suffer from under-resourcing</td>
<td>Highlights conditions, makes recommendations</td>
<td>Implicit Deficit</td>
<td>Provide facilities &amp; resources; communal infrastructure; stem migration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Indirect, enabling</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Kayz Naidoo</td>
<td>Individual, research student</td>
<td>Reference for MBA research</td>
<td>Offer: open computer/ business college</td>
<td>Highlights conditions, makes recommendations</td>
<td>Implicit Deficit</td>
<td>Provide facilities &amp; resources, including water</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Patuleni</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Indirect, enabling</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Zandle</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Indirect, enabling</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Grace Radingwana</td>
<td>Individual</td>
<td>Personal Experience</td>
<td>Highlights conditions, makes recommendations</td>
<td>Implicit Deficit</td>
<td>Provide computers and teachers for music &amp; sport</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>ZT Tshangase</td>
<td>Individual</td>
<td>Personal Experience</td>
<td>Conditions, Recommendations</td>
<td>Implicit Deficit</td>
<td>Provide computers and teachers for music &amp; sport</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Indirect, enabling</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Role</td>
<td>Mode</td>
<td>Strategy</td>
<td>Action</td>
<td>Impact</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NE Rowles</td>
<td>Individual</td>
<td>Offer a book or literature on gardening</td>
<td>Recommendation on basis of single good experience; Focus too on quality and outcomes</td>
<td>Rural, synonymous with deprived</td>
<td>Implicit deficit; Include gardening in curriculum timetable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loyiso Jita</td>
<td>Joint Centre for Science, Mathematics &amp; Technology Education University of Pretoria Kearsney College</td>
<td>Research experience in rural schools</td>
<td>Recommendation</td>
<td>Rural, synonymous with deprived</td>
<td>Implicit deficit; include gardening in curriculum timetable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr S Zukula</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Offers experience</td>
<td>Recommendation</td>
<td>Rural, synonymous with deprived</td>
<td>Implicit deficit; Include gardening in curriculum timetable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Link Community Development</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Offer experience; offer a service</td>
<td>Recommendation</td>
<td>Rural, synonymous with deprived</td>
<td>Implicit deficit; Include gardening in curriculum timetable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maths Centre, SA</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Report on programme and activities</td>
<td>Recommend “whole district development” model</td>
<td>Assumes there is common understanding</td>
<td>Implicit deficit; Include gardening in curriculum timetable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P Essa &amp; W Visser</td>
<td>Individuals (from Giyani Education Multi-purpose Centre DoE)</td>
<td>Offer research and experience</td>
<td>Concern for improvement and use of available resources</td>
<td>Leadership; mentoring; measuring performance; local accountability; import UK teachers</td>
<td>Implicit deficit; Include gardening in curriculum timetable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media in Education Trust</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>(Service provider: actor in the field)</td>
<td>1 Annual Report &amp; project account. 2 Proposal replicating Multi-media Rural Network. 3 Guides</td>
<td>Highlight conditions; discuss quality; offer recommendations</td>
<td>Implicit deficit; Include gardening in curriculum timetable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>NAPTOSA</td>
<td>Teacher union</td>
<td>Experience of conditions; offer recommendations</td>
<td>Equity and quality</td>
<td>Highlight conditions; make recommendations</td>
<td>Grapple with a definition or delimit</td>
<td>Rural is &quot;special&quot; case; Incentives for teachers; Adapted form of governance; Dept support; Professional development; Access: More combined schools</td>
<td>Need for strong community forums</td>
<td>Focus on enabling conditions; assumed causal relationship between inputs and quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>National Youth Commission</td>
<td>Office of the President</td>
<td>Policy for youth development; offer a meeting &amp; services</td>
<td>Youth development (generic)</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
<td>Recommend integrated approach</td>
<td>Not applicable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Ndima Community Services * Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University</td>
<td>Organization University</td>
<td>Invitation acknowledged</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Recognition of indigenous knowledge systems</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Peninsula Technikon</td>
<td>Technikon</td>
<td>Invitation acknowledged</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Research Unit, Tshwane University of Technology</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>Offer 5 research papers on management</td>
<td>Illuminate issues relevant to better management</td>
<td>Not addressed</td>
<td>Notes differences in approach between urban and rural principals</td>
<td>Not stated</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Dr Marc Schafer</td>
<td>Mathematics Education, Rhodes University</td>
<td>Personal research &amp; experience</td>
<td>Rural education enthusiast</td>
<td>Not addressed</td>
<td></td>
<td>Not stated</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Prof Heila Lotz-Sisitka</td>
<td>Environmental Education Unit, Rhodes</td>
<td>Offers research experience and insights</td>
<td>Relationship between people, environment &amp; learning</td>
<td>Programme evaluation (outcome), sample of materials; quality; outcomes; offers recommendations</td>
<td>Defined w.r.t. dependency on natural resources</td>
<td>Integrated approach; cluster-based INSET</td>
<td>Exemplifies and argues for partnership model enabling an integrated approach</td>
<td>Direct: Addresses curriculum, teaching and learning. Learning materials: “hands on”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>D Pullican, St Mary's DSG Outreach Education Trust</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Experience and offer service</td>
<td>School ‘upgrade’ Highlights conditions. Practical ‘outreach’ to a farm school</td>
<td>Not addressed</td>
<td>Report implies benefit of ‘adopting’ farm schools</td>
<td>One to one relationship; has a community dimension</td>
<td>Enabling; First establish functional environment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>Sue Beard, Research Librarian : Education Foundation Trust</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Offer access to publications in Resource Centre</td>
<td>Report on (generic) activities of Drama Dept</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>Prof SKG Lenyai</td>
<td>Tshwane University of Technology</td>
<td>Report on (generic) activities of Drama Dept</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>Dr Heather Jacklin *</td>
<td>School of Education, University of Cape Town</td>
<td>Report on (generic) activities of Drama Dept</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>Prof E Pretorius</td>
<td>Humanities, University of Pretoria</td>
<td>Report on (generic) activities of Drama Dept</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>Dr BJ Balfour &amp; Prof C Mitchell</td>
<td>Faulty of Education, U of KwaZulu-Natal</td>
<td>Propose Institute for Teacher Development for Rural Education at UKZN</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>Prof D Coetzee *</td>
<td>Philosophy and Policy Studies, University of Pretoria</td>
<td>Propose Institute for Teacher Development for Rural Education at UKZN</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>Office of Vice Chancellor *</td>
<td>University of Port Elizabeth</td>
<td>Acknowledge invitation</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>Prof IJ Manoe &amp; JM Motjoe</td>
<td>Education Faculty, University of Pretoria</td>
<td>Propose Institute for Teacher Development for Rural Education at UKZN</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td>No implications can be inferred</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>Prof ME Muller</td>
<td>Humanities, University of Pretoria</td>
<td>Provides overview of honours thesis</td>
<td>Unusually here, focus is on gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A New Vision for Rural Schooling
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Field of Study</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Findings</th>
<th>Implications</th>
<th>Context</th>
<th>Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>Prof P Higgs</td>
<td>Educational Studies, UNISA</td>
<td>Details of relevant teaching 1 NPDE 2 Outreach Programme</td>
<td>For inference - recommendations</td>
<td>Unclear</td>
<td>Communities central organizing category</td>
<td>Indirect, through teacher qualifications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>Prof SD Edwards</td>
<td>Psychology, UNIZUL</td>
<td>Research papers on community psychology, health, indigenous healing</td>
<td>Respect for community understanding</td>
<td>Implied: respect for traditional cultural understandings</td>
<td>Not aimed at schooling per se</td>
<td>Enabling conditions; curriculum not addressed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>SA Women’s Agricultural Union</td>
<td>Teacher Union</td>
<td>Professional experience of conditions</td>
<td>Address disparity between urban/rural schools</td>
<td>Implicit, linked with ‘the poor’; Deficit</td>
<td>Need for integrated approach</td>
<td>Enabling conditions; curriculum not addressed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Personal experience</td>
<td>Children should be taught life skills, morality, discipline</td>
<td>Implicit; Deficit</td>
<td>Lack resources, accountability, discipline and responsibility</td>
<td>Enabling conditions; curriculum not addressed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>Institute for Mathematics and Science Teaching, Stellenbosch University</td>
<td>University</td>
<td>Organizational experience</td>
<td>Safety of children and impact of HIV AIDS</td>
<td>Implicit; Deficit</td>
<td>Flexible modalities for vulnerable children; learner safety (girls esp.); multi-grade proficiency</td>
<td>Enabling conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>Dr Liesel Ebersohn, Educational Psychology</td>
<td>University of Pretoria</td>
<td>Research experience from the field</td>
<td>INSET: Maths and Science teachers; rural focus</td>
<td>Implicit; Deficit</td>
<td>Classroom-based teacher support: workshops, materials, modeling</td>
<td>Directly involved with teaching &amp; curriculum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>KZN DoE Policy on Education</td>
<td>Department</td>
<td>Policy regarding decentralised centers to support learning</td>
<td>Concern for vulnerable children</td>
<td>Implicit; Positive</td>
<td>Asset-based approaches – based on local potential</td>
<td>Enabling conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Derived from KZN Master Strategic Plan</td>
<td>Articulates policy</td>
<td>Community based interventions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centre ***</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Project Description</td>
<td>Aim of Research</td>
<td>Recommendation Type</td>
<td>Department Type</td>
<td>Funding Type</td>
<td>Date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57 CSIR ***</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Report on Thaba Matoke pilot to redesign school buildings</td>
<td>Transform school buildings into community centres</td>
<td>Implicit recommendation</td>
<td>Implicit Deficit</td>
<td>Buildings as a contribution to schools as centers of community life</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58 Eastern Cape Department of Education ***</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Funding proposal with project experience</td>
<td>Meet project aim of sustainability</td>
<td>For inference, recommendation</td>
<td>Deficit</td>
<td>Extension of project aimed at better district support, governance and management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59 Eastern Cape Provincial Department of Education</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Research into legal position of farm schools</td>
<td>Human rights</td>
<td>Conditions and recommendations</td>
<td></td>
<td>Legal status of farm schools leaves them vulnerable</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60 Eastern Cape Provincial Department of Education</td>
<td>Department</td>
<td>Response to Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61 Mpondoland Provincial Department of Education</td>
<td>Department</td>
<td>Response to Questionnaire</td>
<td>Bureaucratic responsibility</td>
<td>Focus on conditions and policy statements</td>
<td>Deficit</td>
<td>Develop models of provision; amalgamate schools; transport; hostels</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62 North West Provincial Department of Education</td>
<td>Department</td>
<td>Response to Questionnaire</td>
<td>Bureaucratic responsibility</td>
<td>Focus on conditions and policy statements</td>
<td>Deficit</td>
<td>In effect: Improve systems, bring into line with norms for other schools</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63 Free State Provincial Department of Education</td>
<td>Department</td>
<td>Description of mega-school project</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64 Western Cape Provincial Department of Education</td>
<td>Department</td>
<td>Varied policy documents and statistics eg. on farm schools, learner transport, multi-grade</td>
<td>Bureaucratic responsibility</td>
<td>Highlight conditions and for inference, strategies</td>
<td>Has a specific focus, Positive</td>
<td>Improving service delivery</td>
<td>Dept is in partnerships with NGOs, government depts. etc</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Listed on catalogue, not received from Department
** Duplicated on catalogue
*** Not listed on catalogue
 ▶ Faxed, received too late for inclusion in analysis